

**CITY OF ST. LOUIS
CULTURAL RESOURCES OFFICE
PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES
JULY 24, 2017**

Board Members Present

Richard Callow – Chairman
Anthony Robinson
David Richardson
Mike Killeen
Melanie Fathman
David Visintainer

Cultural Resources Office Staff Present

Dan Krasnoff, Director
Jan Cameron, Preservation Administrator
Andrea Gagen, Preservation Planner
Bob Bettis, Preservation Planner
Adona Buford, Administrative Assistant

Legal Counsel

Barbara Birkicht

PRELIMINARY REVIEWS

A. 2017.1011 4230 BOTANICAL AVENUE SHAW HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner: Garcia Development Holdings LLC

Applicant: Anthony Duncan Architect, AIA

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Preliminary review to construct a single-family house.

PROCEEDINGS: On July 24, 2017, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider a Preliminary Application for the construction of single family house on a vacant parcel at 4230 Botanical, located in the Shaw Certified Local Historic District.

Board members Richard Callow, Melanie Fathman, David Visintainer, Mike Killeen, Anthony Robinson, and David Richardson were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Bob Bettis of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #59400, which sets forth the standards for residential new construction in the Shaw Certified Local Historic District. He testified that the project was in compliance with the Standards and that the neighborhood association was in support of the project.

Tony Duncan, project architect, was present but did not testify.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- The proposed site for construction, 4230 Botanical Ave, is located in the Shaw Local Historic District;
- The proposed massing, scale, and proportions of the building is appropriate for its site and compatible with adjacent buildings. The design is compatible as a contemporary design within the context of the block and district.

BOARD ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant preliminary approval to the proposed new construction with the stipulation that details and specifications are submitted to the Cultural Resources Office for review and that final plans and exterior materials are approved by the Cultural Resources Office. The motion was made by Commissioner David Visintainer and seconded by Commissioner Anthony Robinson. The motion passed unanimously.

B. 2017.1084 1001-03 RUSSELL BLVD. SOULARD HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner: 1001 Russell, LLC

Applicant: Ebersoldt & Associates – Dustin Bopp AIA

RESIDENTIAL PLAN:

Preliminary review to construct three-story mixed use building.

PROCEEDINGS:

On July 24, 2017, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider a preliminary review application to construct a 4-story mixed-use building at 1001-03 Russell Boulevard, located in the Soulard Neighborhood Local Historic District. The application was submitted by the project developer.

Board members Richard Callow (Chair); Michael Killeen; David Visintainer; David Richardson; Melanie Fathman; and Anthony Robinson were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Jan Cameron of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #57978, which sets forth the standards for demolition and new construction in the Soulard Historic District. She indicated that the project was generally in compliance with the historic district standards for new construction; with the exception of the lap siding that was

proposed for portions of the east and west secondary elevations. As these facades were visible from the street, she suggested that brick be required to return the length of both facades.

Ms. Cameron submitted a letter from Alderman Coatar that stated his support for the project, and a copy of an email from Kathy Beyer, a Soulard resident also in support of the project but requesting additional landscaping.

Kathy Barkey, Soulard resident, stated her general support for the project, but questioned the ceiling heights and proportions of the balcony openings. She supported the staff recommendation for additional brick.

Dustin Bopp of Ebersoldt & Associates, the project architect, testified in support of the project and explained the development of the design. He stated that the ceiling heights on all floors would be nine feet and that he would ask the developers regarding additional brick.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- The proposed new construction is a three-story mixed-use building. The building responds to the intent of the New Construction section of the Soulard Historic District Standards, while not meeting every standard;
- The building has a somewhat larger mass than adjacent properties, but approximates them in height. Vertical divisions added to the front façade would mitigate the disproportionate length of the building;
- The street façade materials will brick, and meet the standards for façade materials. The lap siding proposed for the side elevations does not meet the standards and will be exposed to some view from the street.

A review of the Soulard Historic District New Construction Standards indicates that the proposed building meets the requirement for architectural compatibility with the existing block face as to building setback, scale, articulation, overall architectural character and exterior materials, with the exception of lap siding proposed side facades. The street façade materials will brick, and meet the standards for façade materials. The lap siding proposed for the majority of the west elevation and the rear does not meet the standards.

BOARD ACTION: It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant preliminary approval to the proposal, with the condition that brick on the side elevations extends to the rear of each façade; and that exterior details and materials be reviewed and approved by the Cultural Resources Office. The motion was made by Board Commissioner Anthony Robinson and seconded by Commissioner Melanie Fathman. The motion passed unanimously.

C. 2017.1089 5621 WATERMAN BLVD. CENTRAL WEST END HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner: Edgewater Real Estate Company

Applicant: Killeen Studio Architects – Mike Killeen

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Preliminary review to construct a four-story apartment building with ground level parking.

PROCEEDINGS: On July 24, 2017, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider a preliminary review application to construct a 4-story residential building with ground floor parking at 5612 Waterman Boulevard, located in the Central West End Certified Local Historic District. The application was submitted by the project architect.

Board members Richard Callow (Chair); David Visintainer, David Richardson, Melanie Fathman and Anthony Robinson were present for the testimony for this agenda item. Michael Killeen recused himself.

Jan Cameron of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #69423, which sets forth the standards for demolition and new construction in the Central West End Historic District. She indicated that the project was generally in compliance with the historic district standards for new construction, with the exception of a proposed garage door on the west side facing Clara Avenue. She explained that this was necessary as the parcel had no access to an alley.

Ms. Cameron stated that although the Development Committee of the Central West End Association had received plans of the project for review, to date the Cultural Resources Office had not

heard from them, nor had the Alderman for the 28th Ward commented upon the project.

E. J. Sansone of Edgewater Real Estate Company, the project developer, testified in support of the project.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- 5612 Waterman Boulevard is located in the Central West End Local Historic District;
- The design generally complies with the requirement of the Central West End Standards for New Construction that new buildings replicate the siting, massing, scale, street rhythm and exterior materials of adjacent buildings; and
- The proposal conforms to most of the New Construction Standards except for curb-cuts and driveways; it is unable to comply with this requirement as there is no alley access.

BOARD ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant preliminary approval of the proposed construction, with the condition that exterior details and materials are reviewed and approved by the Cultural Resources Office staff. The motion was made by Commissioner Melanie Fathman and seconded by Commissioner David Visintainer. The motion passed with five members voting unanimously.

APPEALS OF DENIALS

D. 2017.0561 4325, 4327, 4329 SWAN FOREST PARK SE NATIONAL REGISTER DISTRICT & PRESERVATION REVIEW DIST.

Owner: 4329 Swan LLC – Guy Slay

Applicant: Bellon Salvage and Rehabbing – Don Bellon

DEMOLITION PLAN:

Appeal of a demolition permit application to demolish three one-story single family houses.

PROCEEDINGS:

On July 24, 2017, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider a Preliminary Review for the demolition of three single-family frame residential buildings at 4325, 4327, and 4329 Swan Avenue in the Forest Park Southeast National Register Historic District; they will be replaced by four attached townhouses. The buildings

proposed for demolition are contributing resources to the Historic District.

The developer for the project, Mangrove Inc., submitted the item for review. Board members Richard Callow (Chair), David Visintainer, Melanie Fathman, Mike Killeen, Anthony Robinson and David Richardson were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Bob Bettis, staff for the Cultural Resources Office submitted Ordinance 64689 and Ordinance 64832, into the record. In addition, letters from 17th Ward Alderman Joe Roddy, Park Central Development, Washington University and members of the public in support of the project were entered into the record. Mr. Bettis briefly highlighted the staff recommendation to uphold the Director's denial of the demolitions.

Mr. Bettis discussed the criteria for review in the ordinance. The buildings at 4325, 4327, and 4329 Swan Avenue are Merit structures. The structures are "Sound" under the definition of the ordinance. The conditions in the area include buildings that are occupied and some that are vacant.

Chris Colizza, representing Mangrove, Inc., spoke in favor of the project. He outlined the scope of work for the project and detailed the condition and history of each of the buildings proposed for demolition. He also introduced into the record a letter of support from the homeowner directly adjacent to the proposed demolitions.

Board Member David Richardson asked to clarify outside funding sources and construction time frames. Mr. Colizza explained that Mangrove Inc. is applying for tax credits to help fund the project and the start of the project is contingent on the awarding of those credits.

Jeff McGee, The architect, spoke in favor of the project.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- 4325, 4327, and 4329 Swan Avenue are located within a Preservation Review District and contributing resources to a National Register Historic District;
- The buildings are "Sound";
- The buildings are Merit" structures;

- The proposed new construction is architecturally compatible with the houses on the block. However, the scale of the building is larger than the surrounding historic context on the block.

BOARD ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to overturn the staff denial of the demolition permit application of the three structures subject to a subject to review of the design from the Cultural Resources Office, a building permit being approved and ready for pick up, the project be funded and bank financing is in place.

The motion was made by Commissioner Anthony Robinson and seconded by Commissioner Melanie Fathman. The motion passed unanimously.

E. 2017.0669 5857-65 DR. ML KING DR. WELLSTON LOOP COMMERCIAL & NATIONAL REGISTER DISTRICT

Owner: Nora J. and Brenda Ollie

Applicant: Cheyenne Contracting – Charles Hemphill

DEMOLITION PLAN:

Appeal of a demolition permit application to demolish a two-story brick commercial building.

PROCEEDINGS:

On July 24, 2017, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider an appeal of the Director’s denial to demolish a commercial building at 5857-5865 Dr. Martin Luther King Drive, in the Wellston Loop National Register Historic District. The building proposed for demolition is a contributing building to the Historic District. One of the property owners, Brenda Ollie, submitted the appeal,

Board members Richard Callow (Chair), David Visintainer, Melanie Fathman, Mike Killeen, Anthony Robinson and David Richardson were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Bob Bettis of the Cultural Resources Office submitted Ordinance 64689 and Ordinance 64832, and his presentation into the record. Mr. Betts briefly highlighted the staff recommendation that the Preservation Board uphold the Director’s denial of the demolition

of 5857-5865 Dr. Martin Luther King Drive. He stated that Alderman Boyd had verbally given his support for the staff recommendation to uphold the denial.

Mr. Bettis discussed the criteria for review in the ordinance. The building at 5857-5865 Dr. Martine Luther King Drive is a Merit structure. The structure is "sound" under the definition of the ordinance. The conditions in the area include buildings that are occupied and some that are vacant. The loss of the building would create a large empty space along Dr. Martin Luther King Drive. It was noted that there was a recent City and Neighborhood initiative to develop a plan for the future of the Wellston Loop area. Mr. Bettis also noted that Alderman Jeffrey Boyd gave verbal support to the Staff recommendation.

Brenda Ollie, the owner, spoke in favor of the demolition. She stated that the building needed to be demolished due to its deteriorating condition, neighborhood safety, and a lack of personal funds to rehab the building. The owner stated she inherited the property over twenty years ago and the building was partially occupied up until about a decade ago. She also stated that trash dumping in the rear of the property has been an ongoing issue and feels that securing the property will not solve the issue. The owner did not provide any evidence of financial hardship, structural instability as documented by a licensed engineer or actual costs for rehabilitation. She stated that she spoke with a developer/rehabber who told her it would take up to \$300,000 to get the building back in livable condition. She did state that a demolition contractor was willing to demolish the building free of charge. The owner said that she has attempted to sell the building but did not receive what she felt was a fair offer. The owner has stated that there is no plan for new construction on the site following the demolition and that it would be a vacant lot with a fence.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- 5857-65 Dr. Martin Luther King Drive is within a Preservation Review District and National Register Historic District.
- The building is "Sound."
- The building is a "Merit" structure.
- There is no proposed new construction for the parcel.
- Dr. Martin Luther King Drive was the focus of a strategic planning report in September of 2016. The property at 5857

Dr. Martin Luther King Drive was identified as an important resource worthy of preservation and future reuse.

BOARD ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to uphold the Directors denial of the demolition permit application of 5857-5865 Dr. Martin Luther King Drive.

The motion was made by Commissioner Melanie Fathman made the motion. Mr. David Visintainer seconded the motion. Commissioner David Richardson opposed the motion. The motion carried four to one.

F. 2017.0694 925 ANN AVENUE SOULARD HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner: Randall Brown and John Martinelli

Applicant: Luxe Painting – Dan Stuart

RESIDENTIAL PLAN:

Appeal of a building permit application to construct a dormer at the front facade of alley building.

PROCEEDINGS:

On July 24, 2016, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider an appeal of the Director's Denial of a building permit to install a dormer on an alley building at 925 Ann Avenue, in the Soulard Neighborhood Local Historic District. The owner submitted the appeal.

Board members Richard Callow, Mike Killeen, Anthony Robinson, Melanie Fathman, David Richardson and David Visintainer were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Andrea Gagen of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #62382, which sets forth the standards for dormers in the Soulard Local Historic District.

Ms. Gagen entered into the record certified copies of Ordinances #64689, as amended by #64925, and #62382; the Board agenda and the PowerPoint presentation for 925 Ann Avenue.

Randy Brown, the owner, spoke on his own behalf.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- 925 Ann Avenue is located in the Soulard Neighborhood Local Historic District;

District, Ordinance #64689 specifically states that in that case, the proposed project should be reviewed in light of the intent of the Ordinance and the Landmark District. Ms. Cameron stated that the installation of the overhead doors had the appearance of garage doors and would be deleterious to the Landmark and District, as the alteration would obscure the first story arcading and would be an inappropriate contemporary addition to the Landmark building. She also said that the Cultural Resources Office staff was concerned about the precedent approval of the doors would create.

Ms. Cameron submitted a letter from 7th Ward Alderman Coatar that stated his support for the project, and a letter from the Downtown Neighborhood Association, also in support of the project.

Steven Savage, of the Wheelhouse restaurant, the tenant, submitted a letter from the building owner, Ballpark Lofts Condominium III, Jerry Altman, in support of the project. He presented a PowerPoint showing the existing outdoor space and canopy, and photos of a temporary plastic enclosure that has previously been used. He stated also that the ends of the canopy would be closed with fixed glass panels or additional overhead doors if possible.

William Elliott, of Kenrick Design, the architect for the project, spoke in support and stated that the doors would be closed only in three winter months of the year, and could be a compatible color with the existing canopy, and that it would represent a great improvement over the temporary enclosure.

Ms. Cameron, on redirect, requested that should the Preservation Board consider granting an exception to the proposal, that the Board place conditions on the installation: that the door mechanism be hidden; that the bottom panels of the doors be glazed, not solid; and that the doors be closed only the three winter months of the year.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- The installation of overhead metal glass doors to the existing canopy is not appropriate in design, material and detailing to the historic character of the landmark building and district.

- The east façade where the canopy is located faces 10th Street. Although 10th is currently not a through-street, the canopy and doors will be a prominently feature on Spruce.
- The doors will be used only three months of the year, in inclement winter weather; otherwise the canopy will remain open.
- The colors of the doors will be matched to the canopy and the owner has agreed to replace the solid panels at the bottom of each door with glazing.

BOARD ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to overturn the Director's denial of the installation of overhead doors with the following conditions: (1) that the doors will be closed only three months of the year; (2) that the overhead mechanisms will not be visible; (3) that the doors will have no dark panels; and (4) that the north and south ends of the canopy be enclosed with fixed glass not overhead doors. The motion was made by Commissioner Melanie Fathman and seconded by Commissioner Anthony Robinson. Mr. Killeen opposed the motion. The motion passed four to one.

H. 2017.0964 2660 NEBRASKA AVENUE FOX PARK HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner/Applicant: Midwest Damage Assessment Inc. – Patrick Khalatians

**RESIDENTIAL PLAN:
PROCEEDINGS:**

Appeal of a building permit application to replace five windows. On July 24, 2016, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider an appeal of the Director's Denial of a building permit to replace five windows on a Public Facade at 2660 Nebraska Avenue, in the Fox Park Local Historic District. The owner submitted the appeal.

Board members Richard Callow, Tiffany Hamilton, Mike Killeen, David Richardson, Anthony Robinson, Melanie Fathman and David Visintainer were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Andrea Gagen of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #66098, which sets forth the standards for windows in the Souldard Neighborhood Local Historic District.

Ms. Gagen entered into the record certified copies of Ordinances #64689, as amended by #64925, and #66098; the Board agenda

and the PowerPoint presentation for 2660 Nebraska.

Patrick Khalatians, the owner's representative, spoke in support of the project.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- 2660 Nebraska is located in the Fox Park Local Historic District;
- The applicant installed new windows and transoms without a permit;
- The owner installed Rivertown Double-Hung windows which are approved for use in local historic districts;
- The transoms above the windows were previously art glass windows, which have been removed and replaced with clear glass. Only two of the removed art glass transoms are intact;
- The mullions on both sets of paired windows were decorative and there was additional trim on the transom bars;
- The owner has agreed to reinstall or replicate the original window trim & mullions.

BOARD ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to overturn the Director's denial of the building permit with the stipulation that the original trim work be replaced and/or replicated. The motion was made by Commissioner David Richardson and seconded by Commissioner Visintainer. Commissioners Melanie Fathman and Anthony Robinson opposed the motion. The motion passed with a vote of 3-2.

Chairman Richard Callow moved to adjourn the meeting, hearing no objection, the meeting was adjourned.