

**CITY OF ST. LOUIS  
CULTURAL RESOURCES OFFICE  
PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES  
JULY 25, 2016**

Board Members Present

Richard Callow – Chairman

Dave Visintainer

Melanie Fathman

Anthony Robinson

Dave Richardson

Legal Counsel

Barbara Birkicht

Cultural Resources Office Staff Present

Dan Krasnoff, Director

Jan Cameron, Preservation Administrator

Andrea Gagen, Preservation Planner

Adona Buford, Administrative Assistant

**PRELIMINARY REVIEWS**

**A. 1302-24 RUSSELL BOULEVARD – DEFERRED**

---

**B. 2016.1099 4161 CASTLEMAN AVENUE SHAW HISTORIC DISTRICT**

---

Owner/Applicant: Robert Geyer

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Preliminary review of a covered porch addition and entry enclosure.

PROCEEDINGS: On July 25, 2016, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider a preliminary review application to construct a one-story porch and enclose an existing recessed entry at 4161 Castleman Avenue, in the Shaw Neighborhood Certified Local Historic District. The application was submitted by the property owner. Board members Richard Callow (Chair), David Visintainer and Melanie Fathman were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Jan Cameron of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #59400, which sets forth the standards for rehabilitation in the Shaw Neighborhood Historic District.

Robert Geyer, the owner of the property, testified that except for this building and the adjacent 2-family, every house on the block had front porches. He would like to have a front porch to sit out on and meet his neighbors. He agreed that if the porch would be approved, he would not pursue enclosure of the existing recessed entry.

**FINDINGS OF FACTS:**

The Preservation Board found that:

- 4161 Castleman Avenue is located in the Shaw Neighborhood Certified Local Historic District;
- the Historic District Standards require that historic detail be left in its original form and the alterations proposed for the front entry do not comply with this requirement;
- the proposed porch is of appropriate design and materials; and
- almost every house on both sides of the block has a single-story porch, similar to that proposed.

**BOARD DECISION:**

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant preliminary approval of the new porch as proposed, but withheld approval of the entry enclosure. The motion was made by Board Member Dave Visintainer and seconded by Ms. Fathman. The motion passed unanimously.

**C.      2016.1111      5780 MCPHERSON AVENUE      SKINKER-DeBALIVIERE HISTORIC DIST**

---

Owner/Applicant: Jennie Johnson

**RESIDENTIAL PLAN:**

Preliminary review to construct a two-story single family house.

**PROCEEDINGS:**

On July 25, 2016, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider a preliminary review application to construct a two-story single-family house at 5780 McPherson Avenue, in the Skinker-DeBaliviere Certified Local Historic District. The application was submitted by the property owner.

Board members Richard Callow (Chair), David Visintainer and Melanie Fathman were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Jan Cameron of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #57688, which sets forth the standards for new construction in the Skinker-DeBaliviere Historic District. She indicated that the project was generally in compliance with the Standards, but that exterior materials and details had not yet been finalized.

Jennie Johnson, the owner and developer of the property, was present at the meeting but did not testify.

**FINDINGS OF FACTS:**

The Preservation Board found that:

- 5780 McPherson Avenue is located in the Skinker-DeBaliviere Certified Local Historic District;
- the applicant intends to construct a two-story, single-family house that generally complies with the historic district standards for new construction;
- exterior design details and materials for the project have not yet been finalized.

**BOARD DECISION:**

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant preliminary approval to the proposal, with the condition that final design details and materials be reviewed and approved by the Cultural Resources Office. The motion was made by Board Member Melanie Fathman and seconded by Board Mr. Visintainer. The motion passed unanimously.

**D. 2301 SOUTH KINGSHIGHWAY BLVD. – DEFERRED**

---

**E. 2016.1144 3310 LEMP AVENUE BENTON PARK HISTORIC DISTRICT**

---

Owner/Applicant: Rubicon Corporation

**RESIDENTIAL PLAN:**

Preliminary review to construct a single family dwelling.

**PROCEEDINGS:**

On July 25, 2016, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider a preliminary review application to construct two residential buildings and to rehabilitate and construct an addition to an

existing single-story house at 3310-3320 Lemp Avenue, located in the Benton Park Local Historic District. The application was submitted by the project developer.

Board members Richard Callow (Chair), David Visintainer and Melanie Fathman were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Jan Cameron of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #67175, which sets forth the standards for new construction in the Benton Park Historic District. She indicated that the project was generally in compliance with the historic district standards for new construction, and was also receiving support through the Community Development Administration.

Curtiss Bryne, project architect, testified in support of the project.

**FINDINGS OF FACTS:**

The Preservation Board found that:

- 3310-20 Lemp Avenue is located in the Benton Park Local Historic District;
- the applicant intends to construct a two-story, single-family house at 3310; construct a one-story addition to the small house at 3316; and construct a one-story, two-family building at 3318-20 Lemp Avenue.
- the three proposed constructions generally comply with the historic district standards for new construction;
- exterior design details and materials for the project have not yet been finalized.

**BOARD DECISION:**

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant preliminary approval to the proposal, with the condition that final drawings, materials and colors be reviewed and approved by the Cultural Resources Office. The motion was made by Board Member Melanie Fathman and seconded by Board Mr. Visintainer. The motion passed unanimously.

**F.      2016.0969      2019 WITHNELL AVENUE      BENTON PARK HISTORIC DISTRICT**

---

Owner/Applicant: Jennifer A. Hugill

RESIDENTIAL PLAN:      Appeal of a denial of a building permit to replace a rear/side deck

## PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

JULY 25, 2016

Page 5 of 11

### PROCEEDINGS:

On July 25, 2016, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider an appeal of the Staff's Denial of a building permit application to retain a porch and deck, at 2019 Withnell Avenue in the Benton Park Local Historic District. The applicant submitted the appeal.

Board members Richard Callow (Chair), David Visintainer, David Richardson, Anthony Robinson, Melanie Fathman were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Andrea Gagen of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #67175, which sets forth the standards for appendages in the Benton Park Local Historic District.

Ms. Gagen entered into the record certified copies of Ordinances #64689, as amended by #64925, and #67175; the Board agenda and the PowerPoint presentation for 2019 Withnell Avenue; and the building permit application.

Jennifer Hugill, the owner, testified on her own behalf. Ms. Hugill submitted photos and written specifications into the record. Also testifying in support of the project was Brandee Zahner.

### FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- 2019 Withnell Avenue is located in the Benton Park Local Historic District;
- the applicant reconstructed an existing porch and added a deck without a permit;
- the porch is not based on a Model Example, although it is similar to the previous porch;
- the deck although not allowed under the historic district standards is not visible from the street due to the fencing and height of the yard above sidewalk level.

### BOARD DECISION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to overturn the Staff's denial of the building permit for the porch and deck with the stipulation that the handrails & balusters be changed to meet the historic district standards. The motion was made by Board Member David Richardson and seconded by Ms. Fathman. The motion passed 3-1, with Mr. Robinson opposing the motion.

**G. 2016.0714 3857 SOUTH BROADWAY**

**PRESERVATION REVIEW DISTRICT**

---

Owner: JVH Properties LLC – Joseph Haberstreit

Applicant: A-1 Wrecking – Charles Hemphill

**DEMOLITION PLAN:** Appeal of a denial of a demolition permit application to demolish a two-story brick house and garage.

**PROCEEDINGS:** On July 25, 2016, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider an appeal of the Director's Denial of a permit application to demolish a commercial building at 3857 South Broadway. This property is located in a Preservation Review District. The property owner, JVH Properties LLC., submitted the appeal. Board members Richard Callow, Melanie Fathman, David Visintainer, Anthony Robinson and David Richardson were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Cultural Resources Office Preservation Administrator Jan Cameron reviewed the Demolition Review Criteria in Ordinances #64689 and #64832. She noted that this building is considered to be a Qualifying building due to its age and prominent location, and is likely to be eligible for listing in the National Register, although it is currently not listed. She noted the viability of commercial spaces in this area and the special character of the business district. She described the adverse effect the demolition would have on the urban design of the block, intersection, and historic district by eliminating the only extant building on the small block. She described the condition of the building as Sound, as defined in Ordinance #64689, but acknowledged that there were some structural concerns with the building, resulting from lack of maintenance and/or inappropriate methods of repair, and that the office had received earlier that day a structural report from Michael T. Mahaney, P.E. of Special Inspections and Design. She also reported that no information concerning costs for repair or financial hardship information had been received from the appellant.

Ms. Cameron entered into the record certified copies of Ordinances #64689, as revised by #64925, and #64832; and the Preservation Review District Ordinance #64832; the Board agenda; and the PowerPoint presentation for this property. She

also submitted correspondence received from the Marine Villa Neighborhood Association (MVNA), signed by Stephen Jehle, MVNA President and Pamela Wucher, Chair of the MVNA Development Committee; a letter from the Chippewa Broadway Business Association (CBBA), signed by Pamela Wucher, Chair of the Development Committee of the CBBA and Sarah Bliss, CBBA President; and a letter from Michael Allen, Director of the Preservation Research Office and a local resident, all opposing the demolition of the building. Binders of information, including the structural report completed by Mr. Mahaney, were submitted by the appellant for review by Preservation Board members at the meeting and made available at this time and are part of the record.

David W. Sweeney of Lathrop & Gage LLP, testified on behalf of the appellant JVH Properties LLC. He reserved his final statement to the end of the testimony.

Jo Habenstreit of JVH Properties, residing at 3518 Scenic Circle Drive, Oakville, MO spoke in support of the appeal, stating that she was one of the owners of the building and that her family has had a business at this location since 1929. She testified that 3857 S Broadway had been purchased in 1978 and had always been used for storage, and \$20,000 had been spent during the last six years on a new roof and tuckpointing; and the building had been painted on the advice of their tuckpointer, who felt it would protect the soft brick exposed in the wall. She said she became concerned about the building's condition when her brother fell through one of the floors and had requested that the Building Division come and inspect the building, at which point the building inspector had condemned it. She said the inspector had stated that the building will not stand for six months. She testified that it would cost over \$200,000 to stabilize the building and that the owners could not afford to make the repairs. No evidence was offered to support either statement. Ms. Habenstreit stated that after demolition, the lot would be maintained as green space.

Kurt Habenstreit, residing at 4819 Danebury Drive, spoke in support of the appeal, testifying that he was another of the building owners and also a third-generation owner of Champion Scale, the current building tenant. He stated that the building's roof did not leak, but there was extensive termite damage, and

the building had had no plumbing or electrical service since he could remember. He also stated that the building had both front and south wall tuckpointed previously.

Mike Mahaney, P.E., of Special Inspections and Design, 16624 Old Chesterfield Road, Chesterfield, MO spoke in support of the appeal, testifying that he had been a professional engineer since 1973 and had saved many historic buildings in the county and city. He stated that this was one of the most dangerous buildings he had ever been in; that there was no possible way to economically restore the building because the wall mortar had turned to dust; the building could not handle wind or seismic loads; and that three walls were in imminent danger of collapse. In reply to a question from the Board, Mr. Mahaney stated that the building would not support itself for 6 months and he feared for pedestrians. In response to another question from the Board as to what had caused the building's deterioration, he replied that it was due to its age and its construction, as there is no stability in unreinforced masonry structures lacking a steel frame for support.

Pamela Wucher, residing at 2100 Chippewa Street, spoke against the appeal, stating that she had lived in the area since 2007 and held various offices in community and neighborhood and that she is currently chair of the development committees for both the Chippewa-Broadway Business Association and the Marine Villa Neighborhood Group. She testified that the groups' position is that demolition of 3857 South Broadway would undermine the development efforts the groups have been pursuing in the area. She stated that 3857 S Broadway was a contributing building to what could be a thriving commercial district. She said the neighborhood understood there were structural issues with the building but urged consideration of other creative solutions before demolition is considered. In response to a question from the Board asking her to describe these solutions, Ms. Wucher suggested stabilizing the existing building; or retaining the front façade to maintain the streetscape.

Robert Dielmann, residing at 3841 S Broadway, spoke against the appeal, stating that he had lived in the area since 1971. He submitted a photograph of the area from 1870s. Mr. Dielmann testified that he had restored his house and rehabilitated two buildings opposite, all older than 3857 S Broadway. He stated that

the owners should have taken steps to preserve the south façade of the building and that in his opinion the building could be repaired.

Alderwoman Cara Spencer appeared to oppose the appeal of the Director's Denial, and to state her opposition to the proposed demolition. She submitted a letter detailing her opposition into the record. She noted that 3857 S Broadway was an iconic building important to the streetscape of South Broadway and South Jefferson; that the area was a quaint, active business district that was also shifting and growing and that has been successful in part because of its historic buildings. She expressed the concern of the neighborhood upon hearing the proposed demolition and their frustration that no contact was made by the owners. She stated she had confirmed with the building inspector that he did not remember stating that the building would not stand for six months, as had been previously testified. She noted that many other buildings with more severe structural issues had been rebuilt; and that several developers had contacted her expressing interest in the building. She hoped that other solutions could be explored; until then, the business association and the neighborhood group were opposed to the demolition.

Betty Moore, residing and doing business at 3830 S Broadway, spoke against the appeal, testifying that lived across the street from 3857 S Broadway; that she and her husband had purchased her building in 2002 because of the buildings and landscape of the area; and that they were committed neighborhood residents and their business, Moore Design Group, was a committed neighborhood business. She stated that Robert Dielmann had saved the building in which she currently lived and ran her business. She expressed the strong dedication local business owners had to the neighborhood and that the historic buildings should be maintained for the benefit of future generations; that the neighborhood valued their historic buildings and they were important to maintaining the business district, adding vitality and spirit. Ms Moore stated that the buildings were salvageable and possible to rebuild; and that the neighborhood did not want to see more vacant lots.

Jeff Vines, residing at 6305 Southwood Avenue and doing business at 3159 Cherokee Street spoke against the appeal, stating that the

City's built environment is what distinguishes it and attracts residents. He said that 3857 greatly contributes to the character of the area. He said he had seen many buildings reconstructed in other neighborhoods that had only three walls standing and questioned whether the building was unsalvageable and stressed if a building should come down, it should be for something of equal or greater value.

Randy Vines, residing at 6115 Washington Avenue, spoke against the appeal, testifying that this was a thriving commercial district that would be decimated by declining buildings. That 3857 S Broadway was not in imminent danger, as it was well-built. He said also that one building lost does set a precedent, and devalues the remaining structures.

David W. Sweeney, speaking on behalf of the appellant, stated that the owners represented a business that is of long-standing in the neighborhood, not a new business coming in and demolishing a building. He stated that the owners had been active members of the community since the 1920s. He also emphasized that consideration of the building's structural condition should defer to the submitted engineer's report and his testimony on the building's condition and safety issues.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- no redevelopment plan adopted by ordinance is relevant to this review;
- 3857 South Broadway is a contributing property to the Marine-Villa neighborhood and the Chippewa Broadway commercial area. It is considered a Qualifying building under the ordinance;
- the owner has submitted a report from a structural engineer that states that the building is not Sound, in terms of the Ordinance.;
- the area surrounding the building has few vacant or derelict structures and is generally well-maintained;
- the building is located in a viable commercial district and reuse potential is good;
- no evidence of economic hardship has been submitted.
- the building is one of the oldest buildings in the immediate vicinity and has a prominent position in the streetscape. The loss of this building would have an impact on the small block it

## PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

JULY 25, 2016

Page 11 of 11

stands on and the blockfronts facing South Broadway, particularly in integrity and density;

- no evidence has been submitted concerning the impact of any demolition on the adjacent building;
- there is no proposed use of the property should demolition be approved other than green space; and that
- Ordinance #64689 states that the demolition of buildings in several categories shall not be approved except in unusual circumstances that shall be expressly noted and no such circumstances have been identified.

### BOARD DECISION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to uphold the Director's denial of the demolition permit application of 3857 South Broadway and recommended appropriate steps be taken to stabilize and preserve the building. The motion was made by Board Member Anthony Robinson and seconded by Mr. Visintainer. The motion carried unanimously.

### SPECIAL AGENDA ITEMS

Nomination to the National Register of Historic Places

**H.**

#### **Century Electric Foundry Complex**

3711-39, 3815R, 3749R Market St. & 3700-3800 Forest Park Ave.

### ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to direct the staff to prepare a report for the Missouri State Historic Preservation Office that the Century Electric Foundry Complex meets the requirements for the listing on the National Register under Criterion A, in the area of Industry. The motion was made by Board member Dave Visintainer and seconded by Ms. Fathman. The motion passed unanimously.

Board member David Richardson moved to approve the June 2016 minutes. Hearing no objection, the minutes were approved. Mr. Robinson moved to adjourn the meeting. Dave Visintainer seconded the motion and the meeting was adjourned.