

**CITY OF ST. LOUIS
CULTURAL RESOURCES OFFICE
PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES
JULY 30, 2018**

Board Members Present

Richard Callow – Chairman

Anthony Robinson

Randy Vines

David Richardson

Ald. Terry Kennedy

David Visintainer - Absent

Melanie Fathman - Absent

Mike Killeen – Absent

Tiffany Hamilton – Absent

Cultural Resources Office Staff Present

Dan Krasnoff, Director

Jan Cameron, Preservation Administrator

Andrea Gagen, Preservation Planner

Adona Buford, Administrative Assistant

Legal Counsel

Barbara Birkicht

DISCUSSION OF COMPATIBLE NEW CONSTRUCTION POLICY

PROCEEDINGS:

Dan Krasnoff explained a draft policy document that was on the agenda for Board discussion—the Compatible New Construction Policy. He said this was first brought to the Board by Betsy Bradley, the previous Director, but was never voted on. Mr. Krasnoff said he had amended the document based upon his experience as Director.

He described the process of bringing together from neighborhood representatives, architects, City staff, preservationists and the Home Builders for meetings about the Policy. At the first meeting this group considered examples of projects in other cities that featured contemporary designs in historic contexts. The second meeting was to discuss the draft policy document.

Mr. Krasnoff provided an overview of the policy document. The first portion is an introduction. The Process section delineates the steps for the consideration of projects that intentionally seek to use contemporary design elements. The Rules section state which aspects of design must be compatible with the historic context. The other part of the Rules section says that two elements on a design can be differentiated from the context, and what elements those can be.

Anthony Robinson asked for an explanation of Allowed Differentiation. Mr. Krasnoff said that two of the following elements could be intentionally differentiated from context: percentage of solid to void, window types, door types, fenestration, materials and color.

Anthony Robinson said Dryvit can be an appropriate contemporary material. Mr. Krasnoff agreed and said he would revise the policy.

Randy Vines asked if historicist designs would be allowed. Mr. Krasnoff said such designs are a part of all standards and that such designs would not need to adhere to the Compatible New Construction Policy.

David Richardson said he thought there should be more support from neighborhoods before bringing the policy back to the Board. Mr. Krasnoff said he would take that into consideration before bringing the Policy to the Board for a vote.

Kathy Barkin, a Soulard resident, spoke against the policy's use in her neighborhood.

Paul Brendan, developer of a project in the Central West End, said he agreed with the policy.

PRELIMINARY REVIEWS

A. 2017.0541 4301 MARYLAND AVENUE CENTRAL WEST END HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner/Applicant: MLM on Maryland LLC - Lauren Mathis

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Preliminary review to construct a four-unit apartment building.

PROCEEDINGS: On July 30, 2018, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider a preliminary review application to construct a four-unit apartment building at 4301 Maryland Avenue, in the Central West End Local Historic District. The application was submitted by the developers, Lauren and Mark Mathis.

Board members Anthony Robinson, David Richardson, Randy

Vines and Alderman Terry Kennedy were present for the testimony for this agenda item. David Richardson chaired the meeting in the temporary absence of Chairman Richard Callow.

Jan Cameron of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #69423, which sets forth the standards for residential new construction in Central West End. She testified that the architect and developers of the project had made multiple revisions to the initial proposal in coordination with the Cultural Resources Office staff and the neighborhood, and the design was now generally in compliance with the standards. She submitted into the record an email from Alderman Heather Navarro in support of the project, and another from the Central West End Planning & Development Committee also in support, subject to review of final plans and exterior materials.

Steve Anton, of Anton Architecture, the project architect, spoke on behalf of the project, detailing the design process.

Lauren Mathis, developer of the project, spoke on her own behalf. She stated that the site was unusual and therefore it had been very difficult to develop.

Mark Mathis, the other developer, spoke on his own behalf. He also stated that the oddly shaped lot with cul-de-sac made it difficult to create an economically feasible project. In response to a question from Board Member Robinson as to why the building was sited so far from the building to the west, Mr. Mathis said it was needed to access the parking behind the building, and he had assumed that would be preferable to the adjacent property owner. In response to another question from Mr. Robinson as to why the building was not designed with a wing that extended out to screen the driveway, Mr. Mathis stated they had not really discussed that during design development, but they would consider a brick wall at the front.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- the proposed site for construction, 4301 Maryland Avenue, is located in the Central West End Local Historic District;
- the siting, scale, proportions, roof shape, and exterior materials comply with the Standards; and that

- the setback along Maryland cannot be followed due to the shape of the parcel.

BOARD DECISION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant preliminary approval for the proposed new construction with the stipulation that exterior details and materials will be reviewed and approved by the Cultural Resources Office to ensure compliance with the following: (1) historic replacement windows will be used; (2) the color scheme will be reconsidered to include limestone or limestone-like details; and (3) the driveway/parking to the west will be appropriately screened from view. The motion was made by Board Member Vines and seconded by Board Member Richardson. The motion carried with Board Members Vine, Richardson, Alderman Kennedy and Chairman Callow voting in favor of the motion, and Board Member Robinson abstaining.

B. 2018.0876 5612-24 WATERMAN BOULEVARD CENTRAL WEST END HISTORIC DIST.

Owner/Applicant: Real Estate Investor Wholesale, LLC

COMMERCIAL PLAN:

Preliminary review to construct six three-story fee-simple townhouses.

PROCEEDINGS:

On July 30, 2018, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider a preliminary review application to construct six 3-story townhouses with basement parking at 5612-24 Waterman Boulevard, located in the Central West End Certified Local Historic District. The application was submitted by the project architect, Joe Davidson of Dado Works .

Board members Richard Callow (Chair); Alderman Terry Kennedy, David Richardson, Randy Vines and Anthony Robinson were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Jan Cameron of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #69423, which sets forth the standards for new construction in the Central West End Historic District. She indicated that the project was generally in compliance with the historic district standards for new construction, with the exception of the amount of stucco on the

front elevation, which appeared to be nearly half the facade; and of a proposed curb cut off Clara Avenue. She explained that the curb cut was required as the parcel had no alley access.

Ms. Cameron stated that the Development Committee of the Central West End Association had received plans for review, and had submitted an email stating they were generally in support of the project subject to satisfactory resolution of the front façade material.

Paul Brenden of Dado Works testified in support of the project. He stated that they were seeking differentiation from the surrounding historic buildings by creating a contemporary design and that the stucco approximated 40% rather than half the façade. Mr. Brenden stated that he felt imitating the all-brick of adjacent buildings would not add to the design.

Dan Holak, the developer, testified in support of the project. He said the concept was for owners to feel they had their own separate house and were not in an apartment building, and the stuccoed bays promoted this. In response to a question from Board Member Vines, Mr. Holak stated that the color of the siding would not be a strong contrast to the brick. He also said that the amount of additional brick required would be a cost concern, but he would be happy to work with the Board and the staff.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- 5612 Waterman Boulevard is located in the Central West End Local Historic District;
- while the design complies with many of the requirements of the Central West End Standards for New Construction, in the siting, massing, and scale, it does not comply with the requirement that exterior materials reflect those of adjacent buildings; and that
- the design would be acceptable if a more appropriate material was substituted for the extensive stucco of the primary elevation or if the amount of stucco was reduced.

BOARD DECISION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant preliminary approval of the proposed construction, with the condition that the applicant work with the Cultural Resources staff to determine an appropriate secondary material to be used on the front façade;

and exterior details and materials be reviewed and approved by the Cultural Resources Office staff. The motion was made by Board Member Vines and seconded by Board Member David Richardson. The motion passed unanimously.

APPEALS OF DENIALS

C. 2018.0713 1017 GEYER AVENUE SOULARD HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner/Applicant: Mohammad Othman

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Appeal of a denial of a building permit application to rehabilitate remaining front wall and construct 1-1/2-story house behind.

PROCEEDINGS: On July 30, 2018, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider an appeal of the Director's Denial to restore an existing front wall and construct a single-family house at 1017 Geyer Avenue, in the Soulard Neighborhood Local Historic District. The application was submitted by the owner, Mohammad Othman.

Board members Richard Callow (Chair), Alderman Terry Kennedy, Randy Vines, David Richardson, and Anthony Robinson were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Jan Cameron of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #57078 which sets forth the standards for new construction in the Soulard Local Historic District. She entered into the record 64689, as revised by City Ordinance #64682, the enabling legislation; and Ordinance #57688, the Soulard Historic District, amended by Ordinance # 62382, the revised Soulard Historic District Standards, the Preservation Board Agenda and PowerPoint. Ms. Cameron stated that the developer had been responsive to Cultural Resources Office suggestions and had modified the roof slope and agreed to restore the existing front wall, noting that the plans included with the final agenda incorporated these changes. She also submitted a letter in support of the project from Vanessa Kobrin, President of the Soulard Restoration Group. Ms. Cameron recommended that

the Board overturn the initial denial of the application based upon the revised plans.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- 1017 Geyer is located in the Soulard Neighborhood Local Historic District;
- the proposal is to construct a single-family house behind the existing historic walls, which will be restored and filled with appropriate windows and doors;
- except for its roof, the new construction will not be visible from the street; and that
- the slope of the new roof will be prominently visible above the historic street wall.

BOARD DECISION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to overturn the Director's Administrative Denial with the condition that the Cultural Resources Office staff review and approve revisions to reduce the height and slope of the roof, and final details and materials.

The motion was made by Board member Richardson and seconded by Alderman Kennedy. The motion passed unanimously.

D. 2018.0855 2254-56 S. GRAND BLVD. COMPTON HILL HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner: MBR Shenandoah LLC – Gary Bugajski

Applicant: Arrow Signs – Natalie Ritter

COMMERCIAL PLAN:

Appeal of a denial of a building permit application to install three interior-illuminated signs on the front and south elevations on a City Landmark.

PROCEEDINGS:

On July 30, 2018, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider an appeal of the Director's Denial to install three back-lit signs on the Pelican Building, at 2254-56 S. Grand Boulevard, in the Compton Hill Historic District. The application was submitted by Natalie Ritter, of Arrow Signs.

Board members Richard Callow (Chair), Alderman Terry Kennedy,

Randy Vines, David Richardson, and Anthony Robinson were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Jan Cameron of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #59400 which sets forth the standards for new construction in the Compton Hill Local Historic District. She entered into the record Ordinance #64689, as revised by City Ordinance #64682, the enabling legislation; and Ordinance #59400, the Compton Hill Historic District, the Preservation Board Agenda and PowerPoint. Ms. Cameron stated that the district standards prohibit back-lit signs although she noted that buildings on the opposite side of Grand Blvd., located within the boundaries of the Shaw Historic District, allowed such signs. She submitted a copy of an email in support of the project from Bill Brush, President of the Compton Hill Neighborhood Association. Based upon the standards, Ms. Cameron recommended that the Board uphold the Director's denial of the application.

Gary Bugajski of Domino's testified in support of the project. He noted the work done to bring the Pelican Building back into use and that the proposed signs were greatly reduced in size from the standard Domino's sign package. He also stated that, if required, they could eliminate one of the signs.

Mark Ritterman, owner of the Pelican Building, stated that he was proud of the work they had done, and had invested a great deal in the building and its appearance was important to him. He stated that he thought this would be the best-looking Domino's in the Midwest and that no other of their stores in the country looked anything like this.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- the proposed site for construction, 2254 South Grand, is located in the Compton Hill Local Historic District;
- the district standards prohibit back-lit signs;

- the building faces commercial buildings on the west side of S. Grand that are located within the Shaw Historic District, which does not prohibit back-lit signs; and that
- the signs are significantly smaller than usual Domino's signs and are mounted in areas on the building that do not affect the original historic brick.

BOARD DECISION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to overturn the Director's Denial and allow the installation of the sign on the S. Grand elevation and the projecting sign over the entry as proposed. The sign for the Shenandoah elevation is not approved.

The motion was made by Board member Robinson and seconded by Board Member Vines. The motion passed unanimously.

SPECIAL AGENDA ITEMS:

Nominations to the National Register of Historic Places

E. Stockstrom House – 3400 Russell Boulevard

ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to direct the staff to prepare a report for the Missouri State Historic Preservation Office that the Stockstrom House meets National Register Criterion C for Architecture. The motion was made by Board member Terry Kennedy. Commissioners Robinson and Vines seconded the motion. The motion passed.

F. Wilkinson School – 7212 Arsenal Street

ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to direct the staff to prepare a report for the Missouri State Historic Preservation Office that the Wilkinson School meets National Register Criterion C for Architecture. The motion was made by Board member Terry Kennedy. Commissioners Robinson and Vines seconded the motion. The motion passed.