

**CITY OF ST. LOUIS
CULTURAL RESOURCES OFFICE
PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES
AUGUST 26, 2013**

Board Members Present

Richard Callow, Chairman

Nate Johnson

Mike Killeen

Erin Wright

Alderman Craig Schmid

Anthony Robinson

Melanie Fathman

David Richardson

Cultural Resources Office Staff Present

Betsy H. Bradley, Director

Bob Bettis, Preservation Planner

Jan Cameron, Preservation Administrator

Andrea Gagen, Preservation Planner

Adona Buford, Administrative Assistant

The Chairman called the roll. Board member Anthony Robinson moved to approve the July 22, 2013 minutes and the current Agenda. Mike Killeen seconded the motion. The motions passed.

PRELIMINARY REVIEWS

A. 2013.1186 4104 DeTONTY SHAW HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner/Applicant: UIC-Brent Crittenden

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Preliminary review to construct sixteen houses on fourteen vacant lots.

PREVIOUS ACTION: Deferred from July 22, 2013 meeting.

PROCEEDINGS: Board members, Richard Callow (Chairman), Alderman Craig Schmid, Melanie Fathman, Anthony Robinson, David Richardson, Mike Killeen, Erin Wright and Nate Johnson were present for the testimony for this agenda item. Michael Killeen entered the meeting after the staff had completed its presentation but prior

to the applicant's testimony.

Cultural Resources Office Administrator Jan Cameron stated that this item was tabled at the July 22, 2013 meeting. She made a presentation that addressed the changes made by the applicant to bring the proposal closer in compliance with the Shaw Historic District Ordinance #59400, which sets forth the standards for new residential construction in the Shaw Local Historic District.

Ms. Cameron recommended that the Preservation Board grant an exception to the Shaw standards and approve the proposal.

She submitted letters to the Board from Lawrence Johnson, President of the Shaw Neighborhood Association, with the Association's support for the project; David L. Boger, strongly in opposition to the project; Laura Kinsell-Baer, AICP, in opposition to the project as currently designed; and Jeanette McDermott, also in opposition to the design of the project.

Mr. Brent Crittenden, developer and applicant, made a presentation that further defined the revisions made to the project design.

Speaking in support of the project were:

- 8th Ward Alderman Stephen Conway testified that he had been pursuing development of this site for over 20 years and he was satisfied with the revised design presented.
- Lawrence Johnson, 4000 Flora Place and President of the Shaw Neighborhood Association, testified regarding his Association's support.
- Brian Singler of 4100 DeTonty Avenue, a property directly adjacent to the project site, stated he was in favor of the project proceeding, and that the project was more important than every aspect of its design.
- Jason Kampf, 4058 Shenandoah and Board member of the Shaw Neighborhood Housing Corporation, testified that exceptions should be granted to the standards due to the condition of the site and its location at the edge of the district.

Speaking in opposition to the project were:

- David L. Boger, 3666 Shaw Avenue and block captain of the 3600 block of Russell, spoke in opposition to the proposal, reaffirming the concerns expressed in his letter to Board members and testified to his concerns about the project's effects on security.

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

AUGUST 26, 2013

Page 3 of 14

- Monte Abbot, 3810 DeTonty, stated that the district standards should be followed.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- the proposed site for construction, 4104-56 DeTonty, is located in the Shaw Local Historic District. While the 14-parcel site is currently vacant, the remainder of DeTonty has a consistent and intact streetscape;
- the proposed new construction does not replicate the siting and arrangement of buildings in the historic district: all other properties on DeTonty face the street and conform to a consistent setback;
- the extensive use of clapboard siding as proposed is not characteristic of the building materials in the Shaw Historic District;
- the design of the houses is not compatible with historic buildings in the District in scale, mass, proportion, architectural details or exterior materials;
- that several components of the original submission had been changed to comply with the standards, including reducing, but not eliminating, the project's encroachment on the building line; the introduction on the four northern houses of a secondary entrance facing DeTonty; a revised fenestration pattern of vertical windows arranged in bays; and a uniform brick color; and
- that the project site is located at the extreme northern edge of the Shaw Historic District, directly adjacent to Interstate Highway 44, and various proposals to redevelop it in the last 20 years have been unsuccessful.

BOARD ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant preliminary approval to the revised design as presented by the Applicant. The motion was made by Board member David Richardson. Ms. Fathman seconded the motion. The motion passed with none opposing it.

B. 2013.1387 4142-58 BLAINE NORTH I-44 HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner/Applicant: Botanical Heights Homes – Brent Crittenden

RESIDENTIAL PLAN:

Preliminary review to construct seven new single-family houses.

PROCEEDINGS:

Board members, Richard Callow (Chairman), Alderman Craig Schmid, Melanie Fathman, Anthony Robinson, David Richardson,

Mike Killeen, Erin Wright and Nate Johnson were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Cultural Resources Office Director Betsy Bradley made a presentation that examined the North I-44 Historic District Ordinance #60370, which sets forth the standards for new residential construction in the local historic district. Ms. Bradley asked that the Preservation Board grant preliminary approval for some aspects of the proposal and request further study of components that do not meet the North I-44 Historic District Standards. She reported that Alderman Roddy had sent a letter in support of a variance for the project.

Brent Crittenden, developer and applicant, spoke in favor of the project and answered questions.

Ward 19 Alderman Marlene Davis spoke in support of the project as it would afford additional housing choices.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- the proposed site for construction, 4142-4158 Blaine, is located in the North I-44 Local Historic District;
- the applicant proposes to construct seven houses, a combination of a modern interpretation of a flounder and a coordinated two-story model;
- both models would be compatible with the dwellings on the block and nearby in the district in terms of scale, siting, setback, and overall height;
- the models would continue the use of a contemporary aesthetic for new houses in the North I-44 District, while introducing new designs and materials;
- the façades of both models are proposed to not have any brick and be dominated by a cement fiber board panels, a material not included in the short list of approved materials and are similar to materials expressly prohibited;
- the use of two closely-related colors adds some visual variety in color, as seen in the use of contrasting colors of brick and blended shades of brick in nearby buildings in the district;
- the design incorporates elements that are not common in housing in the historic district, but that do not dominate the designs, such as the set-back side entrances, or that evoke more

traditional elements, the use of a roofed patio rather than a porch; and

- that the recent new construction had established a mix of traditional and contemporary buildings in the North I-44 district and this project will continue that pattern.

BOARD ACTION:

It was the decision of the Board to grant preliminary approval to the Applicant's proposal with the exception of the non-compliant exterior building materials proposed for the facades. The motion was made by Alderman Craig Schmid and seconded by Mr. Robinson. The motion carried unanimously.

C. 2013.1388 4323 McREE AVE NORTH I-44 HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner/Applicant: Botanical Heights Homes – Brent Crittenden

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Preliminary review to construct a two-story single-family house.

PROCEEDINGS: Board members, Richard Callow (Chairman), Alderman Craig Schmid, Melanie Fathman, Anthony Robinson, David Richardson, Mike Killeen, Erin Wright and Nate Johnson were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Cultural Resources Office Director Betsy Bradley made a presentation that examined the standards for new residential construction in the North I-44 Historic District Ordinance #60370. She recommended that the Preservation Board grant preliminary approval to this proposal for new construction as it is compatible in scale, setback and height and continues the use of a contemporary aesthetic for new construction in the North I-44 Local Historic District.

Brent Crittenden, developer and applicant, spoke in favor of the project and answered questions.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- the proposed site for construction, 4232 McRee, is located in the North I-44 Local Historic District;
- the applicant proposes to construct a dwelling that is compatible with the dwellings on the block in terms of scale, siting, setback, and height and that has a decidedly contemporary aesthetic; and
- the contemporary aesthetic of the house introduces new forms and details and does not incorporate architectural details common in the historic district; and

- that a mix of traditional and contemporary buildings had been established in the North I-44 district with the construction of several residences in the district that are compatible in many ways except for the use of materials and architectural details.

BOARD ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant preliminary approval for the proposed new construction as the project would continue the use of contemporary design in the North I-44 Local Historic District and is compatible in scale, height, and siting, with the condition that the design be developed as proposed, and that design details will be reviewed and approved by the Cultural Resources Office to ensure compliance with the Historic District standards. The motion was made by Board member Erin Wright and seconded by Ms. Fathman. The motion passed unanimously.

D. 2013.1389 2629 S. 11TH ST. SOULARD HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner/Applicant: Askins Development Group – Orlando Askins

RESIDENTIAL PLAN:

Preliminary review to construct a new single-family house.

PROCEEDINGS:

Board members, Richard Callow (Chairman), Alderman Craig Schmid, Melanie Fathman, Anthony Robinson, David Richardson, Mike Killeen, Erin Wright and Nate Johnson were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Cultural Resources Office Preservation Planner Andrea Gagen made a presentation that examined the section of City Ordinance #62382, which sets forth the standards for new residential construction in the Soulard Neighborhood Local Historic District. She recommended the Preservation Board grant preliminary approval for the proposed new construction with the stipulation that revisions suggested by the Cultural Resources staff be addressed and that final plans and design details will be reviewed by the Cultural Resources Office for compliance with the Historic District standards.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- the proposed site for construction, 2629 S. 11th Street, is located in the Soulard Neighborhood Local Historic District at the corner of 11th and McGirk Streets;
- the applicant has proposed a Model Example for the new house, although the new house will vary somewhat in the width, interior floor heights and the design of the front door;

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

AUGUST 26, 2013

Page 7 of 14

- the applicant proposes to construct a dwelling where the mass, ratio of solid-to-void, façade materials and roof type all comply with the Soulard Historic District standards;
- the proportions of the front façade of the proposed building are similar to a historic building south across McGirk Street;
- the applicant will correct the front door design; and
- that the applicant wishes to keep the 12-foot first floor height.

BOARD ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant preliminary approval of the proposed new construction, with the stipulations that the front door is brought into compliance with the Soulard Historic District standards, and that design details are reviewed and approved by the Cultural Resources Office to ensure compliance with the standards. The motion was made by Board Member Mike Killeen and seconded by Mr. Robinson. The motion passed with seven Board Members voting in favor of the motion and none opposing it.

E. 2013.1373 1000 MISSISSIPPI LAFAYETTE SQUARE HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner/Applicant: Planter's House –Sean Kelly

COMMERCIAL PLAN: Preliminary review to install a blade sign above a second story window sill.

PROCEEDINGS: Board members, Richard Callow (Chairman), Alderman Craig Schmid, Melanie Fathman, Anthony Robinson, David Richardson, Mike Killeen, Erin Wright and Nate Johnson were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Cultural Resources Office Preservation Planner Andrea Gagen made a presentation that examined the section of City Ordinance #69112, which sets forth the standards for signage in the Lafayette Square Local Historic District. She recommended that the Preservation Board consider approval of the proposed location of the sign as there are site-specific conditions that limit visibility of signs in the location required in the Lafayette Square Historic District standards.

Edward Charak, applicant, spoke in favor of the sign.

Keith Houghton, representing the Lafayette Square Development Committee, reported the Committee's endorsement of the proposed sign.

Ted Kilgore also indicated his support of the project.

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

AUGUST 26, 2013

Page 8 of 14

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- the site for proposed sign, 1000 Mississippi, is located in the Lafayette Square Local Historic District;
- the proposed sign complies with the maximum 800 square inches allowed by the standards;
- the sign would be installed on the Chouteau elevation above the second story window sill, which does not comply with the standards;
- the applicants are requesting that the Preservation Board allow them to install the sign at that location as the concrete entrance columns at Mississippi block the view of the first story from the west; and
- that the owners did not submit plans to light the proposed sign.

BOARD ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant preliminary approval of the proposed sign, based on site-specific conditions which limit visibility of the sign if it were to be erected in the location required by the standards. The motion was made by Board Member Mike Killeen and seconded by Mr. Richardson. The motion passed with seven Board Members voting in favor of the motion and none opposing it.

**F. 2013.1390 3867 LAFAYETTE TIFFANY NATIONAL REGISTER DISTRICT
and PRESERVATION REVIEW DISTRICT**

Owner/Applicant: Garden District Commission – Thomas Pickel

DEMOLITION PLAN:

Preliminary review to partially demolish the north wing.

PROCEEDINGS:

Board members, Richard Callow (Chairman), Alderman Craig Schmid, Melanie Fathman, Anthony Robinson, David Richardson, Mike Killeen, Erin Wright and Nate Johnson were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Cultural Resources Office Director Betsy Bradley made a presentation that examined the demolition review criteria in St. Louis City Ordinances #63689 and #64832. She reported receiving 17 emails opposed to demolition and 7 in favor of the proposal. These communications were submitted into the record. She recommended that the Preservation Board deny approval of the partial demolition unless a compelling argument is presented for the demolition of the north wing in order for the rehabilitation of the Lafayette Avenue wing to be undertaken.

Tom Pickel explained why the Garden District Commission proposes the partial demolition.

Paul Hohmann spoke against the proposed demolition.

Paul M. Loewenstein, representing the Tiffany Community Association, spoke in support of the partial demolition.

Nancy Symeonoglou, President of the Botanical Heights Neighborhood Association, also supported the Garden District proposal.

19TH Ward Alderwoman Marlene Davis supported the proposed partial demolition as well.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- 3967 Lafayette is a sound, Merit building in the Tiffany Neighborhood National Register Historic District;
- the Tiffany Neighborhood is experiencing the rehabilitation of some historic buildings and does not present any deterrent to the rehabilitation and reuse of the building;
- the Garden District Commission asserts that the rehabilitation of the apartments in the Lafayette Avenue wing of the apartment building is feasible only if the north wing is demolished to create off-street parking for apartment residents;
- the loss of the north wing would have an impact on the urban design, particularly on the blockfront on which it is located;
- the new construction proposed for the site would be off-street parking for the immediately adjacent Lafayette Avenue wing of apartment building;
- the proposed new construction would not equal or exceed that of the north wing of the apartment building in the streetscape; and
- that the impact of the rehabilitation of the Lafayette Avenue wing of the apartment building on urban design and neighborhood potential might be considered to offset the loss of the north wing of the building.

BOARD ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant preliminary approval of the demolition of the north wing with the condition that the Garden District Commission take title to the property and issue a Request for Proposals for the rehabilitation of the Lafayette Avenue wing within 90 days. The motion was made by Board member David Richardson and seconded by Mr. Killeen.

The motion passed with David Richardson, Melanie Fathman, Alderman Craig Schmid, Michael Killeen, and Nate Johnson voting in favor of it. Anthony Robinson and Erin Wright voted against the motion.

NEW APPLICATIONS

G. 2013.1252 1831 S. 7TH ST. SOULARD HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner/Applicant: KNJ – Ketan Patel

COMMERCIAL PLAN: New application to construct a two-story commercial/residential building.

PROCEEDINGS: Board members, Richard Callow (Chairman), Alderman Craig Schmid, Melanie Fathman, Anthony Robinson, David Richardson, Mike Killeen, Erin Wright and Nate Johnson were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Cultural Resources Office Preservation Planner Andrea Gagen made a presentation that examined the section of City Ordinance #62382, which sets forth the standards for new residential construction in the Soulard Neighborhood Local Historic District. She recommended that the Preservation Board grant preliminary approval for the proposed new construction with the stipulation that the Geyer Avenue setback and retaining wall materials are brought into compliance with the Soulard Local Historic District Standards, and that final plans and design details be approved by the Cultural Resources Office for compliance with the district standards. Ms. Gagen submitted two letters of support of the project into the record.

Ketan Patel, owner, testified on his own behalf.

FINDINGS OF FACTS: The Preservation Board found that:

- the proposed site for construction, 1831 S. 7th Street, is located in the Soulard Neighborhood Local Historic District at the corner of 7th Street and Geyer Avenue;
- although the applicant has not proposed a single Model Example for the new house, the proposed new construction draws substantially from corner commercial buildings within the district;
- the applicant proposes to construct a building where the mass, scale and proportions, ratio of solid-to-void, façade materials

and roof type all comply with the Soulard Historic District standards;

- the applicant agrees to move the proposed new construction to the building line of the other buildings on that block; and
- that the applicant will use an approved material for the proposed retaining wall.

BOARD ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant preliminary approval of the building permit application of the proposed new construction, with the stipulation the Geyer Avenue setback and retaining wall materials are brought into compliance with the Soulard Historic District standards and that design details be approved by the Cultural Resources Office to ensure compliance with the district standards. The motion was made by Board Member David Richardson and seconded by Mr. Robinson. The motion passed unanimously.

H. 2013.1267 238 N. EUCLID AVE CENTRAL WEST END HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner: Gamblin Whiskey House – Luca Gamblin

Applicant: Blackline Design & Construction – Mark Groenda

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: New application to construct an addition.

PROCEEDINGS: Board members, Richard Callow (Chairman), Alderman Craig Schmid, Melanie Fathman, Anthony Robinson, David Richardson, Erin Wright and Nate Johnson were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

BOARD ACTION: Due to the absence of the project applicants, the item was tabled for consideration at a subsequent meeting.

I. 2013.1409 1 GOVERNMENT DR. FOREST PARK/ST. LOUIS ZOO

Owner: City of St. Louis

Applicant: Saint Louis Zoo – David McGuire

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: New application to construct a two-story polar bear habitat.

PROCEEDINGS: Board members, Richard Callow (Chairman), Alderman Craig Schmid, Melanie Fathman, Anthony Robinson, David Richardson, Erin Wright and Nate Johnson were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Cultural Resources Office Administrator Jan Cameron made a recommendation for approval of the project; she recommended that the Preservation Board approve the application for the partial demolition of the existing bear pits and the construction of a new environment and exhibit space for polar bears

David McGuire, Vice President for Architecture and Planning at the Zoo, made a presentation that briefly outlined the project.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- the St. Louis Zoo is located in Forest Park, a city property;
- the existing Bear Bluffs exhibit is a historic resource. Opened to the public in 1921, the exhibit was a model for zoos around the world. The Bluffs have been altered from their original configuration: the center exhibit was removed in 2002-2003 for construction of the Penguin and Puffin Coast, the interior holding area (not visible from the exterior) was closed and other minor alterations have been made. However, the end sections of the exhibit remain essentially intact;
- the Bear Bluffs exhibit is no longer meets the highest modern standards for animal care and is not a suitable environment for polar bears;
- the Polar Bear exhibit will house newly-acquired animals and be built to conform to the standards of the Association of Zoos and Aquariums and the Polar Bear Protection Act;
- the existing Bear Bluffs exhibit has been photographed and digitally scanned. A copy of the documentation will be given to the Cultural Resources Office, and will be kept by the Zoo for the use of future researchers and historians;
- the proposed polar bear house is contextual in mass and scale, and exterior materials with the remaining bear pits and the adjacent Penguin and Puffin house. A brick screening wall will be inserted within the existing brick wall along Government Drive, but the remainder of the serpentine wall will be retained and restored; and
- that at the request of the Cultural Resources Office, the rear elevations of the polar bear house, which are visible from within the Park, were revised. The unarticulated brick walls were augmented with colored brick coursing; and a utility gate opening onto Government Drive will carry decorative metal panels.

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

AUGUST 26, 2013

Page 13 of 14

BOARD ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant preliminary approval of the building permit application for the partial demolition of the existing Bear Bluffs exhibit, and for the construction of a new environment and exhibit space for polar bears. The motion was made by Board Member Anthony Robinson and seconded by Ms. Fathman. The motion passed unanimously.

APPEAL OF DENIAL

J. 2013.1301 5911 McPHERSON SKINKER-DeBALIVIERE HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner/Applicant: Gholam & Janet Ghasedi

RESIDENTIAL PLAN:

Appeal of a denial of a building permit application to retain eighty-four windows replaced and exterior trim wrapped without a permit.

PROCEEDINGS:

Board members, Richard Callow (Chairman), Alderman Craig Schmid, Melanie Fathman, Anthony Robinson, David Richardson, Erin Wright and Nate Johnson were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Bob Bettis of the Cultural Resources Office submitted into the record City Ordinances #64689, as amended by Ordinance #64832 and #64925, and the Skinker-DeBaliviere Historic District Ordinance, #57688. Mr. Bettis detailed why the installed windows were not in compliance with the Skinker-DeBaliviere Historic District Standards. He recommended that the Board require that all the windows on the front be replaced with new windows correctly dimensioned for the openings, and that the coil stock be removed from the brickmolds.

Corge Umlauf, legal counsel, testified on behalf of the owner Gholam Ghasedi, asking that the owner be allowed to retain the windows based on the legal doctrine of estoppels, due to misinformation, provided to the property owner by a City of St. Louis Building Inspector and relied upon by the Applicant, here, to his detriment. He also argued a lack of clear direction in the Skinker-DeBaliviere Historic District Standards regarding windows.

Paul Hohmann, representing the Skinker-DeBaliviere neighborhood, testified in qualified support of the staff recommendation, stating that although it was unfortunate that the owner received bad advice from the Building Inspector, the

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

AUGUST 26, 2013

Page 14 of 14

neighborhood feels the front windows should have the interior muntins removed and the brickmolds be unwrapped.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- 5911 McPherson Avenue is located in the Skinker-DeBaliviere Local Historic District;
- the vinyl windows were installed without a permit;
- the profiles of the sash, frames and muntins of the installed windows do not match the original windows;
- the brickmold and mullions have been wrapped in coil stock concealing historic wood elements;
- the City of St. Louis Building Inspector informed the owner that he did not need a permit to install windows; and
- the cost to replace the existing windows on the front of the building would be \$18,000.

BOARD ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to overturn the Director's denial of the application to retain existing windows. The Appellant may retain the windows as installed on all sides of the building. The motion was made by Board Member Erin Wright and seconded by Alderman Schmid. The motion passed with all six Board Members voting for the motion.

Board Member Anthony Robinson moved to adjourn the meeting. Hearing no objections, the meeting was adjourned.