

**CITY OF ST. LOUIS  
CULTURAL RESOURCES OFFICE  
PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES  
AUGUST 26<sup>TH</sup>, 2019**

**Board Members Present**

Richard Callow – Chairman  
Randy Vines  
Alderman Joe Vaccaro  
Michael Killeen  
Anthony Robinson  
Melanie Fathman  
David Richardson

**Cultural Resources Office Staff Present**

Dan Krasnoff, Director  
Jan Cameron, Preservation Administrator  
Andrea Gagen, Preservation Planner  
Bethany Moore, Preservation Planner  
Adona Buford, Adm. Assistant

**Legal Counsel**

Debbie Deuster

**PRELIMINARY REVIEWS**

**A. 2019.1026      2908 RUSSELL BOULEVARD      COMPTON HILL HISTORIC DIST.**

---

Owner/Applicant: Phillip Finder

RESIDENTIAL PLAN:      Preliminary review to replace tile roof with slate roof.

PROCEEDINGS:      On August 26, 2019, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider a Preliminary Review application for 2908 Russell Boulevard to replace the entire roof, including the original Spanish tile roofing material on the front slope of the roof and asphalt shingles on the remaining roof structure, with slate. 2908 Russell Boulevard is located in the Compton Hill Local Historic District.

Board members Richard Callow (Chair), Randy Vines, Michael Killeen, Melanie Fathman, David Richardson, Alderman Joe Vaccaro and Anthony Robinson were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Bethany Moore of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that reviewed the Compton Hill Local Historic District Standards as they related to roofing materials and

showed images of the difference in appearance of the original Spanish tile and the proposed slate roofing material. She also showed images of other homes in the neighborhood for context as to the roofing materials on surrounding buildings in the area. Ms. Moore recommended that the Preservation Board withhold Preliminary Approval to the project as the proposal to replace the original Spanish tile roofing building material with slate did not meet the Standards according to section F. Exterior Materials.

The owner, Phillip Finder, gave a PowerPoint presentation outlining the research process he had done to find a way to replace the roof at a cost that he and his wife could afford. Mr. Finder explained to the Preservation Board that he had been given the slate as a donation and would be helping with the work himself in order to keep the cost down. He also brought in samples of materials, the original Spanish tile and the proposed slate, for the Board to examine.

**FINDINGS OF FACTS**

The Preservation Board found that:

- 2908 Russell Boulevard is located in the Compton Hill Local Historic District;
- the Compton Hill Local Historic District Standards allow slate as an approved roofing material.

**BOARD DECISION:**

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant Preliminary Approval to replace the whole roof with the slate roofing material. The motion was made by Commissioner Melanie Fathman and seconded by Commissioner David Richardson. The motion passed with six members voting in favor and none opposed.

**B. 2019.1126 #37 WESTMORELAND PLACE CENTRAL WEST END HISTORIC DIST.**

---

Owner: Mark and Margarita Fronmuller

Applicant: Paul & Associates – Paul Fendler

**RESIDENTIAL PLAN:**

Preliminary review to enclose an existing side porch.

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

AUGUST 26<sup>TH</sup>, 2019

Page 3 of 11

PROCEEDINGS:

On August 26, 2019, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider a Preliminary Review application to enclose a side porch in the Central West End Local Historic District.

Board members Richard Callow (Chair), Randy Vines, Michael Killeen, Melanie Fathman, David Richardson, Anthony Robinson and Alderman Joe Vaccaro were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Daniel Krasnoff of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that reviewed the plans for the proposed porch enclosure at 37 Westmoreland Place. He noted that the standards do not expressly prohibit the enclosure and said that the applicant and their architect, Paul Fendler, had revised the design to show that the porch was originally an open and that a future owner could reverse the alteration.

Paul Fendler, project architect, spoke in favor of the proposal.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board finds that:

- #37 Westmoreland Place is located in the Central West End Local Historic District;
- the side porch is clearly visible from Westmoreland Place;
- the proposed enclosure is designed to minimize impact on original architectural features, particularly the porch columns;
- the bay window which is currently exposed will be retained;
- the proposed porch enclosure is designed to communicate that the porch was originally open;
- the porch alteration is reversible.

BOARD DECISION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant preliminary approval to the porch enclosure as it complies with the Central West End Historic District Standards with the following stipulation: The bay window on the east façade of the house cannot be altered or removed. The motion was made by Board member Randy Vines and seconded by Alderman Joe Vaccaro. The motion passed with six members voting in favor, none opposed.

APPEALS OF DENIALS

C. 2019.1095

1217 MACKAY PLACE

LAFAYETTE SQ. HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner/Applicant: Hernando and Martha Garcia

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Appeal of a denial of a building permit application to retain painted masonry window sills.

PROCEEDINGS: On August 26, 2019, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider an Appeal of the Director's Denial to retain five masonry window sills painted without a permit at 1217 MacKay Place in the Lafayette Square Local Historic District. Board members Richard Callow (Chair); Randy Vines, Michael Killeen, David Richardson, Melanie Fathman, Alderman Joe Vaccaro and Anthony Robinson were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Bethany Moore of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #69112, which sets forth the standards for the painting of exterior elements in the Lafayette Square Local Historic District. She submitted into the record certified copies of Ordinances #69112 #64689, #64925 and a letter from Lafayette Square Restoration committee in opposition. She stated that the painting of unpainted windowsills in a brick façade was prohibited by the Standards. Ms. Moore noted that it was the recommendation of the Cultural Resources Office that the Preservation Board uphold the Director's denial as the painting of the previously unpainted masonry windowsills in a brick façade violated the Standards for Lafayette Square. The owner was not present.

Suzanne Sessions, of the Lafayette Square Restoration Committee, spoke in opposition to the painted windowsills and supported

FINDINGS OF FACTS: The Preservation Board found that:

- the site of the alterations is within the boundaries of the Lafayette Square Local Historic District.
- the alterations were done without a permit and do not meet the standards for the painting of exterior elements in the Lafayette Square Local Historic District.

BOARD DECISION: It was the decision of the Preservation Board to uphold the Director's denial of the retention of the painted windowsills done without a permit. The motion was made by Commissioner

Joe Vaccaro and seconded by Commissioner David Richardson. The motion passed with six members voting in favor and none opposed.

**D. 2019.1236            #30 PORTLAND PLACE            CENTRAL WEST END HISTORIC DIST.**

---

Owner: Gregory Lee and Anna Miller

Applicant: Mosby Building Arts – Jeff Anderson

RESIDENTIAL PLAN:            Appeal of a denial of a building permit application to enclose side porch with screening.

PROCEEDINGS:            On August 26, 2019, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider an appeal of the Director’s denial to replace deteriorated porch elements and add screens to a street visible side porch at #30 Portland Place in the Central West End Local Historic District. Board members Richard Callow (Chair); Randy Vines, Michael Killeen, David Richardson, Melanie Fathman, Alderman Joe Vaccaro and Anthony Robinson were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Bethany Moore of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #56768, which sets forth the standards for architectural elements in the Central West End Local Historic District. She submitted into the record certified copies of Ordinances #56768, #64689 and #64925. She stated that the project as proposed complies with the Standards and can be approved at the staff level with the exception of the screens which would need to be approved by a Preservation Board decision as it is a street visible significant architectural detail. Ms. Moore examined the plans for the proposed changes and noted that the screening would be set back from the balustrade and columns in order to be minimally invasive to the architectural elements of the porch and not obscure any architectural details as is in line with the requirements of the Standards. Ms. Moore stated that it was the recommendation of the Cultural Resources Office that the Preservation Board overturn the Director’s denial as the proposed changes met the Central West End Local Historic District Standards.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:            The Preservation Board found that:

- the site of the alterations is within the boundaries of the Central West End Local Historic District.
- the alterations, after recommendations from the Cultural Resources Office staff, meet the standards for architectural details in the Central West End Local Historic District.

**BOARD DECISION:**

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to overturn the Director's denial of the alterations to the street visible side porch as they meet the standards for the Central West End Local Historic District. The motion was made by Commissioner Mike Killeen and seconded by Commissioner Melanie Fathman. The motion passed with six Board Members voting in favor and none opposed.

**E. 2019.0903**

**5633 BOTANICAL AVE.**

**PRESERVATION REVIEW DISTRICT**

---

Owner: Pagano Land Development, LLC

Applicant: Bellon Salvage – Don Bellon

**DEMOLITION PLAN:**

Appeal of a denial of a demolition permit to demolish a 1.5 story single family brick house.

**PROCEEDINGS:**

On August 26, 2019, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider an Appeal of the Director's Denial to demolish a 1.5 story brick single family house at 5633 Botanical Avenue, in a Preservation Review District. Board members Richard Callow (Chair); Randy Vines, David Richardson, Melanie Fathman, Alderman Joe Vaccaro and Anthony Robinson were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Bethany Moore of the Cultural Resources Office was sworn to testify. She made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #64689, as amended by City Ordinance #64925; and City Ordinance #64832, which delineates criteria for the review of demolition proposals for properties in Preservation Review Districts and/or those located in Preservation Review Districts. She entered into the record:

Exhibit 1: Certified Copy of Ordinance #64689

Exhibit 2: Certified Copy of Ordinance #64925

Exhibit 3: Certified Copy of Ordinance #64832

Exhibit 4: The application for demolition (Including Director's denial of application letter)

Exhibit 5: The PowerPoint presentation by Ms. Moore

Exhibit 6: An email message from Kathy O'Brien, Office Manager for Pagano Land Development, LLC, on behalf of Mr. Pagano appealing the Director's denial

Exhibit 7: Letter of support for the development of three new houses at 5633 Botanical Avenue from the neighborhood association, Hill 2000, dated April 16, 2019.

Ms. Moore showed images of the building at 5633 Botanical Avenue proposed for demolition, as well as other buildings on the street, in order to provide a visual context for the area. In her presentation Ms. Moore explained that the building was determined to be a Merit structure and that Ord. 64689 as amended by Ord. 64925 states in section Sixty-One (B), "Demolition of Merit or Qualifying Structures shall not be approved except in unusual circumstances which shall be expressly noted," and no unusual circumstances were present. Ms. Moore went on to further explain the criteria for demolition approval as set forth in sections A,D,F, and G of Ordinance # 64832. The presentation also examined the plans for the proposed new construction on the site that were sent to the Cultural Resources Office and determined that the proposed new construction did not "equal or exceed the contribution of the structure to the integrity of the existing streetscape and block face," as set forth in section Five (F) 2. of Ordinance #64832. Ms. Moore concluded by stating that it was the recommendation of the Cultural Resources Office staff that the Preservation Board uphold the Director's denial as the existing conditions do not meet the Criteria for Demolition approval listed in Ordinance #64832.

Chris Pagano, owner, was present and gave a PowerPoint presentation showing images of the interior of 5633 Botanical Avenue as well as images of other projects done by Pagano Land Development, LLC. Mr. Pagano stated that he had never come before the Preservation Board before and that the plans submitted were not his intended plans for the site as they usually build custom homes. He stated his intention was to divide the property into two 4500 square foot building sites that would be

37.5 feet wide by 1,020 feet deep each with a new house constructed. He also stated he bought the property believing he would be able to tear the house down and that he had the support of the neighbors as well as the neighborhood association-Hill 2000.

In response to a question from the Chair about the submitted plans for the house to be built on the site after demolition Mr. Pagano stated he believed he would build it with a porch across the front and possibly a brick façade.

In response to a question from the Chair about quantifying his financial hardship Mr. Pagano stated he paid \$230,000 for the land and the tear down would be \$15,000-\$20,000 making each lot cost him \$150,000 when he had anticipated \$80,000-\$85,000 a lot.

In response to a question from Board Member Vines, Mr. Pagano stated the existing house, with a size of 1,500 square feet, was too small for the buyers of homes he was producing. In addition, he said the house would be expensive to rehabilitate and that a price of \$500,000-\$600,000 was too high for the size of the house that would be produced.

In response to a question from Alderman Vacarro Mr. Pagano stated that Alderman Joe Volmer was in favor of the project and had advised him to present his proposal to the Hill 2000 neighborhood organization that supported the project. After talking to the neighbors Mr. Pagano decided to build two houses on the property instead of three. He also stated he had never been through the process before and would have brought people to speak in favor if he known that would help. He also stated that houses were torn down in the neighborhood all the time and he did not believe what he was trying to do would be hurting the neighborhood.

In response to another question from Alderman Vacarro, Mr. Pagano stated that he did not know how rehabbing the house would be economically feasible in order to make a profit. He also stated he sent the elevations of the proposed construction to the Cultural Resources Office because that is what he always did. He stated that the house he would construct would not look like the

one that was existing and that none of the new buildings built where older ones were torn down looked like the ones that were there before.

**FINDINGS OF FACTS:**

The Preservation Board found that:

- the site of the proposed demolition is within the boundaries of the Preservation Review District;
- the building at 5633 Botanical Avenue proposed for demolition does not meet the criteria for demolition approval set forth in City Ordinances #64689 as amended by #64925 and #64832.

**BOARD DECISION:**

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to uphold the Director's denial of the demolition application. The motion was made by Commissioner Anthony Robinson and was seconded by Commissioner Randy Vines. Board Members Melanie Fathman, Anthony Robinson, David Richardson and Randy Vines supported the motion. Alderman Joe Vacarro opposed the motion. The motion passed four to one (4 – 1).

**F. 2019.1289**

**4001 BOTANICAL AVE.**

**SHAW HISTORIC DISTRICT**

---

Owner/Applicant: Ronald Brunson

**RESIDENTIAL PLAN:**

Appeal of a denial of a building permit application to replace an existing retaining wall.

**PROCEEDINGS:**

On August 26, 2019, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider an Appeal of the Director's Denial to replace a retaining wall at 4001 Botanical Avenue in the Shaw Local Historic District. Board members Richard Callow (Chair); Randy Vines, David Richardson, Melanie Fathman, Alderman Joe Vaccaro and Anthony Robinson were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Eighth Ward Alderwoman Annie Rice was sworn to tell the truth and addressed the Board. She said that, although she opposed new retaining walls, per the Shaw Historic District Standards, the proposed replacement of the retaining wall was justified since it likely was constructed before the creation of the District.

Daniel Krasnoff, Cultural Resources Director made a presentation

that examined the sections of City Ordinance #59400, which sets forth the standards for the retaining walls in the Shaw Local Historic District. Mr. Krasnoff swore to tell the truth and entered certified copy of Ordinance #59400 into the record, as well as support letters for the project from the Shaw Neighborhood Improvement Association, an e-mail from Alderwoman Rice in support of the application and a list of buildings in the District with retaining walls submitted by the applicant.

Mr. Krasnoff stated that the ordinance does not allow the construction of retaining walls in front of the building line. He also said that the existing retaining wall showed significant signs of deterioration and was constructed prior to the current owner occupying the house, and, quite likely was built before the creation of the Shaw Local Historic District, in the mid-1980's.

Ronald Brunson, owner of 4001 Botanical Avenue, swore to tell the truth and addressed the Board. He said he has owned the house for more than two decades and could no longer repair the retaining wall. Mr. Brunson said the wall was installed when he bought the house and that it was in place long before then. He also said that to re-grade the yard would be difficult.

**FINDINGS OF FACTS:**

The Preservation Board found that:

- 4001 Botanical Avenue is located in the Shaw Neighborhood Local Historic District.
- the retaining wall at 4001 Botanical Avenue was likely constructed before the creation of the Shaw Local Historic District.

**BOARD DECISION:**

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to overturn the Director's denial of the application and approve the installation of the replacement versa-lock retaining wall per the plans submitted. The motion was made by Commissioner Anthony Robinson and seconded by Commissioner Randy Vines. The motion passed with Commissioners Randy Vines, David Richardson, Melanie Fathman, and Alderman Joe Vaccaro voting in favor and Anthony Robinson abstaining.

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

AUGUST 26<sup>TH</sup>, 2019

Page **11** of **11**