

**CITY OF ST. LOUIS  
CULTURAL RESOURCES OFFICE  
PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES  
SEPTEMBER 22, 2014**

Board Members Present

Richard Callow, Chairman

Mike Killeen

Alderman Craig Schmid

David Richardson

Erin Wright

Anthony Robinson

Nate Johnson

Legal Counsel

Barbara Birkicht

Cultural Resources Office Staff Present

Betsy Bradley, Director

Jan Cameron, Preservation Administrator

Andrea Gagen, Preservation Planner

Bob Bettis, Preservation Planner

Adona Buford, Administrative Assistant

Chairman Richard Callow called the roll. Five (5) Board members were in attendance. Board members Anthony Robinson and Nate Johnson arrived shortly after the meeting began. Alderman Craig Schmid moved to approve the August 25, 2014 minutes. Mr. Richardson seconded the motion and the motion passed.

**A.      2014.1092      2124 VICTOR STREET      BENTON PARK HISTORIC DISTRICT**

---

Owner: Robert Watson & Celia Wesloh

Applicant: MLK Construction – Matt Kettner

RESIDENTIAL PLAN:                      Appeal of the denial of a building permit application to replace a slate roof and repair woodwork.

PROCEEDINGS:                              On September 22, 2014, the Preservation Board of the City of St.

Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider an appeal of the Director's Denial of a building permit application to replace a slate roof at 2124 Victor in the Benton Park Local Historic District. The appellant, Matt Kettner of MLK Construction, submitted the application and the appeal.

Board members Richard Callow, Alderman Craig Schmid, David Richardson, Nate Johnson, Mike Killeen, Erin Wright and Anthony Robinson were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Andrea Gagen of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #67175, which sets forth the standards for residential rehabilitation in the Benton Park Local Historic District. She testified that the project was not in compliance with the Standards as the proposed slate was of a different configuration than the existing slate.

Ms. Gagen entered into the record certified copies of Ordinances #64689, as amended by #64925, and #67175; the Board agenda and the PowerPoint presentation for 2124 Victor; and the building permit application. She also submitted a letter from the Benton Park Neighborhood Association in support of the Director's denial.

Matt Kettner of MLK Construction, the appellant, testified on the owners' behalf, stating that they wish use rectangular slate to reduce the cost of the project.

**FINDINGS OF FACTS:** The Preservation Board found that:

- 2124 Victor is located in the Benton Park Historic District;
- the proposed rectangular shingles would present a different appearance than the patterned slate;
- the shape of the slate shingles is a character-defining element of the historic building and changing it would be a significant alteration to the building's design; and
- the shaped slate would need to be cut by the contractor and would result in increased cost.

**BOARD ACTION:**

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to uphold the Director's denial of the building permit because the proposed slate does not comply with the Benton Park Historic District Standards. The motion was made by Board Member Richardson, and seconded by Ms. Wright. Mr. Killeen

recused himself and Mr. Johnson abstained from voting. The motion passed with four Board Members voting in favor of the motion.

**B. 2014.0768 2335 ANN AVENUE MCKINLEY HEIGHTS HISTORIC DISTRICT**

---

Owner/Applicant: Pitts Properties I LLC – Jim Pitts

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Appeal of the denial of a building permit application to install nine windows on front façade.

PROCEEDINGS: On September 22, 2014, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider an appeal of the Director's Denial of a building permit application to retain nine non-compliant vinyl windows installed without a building permit, in the McKinley Heights Local Historic District. The owner submitted the application and the appeal.

Board members Richard Callow, Alderman Craig Schmid, David Richardson, Nate Johnson, Erin Wright, Mike Killeen and Anthony Robinson were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Bob Bettis of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #67901, which sets forth the standards for residential rehabilitation in the McKinley Heights Local Historic District. He testified that the project was not in compliance with the Standards as the installed windows were vinyl and not based on a Model Example.

Mr. Bettis entered into the record Ordinances #64689, as revised by #64925, and #67901; the Board agenda and the PowerPoint presentation for 2335 Ann Avenue; and the building permit application. He also submitted a letter from the McKinley Heights Development Committee supporting the Director's denial.

Jim Pitts, the owner, testified on his own behalf, stating that he wishes to retain the windows that were installed as he cannot afford to replace them with appropriate approved models. Mr. Pitts submitted financial information into the record as evidence

FINDINGS OF FACTS: The Preservation Board found that:

- 2335 Ann Avenue is located in the McKinley Heights Historic District;

- nine vinyl windows were installed without permits on the front facade over the course of the past two years; and
- the installed windows are vinyl; do not replicate the appearance of historic wood sash; and do not conform to the McKinley Heights Historic District Standards.

**BOARD ACTION:**

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to uphold the Director's denial of the building permit because the installed windows do not comply with the McKinley Heights Historic District Standards. The motion was made by Board Member David Richardson. Mr. Johnson seconded the motion. Board member Anthony Robinson abstained. The motion passed with five Board Members voting in favor of the motion.

**C. 2014.0977 5149 WESTMINSTER PLACE CENTRAL WEST END HISTORIC DISTRICT**

---

Owner: Clifton & Carolyn Harmon

Applicant: Riggs Construction & Design – Bill Riggs

**RESIDENTIAL PLAN:**

Appeal of the denial of a building permit application to repair front porch balustrade and columns.

**PROCEEDINGS:**

On September 22, 2014, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider an appeal of the Director's Denial of a building permit application to replace front porch balustrades and columns at 5149 Westminster Place, in the Central West End Local Historic District. The contractor submitted the application and the appeal.

Board members Richard Callow, Alderman Craig Schmid, Erin Wright, Mike Killeen, Nate Johnson, David Richardson, and Anthony Robinson were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Bob Bettis of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #69423, which sets forth the standards for residential rehabilitation in the Central West End Local Historic District. He testified that the project was not in compliance with the Standards as the columns and capitals are sound and could be repaired and should remain in use, and the proposed replacement columns and capitals do not replicate

the original appearance and are not made of wood.

Mr. Bettis entered into the record certified copies of Ordinances #64689, as amended by #64925, and #69423; the Board agenda and the PowerPoint presentation for 5149 Westminster Place; and the building permit application. He also submitted a letter from the Central West End Association in support of the Director's denial.

Bill Riggs, representing the owner, testified that the columns and capitals are beyond repair and need to be replaced. Clifton Harmon, the owner, testified that they cannot afford to replace the columns and capitals per the standards. William Siebert, representing the Central West End Planning and Development Committee, testified in support of the Director's denial and staff recommendation.

**FINDINGS OF FACTS:**

The Preservation Board found that:

- 5149 Westminster is located in the Central West End Historic District;
- the Central West End Standards require that any original or historic porch or its components be kept and maintained if possible and require any replaced elements to exactly replicate the dimensions and details of the original;
- the wood columns have been examined in the field and need only cosmetic maintenance to remain in service;
- the proposed replacement fiberglass columns and capitals do not replicate the existing elements. The capitals are smaller in size than the original, of a different material and do not have the same design as the original; and
- the existing cast concrete balustrade is a historic alteration that is not original to the house. The proposed fiberglass balustrade system would be an acceptable substitution if the original columns and capitals are retained.

**BOARD ACTION:**

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to uphold the Director's denial of the building permit because the existing columns and capitals do not require replacement and the proposed columns and capitals do not comply with the Central West End Historic District Standards. The motion was made by Board Member Richardson. Alderman Schmid seconded the

motion. Mr. Robinson opposed the motion. The motion passed five to one.

**D. 2014.1171 2400-08 S. 9<sup>TH</sup> STREET SOULARD HISTORIC DISTRICT**

---

Owner: Christopher Rakel & Gregory Gawrys

Applicant: KWA Klitzing Welsch - Joe Klitzing

COMMERCIAL PLAN: Appeal of the denial of a building permit application for exterior alterations to a Public Façade.

PROCEEDINGS: On September 22, 2014, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider an appeal of the Director's Denial of a building permit application for exterior alterations to a Public Façade at 2400-08 S. 9<sup>th</sup> Street, in the Soulard Local Historic District. The appellant, Joe Klitzing of KWA Klitzing Welsh submitted the application and the appeal.

Board members Richard Callow, Alderman Craig Schmid, David Richardson, Nate Johnson, Mike Killeen, and Anthony Robinson were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Andrea Gagen of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #62382, which sets forth the standards for residential rehabilitation in the Soulard Local Historic District. She testified that the project was not in compliance with the Standards as new window openings are not allowed on Public Facades and the proposed reconstructed loading dock wall was not masonry. She also testified that due to the limited visibility of the proposed window openings and the industrial nature of the material proposed for the wall, the Cultural Resources Office recommended approval of the revised design.

Ms. Gagen entered into the record certified copies of Ordinances #64689, #64925, #57078 and #62382; the Board agenda and the PowerPoint presentation for 2400-08 S. 9<sup>th</sup> Street; and the building permit application.

Joe Klitzing, the appellant, testified on the owner's behalf, stating that the windows on the Public Façade were necessary for the project and a request of the National Park Service. He also

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

SEPTEMBER 22, 2014

Page 7 of 7

testified that the cost of doing a masonry wall would kill the project due to cost.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- 2400-08 S. 9<sup>th</sup> Street is located in the Soulard Historic District;
- the proposed new window openings, although on the Public Façade, have very limited visibility from the street;
- the use of corrugated metal, while not an approved material under the historic district standards, is a material used in industrial applications;
- the appellant has agreed to use a dark grey matte finish on the corrugated metal, along with revisions to the windows in the reconstructed wall.

BOARD ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to overturn the Director's denial of the building permit because of the limited visibility of the new window openings and the financial hardship of reconstructing the loading dock wall in masonry. The motion was made by Board Member Killeen. Mr. Johnson seconded the motion. Mr. Killeen opposed the motion. The motion passed four to one.