

**CITY OF ST. LOUIS
CULTURAL RESOURCES OFFICE
PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES
SEPTEMBER 24, 2018**

Board Members Present

Richard Callow – Chairman
Anthony Robinson
Randy Vines
Tiffany Hamilton
Mike Killeen
Melanie Fathman
David Richardson

Cultural Resources Office Staff Present

Dan Krasnoff, Director
Jan Cameron, Preservation Administrator
Andrea Gagen, Preservation Planner
Adona Buford, Administrative Assistant

Legal Counsel

Barbara Birkicht

PRELIMINARY REVIEWS

A. 2018.1033 1217 MISSOURI AVENUE LAFAYETTE SQUARE HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner: Ian McCormack

Applicant: Killeen Studio Architects – Mike Killeen

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Preliminary review to construct a two-story rear addition to single family house.

PROCEEDINGS: On September 24, 2018, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider a preliminary review application to construct a two-story rear addition to a single family house at 1217 Missouri Ave, located in the Lafayette Square Historic District. The application was submitted by Mike Killeen of Killeen Studio Architects, the architect for the project.

Board members Richard Callow (Chair), Randy Vines, Melanie Fathman, Tiffany Hamilton, Dave Visintainer, David Richardson, Mike Killeen and Anthony Robinson were present for the testimony for this agenda item. Board member Michael Killeen recused himself from this portion of the hearing.

Jan Cameron of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #69112, which sets forth the standards for new construction in the Lafayette Square Historic District.

Ms. Cameron recommended that the Preservation Board grant preliminary approval to the proposed addition with final details, materials and plans to be reviewed and approved by the Cultural Resources Office.

Mike Killeen, architect for the project, testified on behalf of the project. He stated that the owner wanted a detached garage and that the only way to pull it off was to put it beneath the building. He stated the design came from working with the Cultural Resources office and the Lafayette Square Restoration Committee.

Ms. Suzanne Sessions testified that she felt details were missing from the project. She stated the owner and the developer had not provided the right-of-way from the neighbor whose alley the new development will share nor the certificate that they own the two adjacent properties, and that they should have it before the project goes forward and there's a problem.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- 1217 Missouri Avenue is located in the Lafayette Square Local Historic District,
- the applicant proposes to construct a two-story addition at the rear of the building, which will extend the visible south elevation,
- the addition complies with most of the requirements for additions in Lafayette Square in its massing, ratio of solid to void, proportions, materials and color, and that
- the addition nearly doubles the mass of the existing house; however, its location and the five-foot recess from the main block of the house will create the appearance of a separate rear building and modify its impact.

BOARD DECISION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant preliminary approval to the proposed addition with the

stipulation that the final details, materials and plans to be reviewed and approved by the Cultural Resources Office. Mr. Visintainer seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

B. 2018.1081 1108 DOLMAN STREET LAFAYETTE SQUARE HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner/Applicant: Dolman Street Townhouses LLC – Jason Ermold

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Preliminary review to construct two semi-detached single-family townhouses.

PROCEEDINGS: On September 24, 2018, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider a preliminary review application to construct a two-story rear addition to a single family house at 1108 Dolman Street, located in the Lafayette Square Historic District. The application was submitted by the owner Jason Ermold.

Board members Richard Callow (Chair), Randy Vines, Melanie Fathman, Tiffany Hamilton, Dave Visintainer, David Richardson, Mike Killeen and Anthony Robinson were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Jan Cameron of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #69112, which sets forth the standards for new construction in the Lafayette Square Historic District.

Ms. Cameron recommended that the Preservation Board grant preliminary approval to the proposed new construction with the stipulation that details and specifications are submitted to the Cultural Resources Office for review and final plans and exterior materials are approved by the Cultural Resources Office.

She submitted into the record elevations of the project and a letter of support from the Lafayette Square Restoration Committee.

Mr. Jason Ermold, owner of the project testified on his own behalf.

Ms. Suzanne Sessions testified that the Lafayette Square Restoration Committee approved everything that they saw but details for the windows and doors were missing and that they be provided before approval is given.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- the proposed site for construction, 1108 Dolman Street, is located in the Lafayette Square Local Historic District,
- the applicant has proposed a Historic Model Example for the new building which has been approved by the Cultural Resources Office, and that
- the design of the side elevations, which will be completely exposed to street view, have not been submitted. The developer has agreed to comply with all requirements of the Standards.

BOARD DECISION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant preliminary approval to the proposed design, with the stipulation that details and specifications are submitted to the Cultural Resources Office for review and final plans and exterior materials are reviewed and approved by the Cultural Resources Office. The motion was made by Board member David Richardson. Mr. Vines seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

C. 2018.1168 2117 SO. 13TH STREET SOULARD HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner/Applicant: Peggy Gallant and Michael Devereaux

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Preliminary review to construct new driveway and parking pad.

PROCEEDINGS: On September 24, 2018, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider a preliminary review application to construct a driveway and parking pad at 2117 S. 13th Street, located in the Soulard Local Historic District. The application was submitted by Michael Devereaux, the owner of the property.

Board members Richard Callow (Chair), Randy Vines, Melanie Fathman, Tiffany Hamilton, Mike Killeen, David Richardson, Dave Visintainer and Anthony Robinson were present for the testimony

for this agenda item.

Daniel Krasnoff of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #63132, which sets forth the standards for new construction in the Soulard Local Historic District. Mr. Krasnoff noted that the Soulard standards do not explicitly prohibit off street parking within the district. He also showed the Board slides showing the inability of the resident(s) at the property to park in the rear due to the lot configuration. Mr. Krasnoff noted that the location of the property at the edge of the district and the lack of other parking options made this situation unusual, and it was only for those unusual reasons that the Director was in support of the proposal. He also told the Board that the Soulard Restoration Group and Alderman Jack Coatar had voiced opposition to the proposed driveway and parking pad.

Mike Devereaux, owner of the property, spoke in support of the proposal. He said there is a need for off-street parking due to close proximity to bars, restaurants and a big new apartment building.

Commissioner David Richardson asked Mr. Devereaux if he ever lived in the property. He said that although he does not now he did live there for more than 20 years.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- 2117 South 11th Street is located in the Soulard Certified Local Historic District,
- because the property line extends only 3 feet behind the building, there is no opportunity for automobile parking behind the house.,
- the proposal allows the resident of the building to have off-street parking, which is a reality for nearly all residents of the Soulard Historic District, and that
- when properties possess alley access and land behind buildings it is inappropriate to alter the streetscape with driveways and parking pads.

BOARD DECISION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant preliminary approval to allow for the construction of a driveway and parking

pad due to unusual site conditions and subject to final review of details and materials by the Cultural Resources Office.

The motion was made by Board Member Killeen and Ms. Hamilton seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

D. 2018.1169 2108 ANN AVENUE MCKINLEY HEIGHTS HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner/Applicant: Corey Cox

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Replace grass on front façade with artificial turf.

PROCEEDINGS: On September 24, 2018, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider a preliminary review application to install artificial turf on the front lawn of 2108 Ann Avenue, located in the McKinley Heights Local Historic District. The application was submitted by Corey Cox, the owner of the property.

Board members Richard Callow (Chair), Randy Vines, Melanie Fathman, Tiffany Hamilton, Mike Killeen, David Richardson and Anthony Robinson were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Daniel Krasnoff of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #67901, which sets forth the standards for new construction in the McKinley Heights Local Historic District. Mr. Krasnoff noted that while the McKinley Heights standards do not explicitly prohibit artificial turf, it is necessary to consider that when standards are established for historic districts, it is impossible to anticipate every proposal and that he was confident that when these standards were created, no one thought a property owner would propose to replace their organic front yard with synthetic turf material. Mr. Krasnoff quoted the ordinance stating that a purview of the standards was landscaping. He also presented to the Board a letter of opposition to the proposal from the McKinley Heights Neighborhood Association and a resident of the neighborhood.

Commissioner Mike Killeen addressed a question to Commissioner Richardson as to his opinion regarding if the ground material could be regulated under the historic district standards. Commissioner David Richardson agreed with staff that landscaping is regulated under the Historic District Standards.

Corey Cox, who owns the building and resides at 2208 Ann Avenue spoke in favor of the proposal. He identified four reasons why he the synthetic grass was desired. First, he said the synthetic turf was very similar in appearance to a grass lawn. Secondly, he noted that his travel schedule made lawn maintenance difficult. He was not home enough to maintain the lawn himself. Thirdly, he said the cost of maintaining the lawn was high, and that it was a more reasonable expense to make a one-time payment of \$5,500.00 for the synthetic surf as opposed to paying approximately \$17,000.00 over ten years to maintain the lawn. Fourthly, he said that his allergies to grass meant that maintaining the lawn was bad for his health. He also mentioned that the previous owner of the property had the same concern about allergies.

Commissioner Tiffany Hamilton asked if the synthetic turf was similar to a dog matt. Mr. Cox said it was a better material.

Commissioner Anthony Robinson asked if Mr. Cox realized he was in an historic district and that the purpose of a district was to maintain the neighborhood's traditional appearance. Mr. Cox said it is becoming more common to use synthetic turf instead of grass on yards.

Commissioner Robinson asked Mr. Cox if he considered Zoysia grass, which does not allow weeds to grow, and the yard does get some direct sunlight. Mr. Cox replied that he thought the yard was too shaded for Zoysia to grow effectively.

Commissioner Robinson asked Mr. Cox if he agreed that the cost to maintain the yard with Zoysia would be less than he is paying now. Mr. Cox said the grass would exacerbate his allergies.

Commissioner Hamilton asked if he considered other options, and how long he has lived at the property. Mr. Cox said he had asked his lawn maintenance company for options but they suggested the

synthetic turf. He said he bought the house in June but that the previous owner's allergies were also made worse by the grass lawn.

Commissioner Melanie Fathman asked if he realized that the neighbors' grass would impact his allergies. Mr. Cox agreed but said replacing his lawn was all he could do.

Nicholas Wohl spoke in favor of the project. Mr. Wohl, a contractor who was not connected to the proposal for the synthetic turf, said the synthetic turf he has installed is very similar in appearance to natural grass.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- 2108 Ann Avenue is located in the McKinley Heights Local Historic District.
- the owner proposes to remove the grass front lawn and replace it with synthetic turf.
- the use of synthetic turf is inconsistent with the historic appearance of front lawns in the historic district.
- the McKinley Heights ordinance allows for the regulation of landscape materials.
- the McKinley Heights Standards, Section 401 – Site, speaks to the treatment of front yards within the district.

BOARD DECISION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to withhold preliminary approval to replace the grass lawn at 2108 Ann with artificial turf.

The motion was made by Board Member David Richardson. Mr. David Visintainer seconded the motion. The motion passed by 4-votes with Commissioners Fathman, Hamilton, Richardson and Visintainer voting yes Mike Killeen voted no and Commissioner Vines abstained.

NEW APPLICATIONS

| | | | |
|-----------|------------------|----------------------------|---|
| E. | 2018.1140 | #29 KINGSBURY PLACE | Kingsbury/Washington Terrace Landmark CENTRAL WEST END HISTORIC DISTRICT |
|-----------|------------------|----------------------------|---|

Owner/Applicant: Chris and April Freund

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

SEPTEMBER 24, 2018

Page 9 of 13

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Building permit application to retain paint on exterior brick done without a permit.

PROCEEDINGS: On September 24, 2018, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider a New Application to retain paint at the front façade and paint remaining facades at 29 Kingsbury Place, in the Kingsbury-Washington Terrace Landmark District. The application was submitted by the owners, Chris & April Freund.

Board members Richard Callow (Chair), Randy Vines, David Richardson, Tiffany Hamilton, Melanie Fathman, Mike Killeen, David Visintainer and Anthony Robinson were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Jan Cameron of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #56581, which sets forth the standards for exterior alterations in the Kingsbury-Washington Terrace Landmark District. Ms. Cameron stated that the Cultural Resources Office received a complaint that the building was being painted without a permit. Upon inspection, it was confirmed that front façade of the building had been painted. She stated that the paint altered the appearance and architectural character of the building.

April Freund, the owner, testified on behalf of the project. She submitted close-up photos of the building into the record.

Bill Siebert, of the Central West End Association, testified in opposition to the project. He submitted a letter from the Central West End Association, expressing their opposition to the painting of the façade.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- #29 Kingsbury Place is located in the Kingsbury-Washington Terrace Landmark District,
- alterations to the Kingsbury Place elevation were completed without required permit and do not comply with the Kingsbury-Washington Terrace standards,
- the alterations are incompatible with the architectural character of the building, due to the change in color and the masking of important architectural details on the building.

BOARD DECISION: It was the decision of the Preservation Board to deny the building permit application as it does not comply with the Kingsbury-Washington Terrace Landmark District Standards, and that the paint must be removed. The motion was made by Board Member Visintainer. Mr. Robinson seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously.

F. 2018.0947 4104 DeTONTY STREET SHAW HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner/Applicant: Botanical Heights Homes LLC – Matt Moore

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Building permit application to construct single family house with revised design for previously approved construction.

PROCEEDINGS: On September 24, 2018, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider a new building permit application to construct a single family house with a revised design for a previously approved permit at 4104 DeTonty St. in the Shaw Local Historic District. The application was submitted by Josh Smith of UIC Homes.

Board members Richard Callow (Chair), Randy Vines, David Richardson, Tiffany Hamilton, Melanie Fathman, Mike Killeen, David Visintainer and Anthony Robinson were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Jan Cameron of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #59400, which sets forth the standards for new construction in the Shaw Historic District. Ms. Cameron recommended that the Preservation Board grant preliminary approval to the revised design proposed for 4104 DeTonty, subject to review of final documents and materials by the Cultural Resources Office.

She entered into the record the meeting agenda; and the PowerPoint presentation. Ms. Cameron stated that the Botanical Heights Homes project received preliminary approval from the Preservation Board on November 23, 2015. The house will be centered on two parcels originally intended for a two-family building, altering the initial site arrangement presented to the Board. In addition, a design for a single-family had not been included in the original review. As the application constituted a

departure from the Board's approval, it was scheduled for review by the Preservation Board.

There were no questions for the applicant.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- the proposed site for construction, 4104 DeTonty, is located in the Shaw Local Historic District,
- the entire development site incorporates 14 vacant parcels for new construction; an adjacent four-family building to be rehabilitated in the future; and another vacant parcel to the west, incorporating more than three-quarters of the block. The block faces Interstate 44 and therefore the development creates its own context and has little impact upon the Shaw District as a whole,
- the design of the house, while contemporary in detail, has some reference to historic details and materials found within the historic district and the Standards do not prohibit contemporary design,
- while the proposed new construction replicates setback, material, height and proportions of the original proposal, it varies from that in the width of side yards, exposing side elevations to the street, and that
- the developer has extended brick on the east elevation and matched the color of the siding on the remainder of the facades to the brick in order to mitigate any visual subject to review of final documents and materials by the Cultural Resources Office.

BOARD DECISION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant preliminary approval to the revised design proposed for 4104 DeTonty St., subject to review of final documents and materials by the Cultural Resources Office. Ms. Hamilton seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

APPEALS OF DENIALS

G. 2018.1008 2116 SO. 11TH STREET SOULARD HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner/Applicant: Debbie A. Loehr

RESIDENTIAL PLAN:

Appeal of a building permit application to retain three side windows and siding completed without a permit.

PROCEEDINGS:

On September 24, 2018, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider an Appeal of the Cultural Resources Director's Denial of an application to siding and two windows installed without a permit at 2116 S. 11th Street, in the Soulard Neighborhood Local Historic District. The appeal was submitted by Debbie A. Loehr, owner.

Board members Richard Callow (Chair), Melanie Fathman, Randy Vines, David Richardson, David Visintainer, Tiffany Hamilton and Anthony Robinson were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Andrea Gagen of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #63132, which sets forth the standards for exterior alterations in the Soulard Neighborhood Local Historic District. She entered into the record the enabling legislations, Ordinance #57078 as amended by #63132; the meeting agenda; and the PowerPoint presentation. Ms. Gagen stated that the owner was stopped by a building inspector after installing windows and siding without a permit. Upon inspection, it was confirmed that 2 windows and siding on a Semi-Public facade had been replaced.

Ms. Gagen said that vinyl siding was allowed under the historic district standards, although the Dutch lap that was installed would not have been what the Cultural Resources Office would have approved. She said that the windows on the side of the building did not comply with the district Standards and recommended that the Preservation Board deny the appeal.

Debbie A. Loehr, owner of 2116 S. 11th St., the appellant, testified on behalf of the project. She stated her son had paid for the windows and that it was a financial hardship to replace them.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- 2116 S. 11th Street is located in the Soulard Neighborhood Local Historic District,
- alterations to the south side elevation were completed without required permit,
- the vinyl siding generally complies with the historic district standards,
- the two (2) side windows do not meet the Soulard Neighborhood Historic District Standards, and that

- additional evidence of financial hardship is needed to determine the validity of the argument.

BOARD DECISION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to approve the appeal to retain the siding, and to defer a decision on the windows for 30 days to allow the homeowner to supply additional evidence of financial hardship. The motion was made by Board Member Robinson. Mr. Vines seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.