

**CITY OF ST. LOUIS
CULTURAL RESOURCES OFFICE
PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES
SEPTMEBER 28, 2015**

Board Members Present

Richard Callow, Chairman

David Richardson

Anthony Robinson

Mike Killeen

Erin Wright

Alderman Terry Kennedy

Legal Counsel

Barbara Birkicht

Cultural Resources Office Staff Present

Betsy Bradley, Director

Jan Cameron, Preservation Administrator

Andrea Gagen, Preservation Planner

Bob Bettis, Preservation Planner

Adona Buford, Administrative Assistant

PRELIMINARY REVIEWS

A. 2015.1484 4205 MARYLAND/345 WHITTIER CENTRAL WEST END HD

Owners: Felita Middleton and Charles and Regina Bass

Applicant: Metropolitan St. Louis Sewer District

DEMOLITION PLAN: Preliminary review to demolish one house and one commercial building for construction of a pumping station.

PROCEEDINGS: On September 28, 2015, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider a Preliminary Review for a proposal to demolish a house at 4205 Maryland Avenue and a commercial building at 345 Whittier Street to enable the Metropolitan St. Louis Sewer District (MSD) to construct the Gaslight Square Sewer Improvement Project. The properties are located in the Central West End

Historic District and a Preservation Review District in Ward 18.

Board members Richard Callow (Chairman), Alderman Terry Kennedy, David Richardson, Erin Wright, Anthony Robinson, and Mike Killeen were present for the testimony.

Betsy Bradley of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the demolition review criteria sections of Ordinances #69423, the Central West End Historic District Standards, supplemented by the criteria in Ordinance #64689 and #64832. She described the two buildings as Merit buildings in the Central West End historic district but ones without any special architectural character. She also stated that the buildings are at the eastern edge of the historic district and form part of the edge of the district along Whittier that has a varied character and not the strong historic character of most of the district. Ms. Bradley reported that the site for the project had been carefully selected and described in general how the above grade portion of the facility would appear. She recommended preliminary approval of the demolitions for this utility project.

Jerry Jung, representing MSD, reviewed the decision to site the project where it is proposed and the reason why the two parcels with buildings standing on them are needed for the project. Richard Wilburn, engineer for the project from URS, described some of the engineering limitations in site selection and the engineering requirements for the sewage lift station. Both Mr. Jung and Mr. Wilburn answered several questions from Preservation Board members.

James Dwyer, Chair of and representing the Central West End Planning and Development Committee, reported that the committee was in opposition to the demolition of the property at 4205 Maryland Avenue for the project, but did not oppose the demolition of the building at 345 Whittier. Jeff Winzerling, representing the block on which the project is proposed, also expressed opposition to the project, particularly the demolition of the residence at 4205 Maryland. Dana Scott-Person, a member of the Central West End Planning & Development Committee, echoed the opposition of the other speakers and expressed a desire that MSD work with the residents on a plan for the project.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- the Metropolitan St. Louis Sewer District has carefully sited the project based on the need for the project and limitations presented by topography and existing sewer lines;
- the two properties proposed for demolition, 345 Whittier and 4205 Maryland, are Merit properties in the Central West End Historic District; neither property exhibits any special character or exceptional architectural significance called out for consideration in the Central West End historic district standards that address demolition;
- the condition of the buildings is not known to be a reason for demolition. They are considered to be Sound in terms of Ordinance 64689;
- the buildings are located at the eastern edge of the historic district; 4205 Maryland is at the end of a cul-de-sac and 345 Whittier is opposite the Schnucks grocery store;
- the buildings on the west side of Whittier at the edge of the historic district include new construction, a historic building and its parking lot, and the historic buildings in question;
- the impact of the loss of the buildings on a portion of the district that does not have a strong historic character would not introduce a less-cohesive streetscape; rather, it would be part of the varied character at the edge of the district;
- the project area lacks the strong historic context of most of the Central West End Historic District, and is therefore a site for the MSD project that would have the least impact on the historic district, while serving properties in that district;
- the proposed construction would have a presence at the corner of Maryland and Whittier even as most of the pumping station would be below grade and the above-grade portion would be adjacent to the alley;
- the above-grade portion of the facility would be enclosed by a wrought-iron security fence; a paved vehicular access drive and parking pad would be adjacent to it;
- landscaping plans and other elements that might limit the project's visibility have not been developed at this time;

- the demolition review criteria of a redevelopment plan adopted by ordinance, neighborhood effect and reuse potential, commonly-controlled property and accessory structures are not applicable for this review; and
- MSD has not consulted with the Alderman, neighborhood residents and the Central West End Planning & Development Committee as they would wish about the need to use both properties for the project and the design of the project above grade.

BOARD ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to withhold preliminary approval of the demolition of two buildings for the Gaslight Square Sewer Improvement Project as the community was not adequately involved with the planning of the project. The motion was made by Alderman Terry Kennedy , and seconded by Mr. Killeen. The motion passed with five board members voting in favor of it and none opposed.

B. 2015.1497

4066 RUSSELL BLVD.

SHAW HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner/Applicant: LRA - William and Maureen McCuen

COMMERCIAL PLAN:

Preliminary review to construct a one-story commercial building.

PROCEEDINGS:

On September 28, 2015, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider a preliminary review application for the construction of a one-story commercial building at 4066 Russell Avenue, located in the Shaw Certified Local Historic District.

Board members Richard Callow (Chairman), David Richardson, Alderman Terry Kennedy, Anthony Robinson, Erin Wright and Michael Killeen were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Jan Cameron of the Cultural Resources Office discussed the project, testifying that the proposed building would be constructed at the building line along Russell, similar to the historic commercial buildings to the east. She testified that while some elements of the proposed design did not strictly comply with the historic district standards, in Ordinance #59400, the architect had attempted to relate the redesign to the existing historic fabric using a contemporary vocabulary that referenced historic materials and precedent, and the same approach had

received previous Preservation Board approval for the applicant's redesign of the 1960 service station at the rear of the property. Ms. Cameron also stated that while the Shaw historic district standards require all commercial buildings to be at least two stories, the Board had approved other one-story infill buildings in the district, and there were existing one-story buildings adjacent to the project site.

Alderman Steve Conway spoke in support of the project, stating that the neighborhood wished to become more of a walkable community and welcomed the proposed commercial building. He stated that the owners were planning to make a substantial investment in an area that had some problem properties, and the development would greatly benefit the historic district.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- the proposed site for construction, 4066 Russell Boulevard, is located in the Shaw Local Historic District;
- the property will be constructed together with the conversion of the service station at the rear of the property, and will display similar design elements and exterior materials.
- the proposed commercial building will continue the vocabulary and material proposed for the renovated structure, which was approved by the Preservation Board in 2014;
- the proposed exterior materials are generally in compliance with the Shaw Historic District Standards;
- the proposed redesign of the building, while thoroughly contemporary, does to some extent reference historic details found within the historic district and the Standards do not prohibit contemporary design that is deemed compatible with historic buildings; and
- the building will return a strong corner presence to the intersection of Russell and Thurman Avenues.

BOARD ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant preliminary approval to the project, with the stipulation that final drawings and exterior material finishes are reviewed and approved by the Cultural Resources Office. The motion was made by Board Member Mike Killeen, which was seconded by Alderman Terry Kennedy. The motion carried with none opposing.

C. 2015.1470 2018 GEYER AVENUE MCKINLEY HEIGHTS HISTORIC DIST

Owner/Applicant: Holy Trinity Serbian Orthodox Church

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Preliminary review to construct two-story townhouses.

PROCEEDINGS: On September 28, 2015, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider a preliminary review application to construct a single family house at 2018 Geyer Avenue, in the McKinley Heights Local Historic District. The application was submitted by the architect on behalf of the owner.

Board members Richard Callow, Alderman Terry Kennedy, David Richardson, Mike Killeen, Erin Wright and Anthony Robinson were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Bob Bettis of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #67901, which sets forth the standards for residential new construction in the McKinley Heights Local Historic District. He testified that the project appeared generally to comply with the standards and recommended that the Board grant preliminary approval to the proposal. He stated that the McKinley Heights neighborhood group was in support of the project.

Nikolas Chkautovich, the architect, was present to speak on behalf of the project.

FINDINGS OF FACTS: The Preservation Board found that:

- the proposed site for construction, 2018 Geyer Avenue, is located in the McKinley Heights Local Historic District;
- the siting, scale, proportions, fenestration, details and exterior materials comply with the Standards; and that
- final material choices have not been made, but the applicant intends to comply with the requirements of the Historic District Standards.

BOARD ACTION: It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant preliminary approval to the project with the condition that the design be developed as proposed and that the Cultural Resources Office review and approve final plans and materials. Board Member Erin Wright made the motion, which was seconded by Board Member

Richardson. The motion passed with four Board Members voting in favor and none opposed.

APPEALS OF DENIALS

D. 2015.1020 3332 N. 19TH STREET HYDE PARK HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner/Applicant: In-Store Credit Buyers, LLC - (CONTINUANCE)

COMMERCIAL PLAN: Appeal of a denial of a building permit to retain façade alterations.

ROCEEDINGS: On September 28, 2015, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider an appeal of the Director's Denial of a building permit application to alter a historic storefront, at 3332 North 19th Street in the Hyde Park Local Historic District. The owner submitted the appeal.

Board members Richard Callow, David Richardson, Mike Killeen, David Visintainer and Anthony Robinson were present for the initial testimony on August 24th, 2015 for this agenda item which was deferred. Richard Callow, Alderman Terry Kennedy, David Richardson, Mike Killeen, and Anthony Robinson were present for the continued hearing on September 30th, 2015.

Bob Bettis of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #57484, which sets forth the standards for commercial rehabilitation in the Hyde Park Local Historic District. He testified that the proposed project is not in compliance with the Standards as the proposed and completed work will conceal the remaining historic detailing and alter the storefront configuration of the building.

Mr. Bettis entered into the record certified copies of Ordinances #64689, as revised by #64925, and #57484; the Board agenda and the PowerPoint presentation for 3332 North 19th Street.

Larry Reed, the owner, testified on his own behalf, stating that he wished to retain the non-compliant façade due to aesthetic and financial reasons. He stated that the building had already been altered and that only a small portion of the exterior was historic

materials and that he selected the dark red color to blend in with adjacent brick buildings. At the continued meeting on September 28th, 2015 the owner submitted letters from Alderman Freeman Bosley Sr. and from 3rd Ward Committeeman Anthony Bell in support of an exception to the Hyde Park Standards to allow the modifications to the storefront.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- 3332 North 19th St is located in the Hyde Park Local Historic District;
- the work was started without a building permit;
- the exterior is now clad in EIFS and is not compliant with the materials requirements in the Hyde Park standards; and
- the owner removed the original brackets and false mansard and covered over glazed brick on the front façade with EIFS.

BOARD ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to overturn the Director's Denial of the building permit citing support from the local elected official. The motion was made by Board Member Mike Killeen , which was seconded by Alderman Kennedy. The motion passed with four Board Members voting in favor.

E. 2015.0841 3971 FLORA PLACE SHAW HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner/Applicant: John and Shannon Grass

RESIDENTIAL PLAN:

Appeal of a denial of a building permit application to retain a retaining wall constructed without a permit.

PROCEEDINGS:

On September 28, 2015, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider an appeal of the Director's Denial of a building permit application to replace a retaining wall, at 3971 Flora Place in the Shaw Neighborhood Local Historic District. The owner submitted the appeal.

Board members Richard Callow, Alderman Terry Kennedy, Erin Wright, Michael Killeen, David Richardson and Anthony Robinson were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Andrea Gagen of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #59400, which sets forth the standards for residential rehabilitation in the Shaw Neighborhood Local Historic District.

She testified that the project was not in compliance with the Standards as the material of the proposed retaining wall is not an approved material and the wall is not completely vertical.

Ms. Gagen entered into the record certified copies of Ordinances #64689, as revised by #64925, and #59400; the Board agenda and the PowerPoint presentation for 3971 Flora Place; and the building permit application.

John Grass, the owner, testified on his own behalf, stating that he wanted to construct the wall with concrete Versa-Lok units as the cost of approved materials were higher and there were other examples of that type of retaining wall in the historic district. Alderman Stephen Conway, 8th Ward, testified in support of the project.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- 3971 Flora Place is located in the Shaw Neighborhood Local Historic District;
- the current railroad tie retaining wall is non-compliant; and
- the proposed concrete Versa-Lok units are not an approved material under the historic district standards.

BOARD ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to overturn the Director's Denial of the building permit due to the prevalence of Versa-Lok retaining walls in the neighborhood; the Board's past approval of similar projects; and the high cost of the alternative materials. The motion was made by Board Member David Richardson, which was seconded by Alderman Kennedy. The motion passed with Board members Kennedy, Wright and Richardson voting in favor of the motion. Mr. Robinson opposed the motion and Mr. Killeen abstained.

F. 2015.1432

4632 MARYLAND AVENUE CENTRAL WEST END HD

Owner: Richard Callison and Paetra Ruddy

Applicant: University Gardens Landscaping, LLC

RESIDENTIAL PLAN:

Appeal of a denial of a building permit application to retain a retaining wall constructed without a permit.

PROCEEDINGS:

On September 28, 2015, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider an appeal of the Director's Denial of a building permit

application to retain a constructed retaining wall at 4632 Maryland Avenue in the Central West End Local Historic District. The owners submitted the appeal.

Board members Richard Callow, David Richardson, Mike Killeen, Erin Wright, Alderman Terry Kennedy and Anthony Robinson were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Bob Bettis of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #69423, which sets forth the standards for residential rehabilitation in the Central West End Local Historic District. He testified that the project was not in compliance as the both the retaining walls and the material are prohibited under the Standards.

Mr. Bettis entered into the record certified copies of Ordinances #64689, as revised by #64925, and #69423; the Board agenda and the PowerPoint presentation for 4632 Maryland Avenue. A letter from the Central West End Association Planning and Development Committee in support of the Director's denial was submitted into the record.

Richard Callison, the owner, testified on his own behalf, stating that he wanted to keep the existing retaining walls. The owner claimed as reasons for requesting an exception to the Central West End Standards financial hardship; aesthetics; safety; and cleanliness and that he was unaware that the historic district requirements included retaining walls.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- 4632 Maryland Avenue is located in the Central West End Local Historic District;
- the owners constructed the retaining walls without a permit;
- the original slope of the front terrace had been altered previously by a non-compliant wood railroad tie wall; and
- the standards require that when a non-compliant wall is removed, the original grade of the property be returned if feasible; and the standards include the option of replacing the retaining wall with more appropriate materials.

BOARD ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to overturn the Director's Denial of the building permit because the historic district standards state if the grade is not returned to the original terrace, replacing a retaining wall with materials considered to be more appropriate is acceptable and the proposed material

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

SEPTEMBER 28, 2015

Page **11** of **11**

complies with that requirement. The motion was made by Board Member David Richardson, which was seconded by Board Alderman Kennedy. The motion passed with four Board Members voting in favor. Board Member Erin Wright left before the end of meeting and did not vote.