

**CITY OF ST. LOUIS  
CULTURAL RESOURCES OFFICE  
PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES  
MARCH 24, 2014**

Board Members Present

Richard Callow, Chairman  
Alderman Craig Schmid  
Anthony Robinson  
David Richardson  
Dave Visintainer  
Nate Johnson  
Mike Killeen  
Erin Wright

Cultural Resources Office Staff Present

Betsy H. Bradley, Director  
Bob Bettis, Preservation Planner  
Andrea Gagen, Preservation Planner  
Jan Cameron, Preservation Administrator  
Adona Buford, Administrative Assistant  
Barbara Birkicht, Legal Counsel

Chairman Richard Callow called the roll. Alderman Craig Schmid moved to approve the minutes, and the current Agenda. Mr. Visintainer seconded the motion, Motion passed. Board member Dave Richardson moved to defer item E. Alderman Schmid seconded the motion. Item E was deferred.

**PRELIMINARY REVIEWS**

**A. 2014.0272 4321 MARYLAND AVENUE CENTRAL WEST END HISTORIC DIST**

---

Owner: Gail M. Carson

Applicant: Jeff Day Associates, LLC – John Wimmer

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Preliminary review to construct a single family dwelling.

PROCEEDINGS: On March 24, 2014, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider a preliminary review application to construct a two

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

MARCH 24, 2014

Page 2 of 8

and one-half story single-family house at 4321 Maryland Avenue in the Central West End Certified Local Historic District.

Board members, Richard Callow (Chairman), Alderman Craig Schmid, David Richardson, Erin Wright, David Visintainer and Michael Killeen were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Jan Cameron of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the Central West End Historic District Ordinance #67175, which sets forth the standards for new residential construction in the local historic district. She reported that the project complied with all historic district standards.

John Wimmer, of Jeff Day Associates, architect of the project, testified on behalf of the Applicant.

**FINDINGS OF FACTS:**

The Preservation Board found that:

- the proposed site for construction, 4321 Maryland Avenue, is located in the Central West End Local Historic District;
- the proposal is to construct a two and one-half story house, with brick front façade and false-half-timbered gable; and
- the project complies with the Central West End Standards for new construction in the historic district.

**BOARD ACTION:**

The Preservation Board granted approval to the preliminary review application with the condition that final drawings and exterior materials be reviewed by the Cultural Resources Office staff. The motion was made by Board member David Visintainer. Alderman Craig Schmid seconded the motion. The motion carried unanimously.

**NEW APPLICATIONS**

**B. 2014.0280 2125 CHEROKEE ST. CHEROKEE LEMP HISTORIC DISTRICT**

---

Owner/Applicant: Robert & Barbara Nelson

**RESIDENTIAL PLAN:**

New building permit application to construct an addition at rear.

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

MARCH 24, 2014

Page 3 of 8

PROCEEDINGS:

On March 24, 2014, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider a New Application to construct a rear addition at 2125 Cherokee located in the Cherokee-Lemp Local Historic District.

Board members, Richard Callow (Chairman), Alderman Craig Schmid, David Richardson, David Visintainer, Nate Johnson, Erin Wright, Michael Killeen and Anthony Robinson were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Andrea Gagen of the Cultural Resources Office testified that the proposed addition was not in compliance with all the Cherokee-Lemp Historic District standards, and provided specific testimony about the architectural detail standards of the district. The owner, Barbara Nelson, testified on her own behalf in support of her application, stating that accessibility is a big issue for her. She submitted into the record a document explaining her position, and presented an alternative design for the addition with a mansard roof. Betty Halloran, a neighbor, and Paul DeHart, architect for the project, also testified in support of the project.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- 2125 Cherokee is located in the Cherokee-Lemp Local Historic District;
- due to the roof slope and accessibility issues the second-story windows of the addition facing Missouri will not be proportionate to those on the main structure;
- the size and proportions of the second-story windows and the 16-foot vehicular door do not meet the Cherokee-Lemp Historic District standards;
- there is no viable way for vehicles to enter the interior of the lot from the alley;
- two 8-foot doors would not easily accommodate an accessible van; and
- the alternate mansard-roof proposal presented by Ms Nelson at the meeting would not be appropriate for an addition to this commercial/residential building.

BOARD ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to approve the building permit application to construct a two-story addition with second-story windows as proposed, and a 16-foot wide garage door due to site conditions and the need to accommodate an accessible van. The motion was made by

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

MARCH 24, 2014

Page 4 of 8

Board Member Killeen. Mr. Richardson seconded the motion.  
The motion passed unanimously with seven members voting.

**C.      2014.0244      5016 ENRIGHT AVE.    MOUNT CABANNE RAYMOND PL - N.R.D**  
**2014.0243      721 N. KINGSHIGHWAY BLVD.**

---

Owner: Morning Star Properties, LLC

Applicant: J & T Associates/James Thomas(demolition) Stock and Associates (construction)

COMMERCIAL PLAN:              New applications for demolition of two buildings prior to the construction of a commercial building

PROCEEDINGS:                    On March 24, 2014, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider two new demolition permit applications to demolish a two and one-half story single-family house at 5016 Enright Avenue and a two-story service station at 721 N. Kingshighway Boulevard, located in a Preservation Review District and in the Mount Cabanne-Raymond Place National Register Historic District.

Board members, Richard Callow (Chairman), Alderman Craig Schmid, David Richardson, Erin Wright, David Visintainer, Michael Killeen, Nate Johnson and Anthony Robinson were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Jan Cameron of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the requirements of Ordinance #64689, as amended by 64925, and 64832, which sets forth the standards for review of demolitions within Preservation Review Districts and National Register Districts. She reported that demolition had commenced on both buildings without the required demolition permits and with no review by the Cultural Resources Office. She also testified to the condition of the buildings prior to demolition, and the significance of each building in relation to the National Register designation, and presented the proposed new building to be constructed on the site.

Doug Bruns, of Stock and Associates, civil engineers for the project, testified in support of the projects and on behalf of the developers.

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

MARCH 24, 2014

Page 5 of 8

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- the proposed partially-demolished buildings, 5016 Enright Avenue and 721 N. Kingshighway Boulevard, were contributing resources to the Mount Cabanne-Raymond Place National Register Historic District;
- demolition of both buildings began without approved permits;
- 5016 Enright Avenue was significant to the historic and architectural fabric of the National Register District, but had suffered a fire and partial collapse prior to initiation of demolition;
- while 721 N. Kingshighway was in sound condition prior to commencement of demolition, and was designated as contributing to the historic district, it was physically detached from the fabric of the district and had only a tenuous connection to the history of the neighborhood;
- the redevelopment proposal is to construct a Family Dollar building, with four sides of brick, that will be sited at the northeast corner of the property at the intersection of Kingshighway and Enright;
- the Family Dollar will sited at the extreme corner of the property away from the historic district, and constructed of brick; it will therefore will have little visual impact upon the resources of the district;
- the streetscape along both sides of Kingshighway is dominated by motor-vehicle-oriented establishments with large parking areas, and the historic context of the district's eastern edge had been greatly compromised; and most of the buildings along Kingshighway were excluded from the boundaries of the National Register designation; and
- the developers have agreed to install a substantial landscape buffer with upper-story trees at the western edge of the property to screen it from the adjacent historic buildings.

BOARD ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant approval of two demolition permit applications for 5016 Enright Avenue and 721 N. Kingshighway, with the condition that no demolition approval be granted by the Cultural

Resources Office staff until an addendum to the Building Permit application that includes the landscape buffer is issued by the Building Division. The motion was made by Board member Mike Killeen. Alderman Craig Schmid seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

## APPEAL OF DENIAL

### **D. 2014.0054 816 ALLEN AVENUE SOULARD HISTORIC DISTRICT**

---

Owner: Archbishop of St. Louis

Applicant: Icon Contracting – Rick Hampp

**RESIDENTIAL PLAN:** Appeal of a denial of a building permit application to replace a window with an exhaust vent.

**PROCEEDINGS:** On March 24, 2014, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider an appeal of the Director's Denial of a building permit application to install louvered vents on street-visible windows at 816 Sidney, in the Soulard Local Historic District. The contractor for the project, Ron Hampp, submitted both the application and the appeal.

Board members, Richard Callow (Chairman), Alderman Craig Schmid, Michael Killeen, David Richardson, David Visintainer, Erin Wright, Nate Johnson, and Anthony Robinson were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Bob Bettis of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the section of City Ordinance #62832, which sets forth the standards for commercial rehabilitation in the Soulard Historic District. He testified that the project was not in compliance with the Standards as the proposal would call for the modification of two sets of paired casement windows and is not based on a Historic Model Example as required by the standards.

Mr. Bettis entered into the record certified copies of Ordinances #64689, as amended by #64925, and #62382; the Board agenda and the PowerPoint presentation for 816 Allen; and the building permit application, including all construction documents.

Ron Hampp, the contractor; Bob Palisch, representing the owner; and Doug Swiney, the operator of the Franklin Room

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

MARCH 24, 2014

Page 7 of 8

testified for the appeal. The applicant stated that the cost of running ventilation through the roof would be cost prohibitive and would end the project. He submitted a letter from the Soulard Restoration Group, indicating that they were in support of the project if certain conditions regarding installation and color are met.

**FINDINGS OF FACTS:**

The Preservation Board found that:

- 816 Allen is located in the Soulard Local Historic District;
- the proposal calls for the removal of two sets of paired casement windows to be replaced by metal exhaust vents;
- the proposed window alterations do not conform to the Soulard Historic District Standards, would be highly visible from the street, and would have a negative effect upon the historic character and appearance of this significant building; and
- the applicant contends that venting the exhaust through the building's flat roof, as is the normal procedure, would be prohibitively expensive.

**BOARD ACTION:**

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to overturn the Director's denial and approve the building permit application with the following conditions: that the intake-air vents are to be located in one pair of third story windows of the front façade and the exhaust vents on the east façade; both sets of vents are to be installed in such a way as to not damage the window frames, allowing for restoration of the windows; that both sets of vents are to be louvered, with louvers in a closed position when not in operation; and that the color of the vent louver assemblies is to closely match the existing paint color of the building's window framing. The motion was made by Board member David Richardson and seconded by Alderman Schmid. The motion passed with six Board Members voting in favor of the motion and none opposing it. Board member Mike Killeen abstained.

**SPECIAL AGENDA ITEMS**

E. Discussion of a Preservation Board Conflict of Interest Policy

BOARD ACTION: Deferred

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

MARCH 24, 2014

Page 8 of 8

F. Discussion of an Initial draft: Preservation Board Preliminary Review Policy

**BOARD ACTION:** Betsy Bradley provided an overview of the Draft Preliminary Review Policy and Procedures for the City of St. Louis Preservation Board. David Richardson made the motion that the Policy be adopted, with the stipulation that the second paragraph under the heading "Possible Preliminary Review: Demolition" be deleted as it caused confusion. Alderman Schmid seconded the motion, which passed with seven members voting in favor.

Chairman Richard Callow moved to adjourn the meeting. Mr. Johnson seconded. Meeting was adjourned.