

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

JULY 23, 2012

Page 1 of 11

**CITY OF ST. LOUIS
CULTURAL RESOURCES OFFICE
PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES
JULY 23, 2012**

Board Members Present

Richard Callow, Chairman
Anthony Robinson
Nathaniel Johnson
David Richardson
David Visintainer
Erin Wright
Antonio French

Cultural Resources Office Staff Present

Betsy H. Bradley, Director
Jan Cameron, Preservation Administrator
Bob Bettis, Preservation Planner
Adona Buford, Administrative Assistant

Board Member David Richardson moved to approve the June 25, 2012 minutes.
David Visintainer seconded the motion. The minutes were approved.

Board Member David Richardson moved to defer item #E to a future meeting date.
Mr. Visintainer seconded the motion. Item E was deferred.

Mr. Richardson then moved to approve the current agenda. Mr. Visintainer seconded the motion. The current Agenda was approved.

PRELIMINARY REVIEWS

A.	2012.1085	6241-51 DELMAR BLVD.	SKINKER-DeBALIVIERE HISTORIC DIST.
	2012.1107	609 EASTGATE AVENUE	NATIONAL REGISTER DISTRICT
	2012.1108	6236 ENRIGHT AVENUE	PRESERVATION REVIEW DISTRICT

Owner/Applicant: Washington University - St. Louis – Rose Windmill

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

JULY 23, 2012

Page 2 of 11

DEMOLITION PLAN: Preliminary review to demolish two (2) existing buildings as part of larger project in St. Louis and University City to construct five (5) new buildings.

PROCEEDINGS: Cultural Resources Office Director Betsy H. Bradley made a PowerPoint presentation of the proposal, including the background of the project and reviewed the criteria to be used to consider a proposed demolition in Preservation Review and Historic Districts.

Ms. Bradley stated that she had received an email indicating Alderman Krewson's support for the project and communication from three persons who were opposed to the proposed demolitions.

Rose Windmiller presented an overview of the Washington University project and Randy Wilmot of William Rawn Associates described the architectural analysis of the contextual buildings in the historic district and the design intent of the proposed new construction.

Ruth Keenoy, representing the Landmarks Association of St. Louis, testified that the organization did not support the demolitions.

FINDINGS OF FACTS: The Preservation Board found that:

- 609-11 Eastgate and 6236 Enright are Merit buildings in the definition of this Ordinance as they are contributing buildings in an existing National Register Historic District;
- the proposed demolition and new construction in the City of St. Louis are part of a larger project, most of which is in University City;
- the Skinker-DeBaliviere Historic District Standards supports the retention and continued use of historic buildings within the district, but also include a Restoration and New Development Plan that acknowledges that some new development might take place on major thoroughfares, such as Delmar, in the district;
- the Skinker-DeBaliviere Historic District Standards do not discourage contemporary design when it is harmonious with the historic, existing structures;

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

JULY 23, 2012

Page 3 of 11

- the criteria in City Ordinance #64832 discourages the demolition of sound, Merit structures but provides additional guidance for the consideration of the effect of proposed demolitions on the neighborhood and its urban design and for the consideration of proposed new construction;
- Washington University's Loop Retail and Student Apartment project would include the development of a large mixed-use building at the corner of Delmar and Eastgate, a portion of which would be in the City of St. Louis;
- the project would also include a residential building at the intersection of Eastgate and Enright, a portion of which also would be in the City of St. Louis;
- the Skinker-DeBaliviere Historic District committee reviewed the proposal and approved it in concept and requests that the demolition of 609-11 Eastgate not take place until the project is ready to move forward and that Washington University continue to consult on the design and proposed materials for the new buildings; and
- that the Cultural Resources Office requests also that consultation continue on the final design of the new buildings in the local historic district.

ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board that the proposed demolitions and new construction would be in accordance with the guidance in the Skinker-DeBaliviere Historic District Standards and meet the criteria for demolition and new construction in City Ordinance #64832, and that the new buildings have been designed to have a contemporary character, yet to be compatible with the buildings in the historic district in terms of setbacks, articulation, rhythm, and overall architectural character as they introduce a larger scale into the Delmar and Parkview Gardens vicinity.

Board Member David Richardson moved to grant Preliminary Approval to the project subject to the applicant working with staff to consult on the design of the new buildings; and that no demolition of 609-11 Eastgate take place until the applicant applies for building permits, beyond site preparation and footings work, for construction

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

JULY 23, 2012

Page 4 of 11

of the new buildings. Mr. Visintainer seconded the motion.
The motion passed unanimously.

APPEALS OF STAFF DENIALS

B. 2012.0798 6300 MINNESOTA AVENUE NATIONAL REGISTER DISTRICT

Owner: St. Louis City Catholic Church Real Estate Corporation

Applicant: Ahrens Contracting Inc.

DEMOLITION PLAN: Appeal of the Director's denial of a demolition permit application to demolish the former SS. Mary and Joseph Parish School.

PROCEEDINGS: Cultural Resources Office Director Betsy H. Bradley made a presentation about the property and reviewed the criteria to be used to consider a proposed demolition in a National Register Historic District and in a Preservation Review District. She reported that she had received two emails expressing opposition to the proposed demolition and submitted copies of the emails into the record. She also submitted Ordinances #64689 and #64832 into the record.

FINDINGS OF FACTS: Representing the Archdiocese, Robert Palisch reviewed the demolition criteria on behalf of the Archdiocese.

Father Ron Hopmeir testified on behalf of St. Stephen Parish describing the attempts that the parish made to maintain the building so that it could be returned to use, and the impact the vacant building has on the remainder of the SS. Mary and Joseph Parish facility.

Sister Mary Ann Nestel testified on the recent investments in the neighborhood and the attempts that had been made to have the school occupied by a charter school program.

Mary Anne Simons, representing the Carondelet Historical Society, expressed support for demolition.

Sister Marion Renkens, Administrator of the Sisters of St. Joseph Motherhouse, testified on the impact the vacant building has on the sisters living in the facility. She entered into the record petitions signed by the residents and a list of crimes that had been observed in the school parking lot.

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

JULY 23, 2012

Page 5 of 11

Michael Allen and Lindsey Derrington of the Preservation Research Office, spoke in opposition to the demolition.

Ruth Keenoy of the Landmarks Association of St. Louis testified in opposition to the demolition.

Karen Bode Baxter, of Missouri Preservation and a consultant, spoke in opposition to the demolition.

Craig Shields, rehab consultant, spoke about the difficulties of selling rehabilitated property across the street from the vacant school.

Alderman Thomas Villa testified in favor of the demolition and requested that the Preservation Board approve demolition of the school.

FINDINGS OF FACTS

The Preservation Board found that:

- the SS. Mary and Joseph Parish School is a contributing building in the Central Carondelet National Register Historic District and is located in a Preservation Review District;
- the former SS. Mary and Joseph Parish School is included in the Chapter 99 Blighting Study and Redevelopment Plan, the *6300 and 6321 Minnesota Ave. Redevelopment Area*, LCRA Plan #1485, which was adopted in June 2010;
- the school, which was closed in 1974, was used briefly during the 1990s;
- the parish was closed and the former church, now a chapel, has been under the stewardship of St. Stephen Protomartyr parish;
- the former SS. Mary and Joseph Parish School, a contributing resource to the National Register district, is considered to be a Merit building;
- in terms of the ordinance definition of soundness, the building is sound;
- the school is the only vacant and vandalized building in the immediate vicinity and the specific site conditions at

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

JULY 23, 2012

Page 6 of 11

the former church complex, with the parking lot at the rear on the edge of a bluff and not visible from any street, make the property an attractive nuisance;

- the Archdiocese, Parish of St. Stephen Protomartyr, and the Carondelet Community Betterment Federation (CCBF) have made attempts to sell the school and place a charter school or residential uses in the building with no success; and
- that the criteria of neighborhood effect, reuse potential, urban design, proposed subsequent construction, commonly controlled property and accessory structures were also considered.

ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to overturn the Director's denial and grant a demolition permit. The Board concluded that economic conditions that would reverse the situation were not likely to occur within another year or two and that the Parish, Archdiocese, and the Carondelet Community Betterment Federation had done all that they could to find a new use and occupant for the school building, including listing it on the National Register to make historic tax credit use possible and the adoption of a Chapter 99 Redevelopment plan. The Board noted that some of the time the school was available for redevelopment was during the heyday of the historic tax credit use in St. Louis and the fact that no project went forward during that time supports the conclusion that it is not economically feasible to rehabilitate this building.

Board Member David Richardson made the motion to approve the demolition. Mr. Visintainer seconded the motion. Board Members David Visintainer, David Richardson and Erin Wright supported the motion while Antonio French and Nate Johnson voted against the motion. Mr. Robinson abstained from voting. The motion passed 3 to 2.

C. 2012.0732 2233 CALIFORNIA AVENUE FOX PARK HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner/Applicant: JoAnn Gill

RESIDENTIAL PLAN:

Appeal of the Director's denial of a building permit application to install two (2) vinyl windows on the front façade of a two-story residence installed without a permit.

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

JULY 23, 2012

Page 7 of 11

PROCEEDINGS: Andrea Gagen presented a PowerPoint presentation and an overview of the project describing the vinyl single-hung windows that had been installed without a permit. Ms Gagen recommended that the Preservation Board uphold the Director's denial as the installed windows do not comply with the requirements of the Fox Park Historic District Standards. She submitted into the record Ordinances #64689 and #66098.

JoAnn Gill, property owner, testified on her own behalf. She stated that she had attempted to obtain historic replacement windows and that she could not afford to replace the non-compliant windows.

FINDINGS OF FACTS: The Preservation Board found that:

- the windows do not meet the Fox Park Historic District Standards;
- the owner had attempted to obtain historic replacement windows but could not afford to replace the non-compliant windows;
- to require the owner to replace the windows would constitute an economic hardship; and
- that no comment regarding the proposal was received from the Ward 7 Alderwoman.

ACTION: It was the decision of the Preservation Board to overturn the Director's denial and grant a variance based on economic hardship. The motion was made by Board Member David Richardson and seconded by Mr. Johnson. The motion passed unanimously.

D. 2012.0813 3730-32 BLAIR AVENUE HYDE PARK HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner/Applicant: Beginnings & Beyond – Dion Robinson

RESIDENTIAL PLANS: Appeal of the Director's denial of an application for a building permit for exterior alterations to a 3-unit residential apartment building.

PROCEEDINGS: Andrea Gagen presented a PowerPoint presentation and an overview of the project. She detailed the many alterations that had been done to the building that did not comply with

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

JULY 23, 2012

Page 8 of 11

the Hyde Park Historic District Standards. Ms. Gagen also submitted into the record Ordinances #64689 and #57484. She recommended that the Preservation Board uphold the staff's denial of the project, as the alterations do not comply with the Hyde Park Historic District standards. Jan Cameron, Preservation Administrator, presented information concerning Building Division citations and Housing Court action for work done on the property.

Lawrence Quarles, architect for the project, testified in support of the project.

Dion Robinson, property owner, testified on his own behalf.

3rd Ward Alderman Freeman Bosley Sr., testified in support of the project.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- exterior alterations had been made to the building without permits;
- many of the alterations do not meet the Hyde Park Historic District standards; and
- that the owner should work with the Cultural Resources Office to resolve these violations.

ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to uphold the Director's denial of the exterior alterations as they did not meet the Hyde Park Historic District standards. The motion was made by Board Member David Visintainer and seconded by Mr. Robinson. The motion passed unanimously.

E.

Deferred to a future meeting.

SPECIAL AGENDA ITEMS

Nominations to the National Register of Historic Places

F. Tillie's Corner - 1349, 1351 & 1353 N. Garrison Avenue

ACTION:

It was decision of the Preservation Board to direct the staff to prepare a report for the Missouri State Historic Preservation Office that Tillie's Corner meets the

requirements of National Register Criterion A in the area of Ethnic Heritage/Black and Commerce.

G. Executive Office Building – 515-17 Olive Street

ACTION: It was decision of the Preservation Board to direct the staff to prepare a report for the Missouri State Historic Preservation Office that the Executive Office Building meets the requirements of National Register Criterion A in the area of Commerce and Criterion C, architecture. The motion was made by Board Member Anthony Robinson and seconded by Mr. Richardson. The motion passed unanimously

H. Central (Yeatman) High School - 3616 N. Garrison Avenue

ACTION: It was decision of the Preservation Board to direct the staff to prepare a report for the Missouri State Historic Preservation Office that the Central (Yeatman) High School meets the registration requirements of the “St. Louis, Missouri Public Schools of William B. Ittner Multiple Property Document, and that the school is eligible for listing in the National Register under Criterion C for Architecture. The motion was made by Board Member Anthony Robinson and seconded by Mr. Richardson. The motion passed unanimously

I. ABC Auto Sales Company Building – 3509-27 Page Boulevard

ACTION: It was decision of the Preservation Board to direct the staff to prepare a report for the Missouri State Historic Preservation Office that the ABC Auto Sales Company Building meets the requirements of National Register Criterion of the “Historic Auto-related Resources of St. Louis Multiple Property Document,” and is also eligible for listing in the National Register under Criterion C for Architecture. The motion was made by Board Member Anthony Robinson and seconded by Mr. Richardson. The motion passed unanimously

J. Municipal Courts Building – 1320 Market Street

ACTION: It was decision of the Preservation Board to direct the staff to prepare a report for the Missouri State Historic Preservation Office that the Municipal Courts Building meets the requirements of National Register Criterion C for

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

JULY 23, 2012

Page 10 of 11

Architecture. The motion was made by Board Member Anthony Robinson and seconded by Mr. Richardson. The motion passed unanimously.

K. St. Francis DeSales Historic District – (Roughly bounded by Nebraska, Victor, Jefferson, Sidney, Texas, Gravois and Pestalozzi Street)

ACTION: It was decision of the Preservation Board to direct the staff to prepare a report for the Missouri State Historic Preservation Office that the St. Francis DeSales Historic District meets the requirements of National Register Criterion A for Ethnic Heritage. The motion was made by Board member David Richardson and seconded by Mr. Robinson. The motion passed unanimously.

L. Forest Park Southeast Historic District Boundary Increase IV

ACTION: It was decision of the Preservation Board to direct the staff to prepare a report for the Missouri State Historic Preservation Office that the Forest Park Southeast Historic District Boundary Increase IV meets the requirements of National Register Criterion C for Architecture. The motion was made by Board Member Anthony Robinson and seconded by Mr. Richardson. The motion passed unanimously.

M. North Broadway Glass & Plow Warehouse District – 2500-16 North Broadway

ACTION: It was decision of the Preservation Board to direct the staff to prepare a report for the Missouri State Historic Preservation Office that the North Broadway Glass & Plow Warehouse District meets the requirements of National Register Criterion A in the area of Commerce and Criterion C for architecture. The motion was made by Board Member Anthony Robinson and seconded by Mr. Richardson. The motion passed unanimously.

N. O'Fallon Park Historic District – (Generally bounded by Newstead, Pope, Florissant, Harris, Algernon, Adelaide, Warne, Green Lea, Fair and Lee Avenues).

ACTION: It was decision of the Preservation Board to direct the staff to prepare a report for the Missouri State Historic Preservation Office that the O'Fallon Park Historic District

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

JULY 23, 2012

Page 11 of 11

meets the requirements of National Register Criterion A for Community Development and Planning. The motion was made by Board member David Richardson and seconded by Mr. Robinson. The motion passed unanimously.

Chairman Richard Callow moved to adjourn the meeting. Hearing no objections, the meeting was adjourned.