

**CITY OF ST. LOUIS
CULTURAL RESOURCES OFFICE
PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES
DECEMBER 1, 2014**

Board Members Present

Richard Callow, Chairman

Mike Killeen

Alderman Craig Schmid

Anthony Robinson

David Visintainer

Melanie Fathman

Erin Wright

Legal Counsel

Barbara Birkicht

Cultural Resources Office Staff Present

Betsy Bradley, Director

Jan Cameron, Preservation Administrator

Andrea Gagen, Preservation Planner

Bob Bettis, Preservation Planner

Adona Buford, Administrative Assistant

Chairman Richard Callow called the roll. Six (6) Board members were in attendance. Mr. Anthony arrived later. Board member David Visintainer moved to approve the October 27, 2014 minutes and the current Agenda. Alderman Schmid seconded the motion which passed.

PRELIMINARY REVIEWS

A. 2014.1567 1901-03 DODIER STREET MURPHY-BLAIR HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner/Applicant: Starlight Missionary Baptist Church

DEMOLITION PLAN: Demolish two-story brick flounder house.

PROCEEDINGS: On December 1, 2014, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider a preliminary review application to demolish the rear flounder building at 1901-03 Dodier/3015 N. 19th, located in the Murphy-Blair National Register Historic District. The Starlight

Missionary Baptist Church, the owner, submitted the application.

Board members Richard Callow (Chairman), Alderman Craig Schmid, Mike Killeen, David Visintainer, Melanie Fathman, Erin Wright and Anthony Robinson were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Betsy Bradley, Director of the Cultural Resources Office, presented images of the building as it appeared in 2009 when demolition was first considered and denied, and images of the building in its current condition. She reviewed the application for preliminary review in light of the demolition review criteria in City Ordinances #64689 and Ordinance #64932. She testified that one letter had been received from the Landmarks Association that opposed the demolition.

Ms. Marian Jones, Chair of the Board of the property owner, Starlight M.B. Church, spoke on behalf of the owner. She described the deterioration of the interior of the structure, the church's confusion at the time of purchase due to address discrepancies, and she requested that the demolition be approved. She provided a letter in support of the demolition from Third Ward Alderman Freeman Bosley, Jr. She stated that economically, the Church would not be able to finance a rehabilitation project. She presented as evidence of the hardship it would cause; a copy of the recent condemnation letter by the Building Division containing all of the building code violations that exist; two bids for stabilizing the building; three months of recent church bank statements and two years of profit and loss statements; as well as photographs of the building's current condition.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- the two-story brick flounder placed at the alley is a Merit building in the Murphy Blair National Register Historic District and that the flounder is one of a relatively small number of remaining vernacular buildings of this type;
- the condition of the flounder includes a limited collapse at the south end, a condition that has existed since 2009, while the other two-thirds of the building appear to be sound; the flounder is partially behind the main building on the property

occupied by the Starlight Missionary Baptist Church and cannot be separated from it on its own lot and sold;

- the church is not in a position to undertake a costly rehabilitation project, for which it has provided two estimates;
- the Church has submitted evidence of limited operating funds and the inability to repair or demolish the building;
- the Third Ward Alderman has requested that the flounder be placed on the City's demolition list; and
- the criteria for proposed subsequent construction, commonly controlled property and accessory structures are not applicable

BOARD ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant preliminary approval of the demolition of the rear building at 1901-03 Dodier/3015 N. 19th based on economic hardship. The motion was made by Board Member Michael Killeen. Mr. Robinson seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

B. 2014.1574 2413 SO. 10TH STREET SOULARD HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner/Applicant: Garret Robinson

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Construct single-family house with a detached garage.

PROCEEDINGS: On December 1, 2014, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider a preliminary review application to construct a single family house with detached garage at 2413 South 10th Street, located in the Soulard Certified Local Historic District.

Board members Richard Callow (Chairman), David Visintainer, Alderman Craig Schmid, Erin Wright, Melanie Fathman and Michael Killeen were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Bob Bettis of the Cultural Resources Office discussed the project, testifying that the proposal is based on an appropriate Model Example and complies with the Soulard standards, and recommended that the Board grant preliminary approval for the new construction with the stipulation that the final plans and design detail will be approved by the Cultural Resources Office.

Garret Robinson, the owner, was present to answer questions from the Board but did not testify.

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

DECEMBER 1, 2014

Page 4 of 10

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- 2413 South 10th Street is located in the Soulard Neighborhood Local Historic District.
- the applicant has provided an appropriate Model Example for the proposed new construction
- the mass, scale proportions, ratio of solid-to-void, façade materials and roof type all comply with the Soulard Historic District Standards.

BOARD ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grants preliminary approval to the project, with the stipulation that final plans and design details be approved by the Cultural Resources Office. The motion was made by Board Member David Visintainer. Alderman Schmid seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

C. 2014.0700 1720 CARROLL STREET LAFAYETTE SQ. HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner/Applicant: Lori Light and Sue Werstak

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Construct single-family house.

PROCEEDINGS: Deferred by Applicant.

D. 2014.1421 4167 McREE AVENUE NORTH I-44 HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner: Botanical Heights Homes

Applicant: UIC – Brent Crittenden

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Construct a single family dwelling.

PROCEEDINGS: On October 27, 2014, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider a preliminary review application to construct a single-family residence at 4167 McRee located in the North I-44 Local Historic District. Botanical Heights Homes, LLC, the owner, submitted the application.

Board members Richard Callow (Chairman), Alderman Craig Schmid, Mike Killeen, David Visintainer, Melanie Fathman, Erin Wright and Anthony Robinson were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Betsy Bradley, Director of the Cultural Resources Office, presented images of a the current proposal, a revised submission of the project consideration of the project considered at the October 24, 2014 Preservation Board meeting, and reviewed the new design in terms of the North I-44 Historic District Standards.

Ms. Bradley provided a letter from the future homeowner requesting approval of the project. She also introduced a letter from the Botanical Heights Neighborhood Association that expressed support of approval of the windows and the use of siding on the front as proposed and a letter from 17th Ward Alderman Roddy that supported these facets of the design if the rest of the standards were met.

Brent Crittenden, representing UIC and Botanical Heights Homes LLC, reviewed recent work in the North I-44 Historic District and described the changes made to the design, which included placing the main façade of the building in alignment with the buildings to the west, the use of more brick on the front façade, and changing the color of most of the siding to a dark gray.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- the proposed site for construction, 4167 McRee, is located in the North I-44 Local Historic District;
- the contemporary design the applicant proposes to construct is a custom multi-story house in a large property with a wide side yard to the east, a condition that makes the east side of the house highly visible; the design will be used only at only this location;
- a dark red brick, the dominant material in the district, is proposed for most of the forward portion of the front façade and the lower story of the east wing and this material and its color comply with the district standards;
- the light green color proposed for the upper portion of the façade does not meet the requirement of the Standards for the use of color: that it unify the area;
- the extent of cement board siding is greater than the standards allow for wood on visible elevations in the district; the change in color of all of the siding not on the façade to a dark gray color makes this deviation from the standards less visibly intrusive;
- the proposed residence meets the standards for height, width and setback;

- the contemporary design of the building does not comply with several other standards for new construction; and
- the single slope roof has not been altered as requested by the Board at the October 24, 2014, but as it is integrated into the design and plan of the residence, is acceptable in this case.

BOARD ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant preliminary approval of the project with the stipulation that the applicant work with the Cultural Resources Office to determine an appropriate color for the siding above the brick on the façade. The motion was made by Board Member Michael Killeen. Ms. Fathman seconded the motion. Board members David Visintainer and Alderman Craig Schmid opposed the motion. The motion passed four to two.

APPEALS OF DIRECTOR'S DENIALS

E. 2014.1477 1021-29 SO. GRAND BLVD. PRESERVATION REVIEW DISTRICT

Owner: MCO Investments LLC – Bill Rainen

Applicant: Gaines Demolition – Charles Gaines

DEMOLITION PLAN:

Appeal of the Director's denial of a building permit application to demolish a two-story industrial building.

PROCEEDINGS.

On December 1, 2014, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider an appeal of the Director's Denial of a demolition permit application for 1021 S. Grand Boulevard. Gaines Demolition submitted the application on behalf of Bill Rainen, MCO Investments LLC.

Board members Richard Callow (Chairman), Alderman Craig Schmid, Mike Killeen, David Visintainer, Melanie Fathman, Erin Wright and Anthony Robinson were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Betsy H. Bradley, Director of the Cultural Resources Office, introduced into the record certified copies of Ordinance #64689, as amended by Ordinance #64925, and Ordinance #64932; her presentation and PowerPoint, the Board's agenda, and letters received from the public. She then made a presentation that examined the requirements of Ordinance 64689, Part X —

Demolition Reviews and Ordinance #64932, which state that for buildings within a Preservation Review District, the Preservation Board shall consider specific criteria when assessing whether a demolition should be approved. Ms. Bradley testified that the building was a Qualifying structure that may be eligible for listing in the National Register of Historic Places as the Missouri Belting Company Building and that it appeared Sound under the definition of the ordinance although showing signs of deferred maintenance. She noted that it was surrounded by property owned by St. Louis University and that the building occupied nearly all of the parcel, factors that should be considered when addressing Neighborhood Effect and Reuse Potential criteria. She noted that the building at 1021 S. Grand and the Pevely Dairy Building at the corner at Grand and Chouteau provide context for each other in a streetscape that has changed significantly during the last few years and that no subsequent new construction is proposed. She stated that there is no redevelopment plan adopted by ordinance for this property and that the criteria for commonly controlled property and accessory structures are not applicable. She reported receiving eight email letters, all of which were against approval of the demolition.

Bill Rainen reviewed the history of his property ownership and the difficulties that he has had in selling or leasing the property and emphasized access issues. He stated that the property had been condemned by the Building Division in May 2014.

Jerry Altman, appearing as a friend of the owner, expressed support for the demolition of the property. Mr. Altman asserted that St. Louis University's plan for the Ambulatory Care facility had reduced interest in 1021 S. Grand as a separate property and that the expense of rehabilitation would not be supported by rental income.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- There is no redevelopment plan adopted by ordinance for this property;
- the 1911 Missouri Belting Company building, designed by Otto Wilhelmi, is considered to be a qualifying building in terms of the Ordinance, one that might be eligible for listing in the National Register of Historic Places;

- the building, though showing damage that should be repaired at the west end of the south wall, and deferred maintenance, is determined to be in Sound condition as defined in the Revised Code of the City of St. Louis;
- Neighborhood effect conditions include the fact that Motard Street, west of Grand, has been truncated vacated with the pavement removed north of LaSalle Street and now serves only the southern portion of the Pevely Dairy complex, which once surrounded the Missouri Belting Co. property;
- the building covers a very high percentage of the parcel and has little street access, as it stands adjacent to the vacated Motard and LaSalle Streets, the Grand Boulevard sidewalk, and the property owned by St. Louis University on the north;
- the applicant did not submit evidence of economic hardship and it is possible that state and/or federal historic tax credits could be used to help finance a building rehabilitation;
- the applicant has not submitted records regarding attempts to sell or lease the building, or estimated costs for the stabilization and/or rehabilitation of the property;
- in terms of urban design, the corner Pevely Building and this building provide context for each other;
- no subsequent construction is proposed and that proposed new construction has justified Preservation Board approvals of other proposed demolitions; and
- the criteria for commonly controlled property and accessory structures are not applicable.

BOARD ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to uphold the Director's denial of the demolition application for 1021 S. Grand Boulevard. The motion was made by Board Member David Visintainer. Anthony Robinson seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously with six members voting.

F. 2014.1404

3330 LEMP AVENUE

BENTON PARK HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner/Applicant: Paradigm Homes LLC – Rich Coulter

RESIDENTIAL PLAN:

Appeal of the Director's denial of a building permit application to replace a slate roof.

PROCEEDINGS:

On November 24, 2014, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider an appeal of the Director's Denial of a building permit application to replace a slate roof at 3330 Lemp Avenue in the Benton Park Local Historic District. The appellant, Rich Coulter of Paradigm Homes LLC, submitted the application and the appeal.

Board members Richard Callow, Alderman Craig Schmid, David Visintainer, Melanie Fathman, Mike Killeen, Erin Wright and Anthony Robinson were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Andrea Gagen of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #67175, which sets forth the standards for residential rehabilitation in the Benton Park Local Historic District. She testified that the project was not in compliance with the Standards as the installed synthetic slate was of a different configuration than the original slate.

Ms. Gagen entered into the record certified copies of Ordinances #64689, as revised by #64925 and #67175; the Board agenda and the PowerPoint presentation for 3330 Lemp; and the building permit application.

Rich Coulter of Paradigm Homes LLC, the appellant, testified on the owners' behalf, stating that although they would rather keep the existing rectangular synthetic slate, they would replace it with the chisel-point synthetic slate if necessary.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- 3330 Lemp Avenue is located in the Benton Park Historic District;
- the current rectangular synthetic slate was installed without a permit;
- the installed rectangular synthetic slate presents a quite different appearance than the chisel-point slate;
- the shape of the slate shingles is a character-defining element of the historic building and changing it was a significant alteration to the building's design; and
- chisel-point synthetic slate available for purchase

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

DECEMBER 1, 2014

Page 10 of 10

BOARD ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to uphold the Director's denial of the building permit application because the installed rectangular synthetic slate does not comply with the Benton Park Historic District Standards. The motion was made by Board Member Melanie Fathman. Ms. Wright seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously with six members voting.

Chairman Callow moved that the meeting be adjourned. Hearing no objection, the meeting was adjourned.