

**CITY OF ST. LOUIS
CULTURAL RESOURCES OFFICE
PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES
JULY 27, 2015**

Board Members Present

Richard Callow, Chairman

Erin Wright

Melanie Fathman

David Richardson

Anthony Robinson

David Visintainer

Legal Counsel

Barbara Birkicht

Cultural Resources Office Staff Present

Betsy Bradley, Director

Jan Cameron, Preservation Administrator

Andrea Gagen, Preservation Planner

Bob Bettis, Preservation Planner

Adona Buford, Administrative Assistant

Board Member Anthony Robinson moved to approve the June 2015 minutes. Ms. Wright seconded the motion. Mr. Richardson moved to accept the current agenda. Hearing no objection, the agenda was accepted.

PUBLIC MEETING

The Flounder Report: Cultural Resources Office Report on the City-wide survey of flounders

Betsy Bradley presented an overview of the results of the survey.

PRELIMINARY REVIEWS

A 2015.1052 5510 PERSHING AVENUE CENTRAL WEST END HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner: Kilimanjaro V. LLC

Applicant: Klitzing Welsch & Associates – Joe Klitzing

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Preliminary review to construct a 165 unit apartment building.

PROCEEDINGS: On July 27, 2015, the Preservation Board of the City of St.

Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider a Preliminary Review of a proposal to construct a seven-story apartment building at 5510 Pershing Avenue, in the Central West End Local Historic District. Joseph Klitzing submitted the application on behalf of Kilamanjaro V LLC.

Board members Richard Callow (Chairman), David Richardson, Melanie Fathman, Erin Wright, Anthony Robinson and David Visintainer were present for the testimony.

Betsy Bradley of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined sections of Ordinance #69423, the revised Rehabilitation and New Construction Standards for the Central West End Historic District. She stated that the property is currently a parking lot. She testified that the proposed building meets the standards for height but would introduce a new scale based on its proposed width and depth. The proposed design complies in materials and fenestration. Ms. Bradley recommended approval of the project at this preliminary stage if the Board found that the scale of the project was compatible with nearby historic buildings in the Central West End Historic District.

Joe Klitzing described the project as having 165 units and parking for more cars than needed for the units to make up for the loss of the parking lot.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- 5510 Pershing Avenue is located in the Central West End Historic District;
- the property, currently used as a parking lot, has a curb cut at the east end;
- the proposed seven-story apartment building, which will have decked parking behind Pershing-facing units on the lower three floors, and four residential floors above, will have 165 units in a pair of hollow square forms;
- the proposed building is contemporary in design with a façade modulated by plane breaks and recessed balconies, changes in materials color, and has a counterpoint of a near center main entrance element and tower with a recessed glazed bay on the four upper floors;
- the proposed building will be quite similar in height to the Branscombe Apartment Building to the east and the presence of that building allows the building, categorized as a high rise

one in the historic district standards, to meet the standards for height. Nevertheless it will be three full stories taller than the flanking historic apartment buildings and most of the nearby historic buildings on both sides of Pershing;

- the project would introduce a new scale of massing to the blockfront with its proposed width and depth, combined with a height taller than most buildings on the block yet is considered to be compatible;
- the building, to be positioned on the terrace that unites the blockfront, will maintain the sidewalk and terrace lawn between the building and the sidewalk;
- the building would maintain the setback line and have projecting and recessed areas of the façade as do other buildings on the blockfront;
- the materials proposed for the building include approximately half of the façade in two shades of brick with the color change related to the modulation of the bays. Cement board panels in two colors are proposed for the upper portions of the building. Accent materials include stone banding, metal balcony railings and aluminum or clad wood windows. Most of these materials are used widely in the district;
- the fenestration both evokes historic patterns and is contemporary in design, and therefore compatible;
- the balconies on the apartment building would be recessed and fronted with railings and comparable to those on other buildings of contemporary design; and
- no accessory buildings or new curb cuts are proposed.

BOARD DECISION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant approval of the Preliminary Review of the proposed new construction, with the condition that final drawings and exterior materials will be submitted to the Cultural Resources Office for review and approval. Board member David Richardson made the motion which was seconded by Board member David Visintainer. The motion passed with all Board members voting in favor of the motion and none opposing it.

B. 2015.1053 2322 SOUTH 12TH STREET SOULARD HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner: Ronald & Joy Christensen

Applicant: Fendler & Associates – Paul Fendler

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Preliminary review to construct an addition and recreate a solarium.

PROCEEDINGS: On July 27, 2015, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider a Preliminary Review of a proposal to construct an addition to the north elevation of the house and demolish a non-historic addition on the south side and recreate a solarium based on historic photographs, as part of a thorough rehabilitation project. Paul Fendler, Fendler & Associates applied on behalf of the owners, Joy and Ronald Christensen.

Board members Richard Callow (Chairman), David Richardson, Melanie Fathman, Erin Wright, Anthony Robinson and David Visintainer were present for the testimony

Betsy Bradley of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined sections of Ordinance #62382, the Soulard Historic District Standards. She noted that the design of the addition was based on that of the main building as the appropriate Model Example for this project. She noted the existence of historic photographs of the solarium, on which the recreation would be based. Ms. Bradley recommended approval of the project.

The applicant and owner were present, but were not called to testify.

FINDINGS OF FACTS: The Preservation Board found that:

- 2322 S. 12th Street is located in the Soulard Historic District;
- the villa type house is an iconic and unusual property in Soulard and exterior changes to it warrant particularly careful consideration. With its spacious grounds and tower rising above the main block of the house it stands out as a visual landmark. The house is, however, a relatively small dwelling. The proposed additions that support its modern use as a single-family dwelling seem reasonable;
- a non-historic brick addition extending from the south side of the house, an element built on the site of a solarium, has deteriorated and has been approved to be demolished;

- the proposed replacement solarium is documented sufficiently in historic photographs to comply with the standards for recreating appendages;
- the proposed addition on the north side of the house is sited, scaled and designed to be a secondary component of the property. The addition takes advantage of the change in grade on the property; although two-stories in height, the addition will appear to be one-story from S. 12th Street;
- due to the change in grade from the sidewalk to the yard, much of the addition would not be visible from the sidewalk in front of the house; more of it would be visible from across the street;
- the all-brick exterior will have a shorter limestone foundation than the main block of the house and a corbeled brick cornice at the parapet that edges its flat roof. Two tall, narrow round-arched windows echo the design of the main block of the house, at a smaller scale. This use of the main building stands as the appropriate Model Example; and
- the design of the proposed addition meets the relevant standards for new construction, as required by the historic district standards.

BOARD DECISION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant approval of the Preliminary Review of the proposed new construction, with the condition that final drawings and exterior materials will be submitted to the Cultural Resources Office for review and approval. Board member Erin Wright made the motion to grant approval, which was seconded by Board member Melanie Fathman. The motion passed with all Board members voting in favor of the motion and none opposing it.

C. 2015.1056 1912 PARK AVENUE LAFAYETTE SQUARE HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner: Brian Simpson

Applicant: Killeen Studio Architects – Sarah Dollar

COMMERCIAL PLAN:

Preliminary review to construct a stairwell to roof and new roof deck.

PROCEEDINGS:

On July 27, 2015, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider a

preliminary review application to construct a roof access stair and deck, in the Lafayette Square Local Historic District. The application was submitted by the architect on behalf of the homeowner.

Board members Richard Callow, (Chairman), Melanie Fathman, David Richardson, David Visintainer, Erin Wright and Anthony Robinson were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Andrea Gagen of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the pertinent sections of City Ordinance #69112, and the revisions to the original design that had been submitted by the developer.

Sarah Dollar of Killeen Studio Architects, the architect, testified on her own behalf. Suzanne Sessions of the Lafayette Square Restoration Committee testified in support of the project.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- the project site, 1912 Park Avenue, is located within the boundaries of the Lafayette Square Historic District;
- the building was constructed in 2008;
- the proposed stair access and roof deck are visible from Vail Place and Park Avenue; and that
- the revisions noted at the meeting have reduced the visibility of the handrail of the roof deck.

BOARD DECISION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant approval of the Preliminary Review of the construction of the stair access and roof deck pending final construction drawings that include the reduction of the handrail height to 36" and the stipulation that materials be submitted to and approved by the Cultural Resources Office. The motion was made by Board Member Visintainer and seconded by Board Member Fathman. The motion passed with none opposed.

NEW APPLICATIONS

D. 2015.1059 1041 SHENANDOAH SOULARD HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner: Christopher and Margaret Schroeder
Applicant: Jay Morris Contracting – Jay Morris

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

JULY 27, 2015

Page 7 of 13

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: New application to install a new curb cut.

PROCEEDINGS: On July 27, 2015, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider new application of a building permit application to install a new curb cut, at 1041 Shenandoah Ave. in the Soulard Local Historic District. The owner submitted the appeal.

Board members Richard Callow, Alderman Melanie Fathman, Erin Wright, David Richardson, David Visintainer and Anthony Robinson were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Bob Bettis of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #62382, which sets forth the standards for residential rehabilitation in the Soulard Local Historic District. He testified that the project was not in compliance with the Standards as vehicle access is only allowed from the alley

Jay Morris, the applicant, was present for the hearing but did not speak.

FINDINGS OF FACTS: The Preservation Board found that:

- 4046-48 Shenandoah Avenue is located in the Soulard Local Historic District;
- the house does not have any alley access and cannot meet the standard for vehicular access from that location only; and that
- the area that will be used as a parking pad was intended as an outdoor patio space.

BOARD DECISION: It was the decision of the Preservation Board to approve the new application for the curb cut as the property does not have alley access. Board Member Richardson made the motion, which was seconded by Board Member Fathman. The motion passed with five Board Members voting in favor and none opposed.

E. 2015.1062 4722 TENNESSEE AVENUE PRESERVATION REVIEW DISTRICT

Owner/Applicant: Miranda Duschack, LLC

DEMOLITION PLAN: New application to demolish a single-family house.

PROCEEDINGS: On July 27, 2015, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis

met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider a new application for the demolition of the house at 4722 Tennessee Avenue. Z & L Wrecking Co., Inc. filed the application on behalf of the owner, Miranda Duschack LLC. The property is in a Preservation Review District in Ward 25 and in the pending Dutchtown South National Register district.

Board members Richard Callow (Chairman), David Richardson, Melanie Fathman, Erin Wright, Anthony Robinson and David Visintainer were present for the testimony.

Betsy Bradley of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the demolition review criteria sections of Ordinance #64832 for Preservation Review Districts. She noted that the Preservation Board had denied demolition of the 19th century wood house in 2008 when New Life Evangelistic Center, Inc. owned the property. She reported consulting with Alderman Shane Cohn and the current owners during the two years that they have owned the property. She noted the continued deterioration of the foundation at the southeast corner of the property and the beginning of structural collapse of the roof.

Miranda Duschack and Karen "Mimo" Davis testified as the owners of the property. The used a short video to introduce their urban farm on which they grow flowers, which is on the property Ms. Davis expressed concern for the active deterioration of the building and the safety of people and pets and fear that the building would collapse and damage the nearby greenhouse that is in use. She is particularly concerned about another winter's snow load on the roof. Miranda Duschack testified that the business does not have \$350,000, an estimate for a rehabilitation project, to invest in the building. She submitted a tax return for the third year of the business to the board in support of her statement.

Alderman Shane Cohn discussed the long history of the attempt to preserve this unusual property. He noted the deterioration of the house that took place under the previous owner's use of the property. He stated that property values in South Dutchtown have remained stagnant and cited some recent sales amounts that were under \$100,000. He stated that with mixed emotions, due the time and effort he's put into this property, he requests a favorable consideration of the demolition permit application.

Ruth Keenoy, representing the Landmarks Association of St. Louis, testified against approval of demolition. She confirmed the Alderman's statement that the property was included on Landmarks' Most Endangered List in 2011. She stated that Ryan Reed had researched the property and determined that the house is the ca. 1873 Frank Ambs farmhouse and the center-hall house type is more rare as a vernacular house type than flounders in St. Louis. She noted that there was no structural engineer's report on the building and encouraged that every effort be made to save the building.

Bill Hart, the Executive Director of Missouri Preservation, noted that the house represented an extremely rare building type in the city and urged, also, that every effort be made to save it from demolition.

Betsy Bradley summarized an email from Michael R. Allen that suggested that efforts be made to move the building and used the relocation of the Anton Schmitt House in Carondelet as an example of such an effort.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- the house at 4722 Tennessee has been considered to be a High Merit property by the Cultural Resources Office in the past as an example of a relatively rare house type, a wood-framed central hall dwelling. It is also considered to be a contributing property in the Dutchtown South Historic District that is pending listing in the National Register;
- the High Merit house, the ca. 1873 Frank Ambs farmhouse, is a relatively rare example of a wood-framed rural vernacular house type built beyond the area of development circa 1880. As such, it represents diversity and change over time in the development of St. Louis;
- the property has been traditionally used for urban agriculture with vegetable and flower cultivation known to be underway during the late 19th Century. The house is one of two historic resources on the parcel, the other being the land that is valued for agricultural purposes;
- the Preservation Board denied demolition of the building in 2008 when it was owned by the New Life Evangelistic Center, Inc.;

- the property, owned by the current owner since 2012, is used for Urban Buds: City Grown Flowers;
- the building has had a damaged southeast corner of its foundation since at least 2008 and now exhibits collapse of the framing in the southeast quadrant of the roof as well;
- the surrounding area of the Dutchtown South neighborhood is occupied and stable and, while not a detriment to the rehabilitation of the property, is an area of modest property values;
- the small house has potential for reuse as a dwelling or other uses in the residential area;
- the property owner has addressed the need for the building to be rehabilitated by acquiring an estimate for a rehabilitation project and considering the entire project cost. A total project cost of over \$350,000 includes a cost of over \$154 per square foot for work on the house. The use of Missouri historic tax credits would contribute an estimate \$75,000 to the project budget;
- a rehabilitation project would likely not be able to use federal historic tax credits as the business does not have the income to offset with tax credits and the project would be too small to syndicate the credits;
- the applicant would have an economic hardship as it would not be economically viable to invest the amount needed for the rehabilitation in an area where property values are too low to support the likelihood of financing and provide any reasonable return on investment;
- the loss of the house at the building line would be a noticeable change in the streetscape. It would expand the flower raising area of Urban Buds, but would not introduce a break in an intact streetscape;
- there are no plans for subsequent construction;
- the applicant owns the adjoining property at 4728 Tennessee, which is also occupied by the Urban Buds business; and
- unusual circumstances that support demolition approval in this instance are the location of the residence in the midst of an urban farm; the high value of a rehabilitation project in consideration of current property values; the business income

information provided by the applicant, and the economic hardship that a rehabilitation would impose on the owner.

BOARD DECISION: It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant approval to the demolition permit application. Board member David Visintainer made the motion to grant approval, which was seconded by Board member Anthony Robinson. The motion passed with four Board Members voting in favor of the motion and Anthony Robinson voting against it.

APPEAL OF DENIALS

F. 2015.0698 2631 RUSSELL BOULEVARD FOX PARK HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner: Rosa Kincaid

Applicant: Mayer Design Group – Matt Mayer

DEMOLITION PLAN: Appeal of a denial of a building permit to construct a carport.

PROCEEDINGS: On July 27, 2015, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider an appeal of the Director's Denial of a building permit application to construct a non-compliant garage-port, at 2631 Russell Blvd. in the Fox Park Local Historic District. The owner submitted the appeal.

Board members Richard Callow, David Richardson, Erin Wright, Melanie Fathman, David Visintainer and Anthony Robinson were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Bob Bettis of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #66098, which sets forth the standards for residential rehabilitation in the Fox Park Neighborhood Local Historic District. He testified that the project was not in compliance with the Standards as the proposed garage-port will not be based on a Model Example and will be highly visible from the street.

Mr. Bettis entered into the record certified copies of Ordinances 64689, as revised by #64925, and #66098; the Board agenda and the PowerPoint presentation for 2631 Russell; and the building permit application.

Rosa Kincaid and James Buchanan, the owners, testified on their own behalf, stating that they wanted to construct the garage-port as submitted due to financial and site reasons.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- 2631 Russell is located in the Fox Park Neighborhood Local Historic District;
- the proposed garage-port design is not based on a Model Example and will not present one of the approved siding materials for a garage on its street-facing side;
- the proposed location for the new garage-port will be situated in a highly street visible side yard and will detract from, and potentially dominate, the main historic house and the historic district streetscape;
- site specific conditions support the construction of the building in the proposed location. However, only an enclosed garage could meet the requirements in the standards for new construction.

BOARD DECISION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to uphold the Director's Denial of the building permit because the installed and proposed doors do not comply with the historic district standards. Board Member Fathman made the motion, which was seconded by Board Member Visintainer. The motion passed with five Board Members voting in favor and none opposed.

SPECIAL AGENDA ITEMS:

Nominations to the National Register of Historic Places

G. Engine House No. 32 – 2000 Washington Ave/503 N. 20th Street

ACTION: It was the decision of the Preservation Board to direct the staff to prepare a report for the Missouri State Historic Preservation Office that the Engine House No. 32 Company meets the requirements for listing on the National Register. The motion was made by Board member David Richardson and seconded by Mr. Robinson. The motion passed unanimously.

H. Grand-Dover Park Historic District - Roughly bounded by Grand, Bates Street alley west of Dewey and alley south of Bowen.

ACTION: It was the decision of the Preservation Board to direct the staff to prepare a report for the Missouri State Historic Preservation Office that the Grand-Dover Park Historic District Company meets

the requirements for listing on the National Register. The motion was made by Board member David Richardson and seconded by Mr. Robinson. The motion passed unanimously.

I.

Philip and Louisa Green Home – 4171 West Belle Avenue

ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to direct the staff to prepare a report for the Missouri State Historic Preservation Office that the Philip and Louisa Green Home Company meets the requirements for listing on the National Register. The motion was made by Board member David Richardson and seconded by Mr. Robinson. The motion passed unanimously.

J.

The Home of the Friendless - 4431 South Broadway

ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to direct the staff to prepare a report for the Missouri State Historic Preservation Office that The Home of the Friendless Company meets the requirements for listing on the National Register. The motion was made by Board member David Richardson and seconded by Mr. Robinson. The motion passed unanimously.