

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

SEPTEMBER 23, 2013

Page 2 of 8

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Appeal of the Director's Denial of a building permit application to retain a non-compliant front porch and porch steps installed without a permit.

PROCEEDINGS: Board members, Richard Callow (Chairman), Alderman Craig Schmid, Melanie Fathman, David Visintainer, Anthony Robinson, Mike Killeen, Erin Wright and Nate Johnson were present for the testimony for this agenda item. Anthony Robinson arrived during the consideration for the item and voted on the matter. Michael Killeen recused himself from this agenda item.

On September 23, 2013, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider an Appeal of the Director's Denial of an application to retain non-compliant porch and porch steps alterations at 2144-2146 Geyer Avenue Avenue, located in the McKinley Heights Local Historic District.

Betsy Bradley, Director of the Cultural Resources Office entered Certified copies of City Ordinances #64689, as amended by Ordinance #64925, and #67901, the McKinley Heights Historic District Standards, into the record. She also submitted an email from Mark Reed, president of the McKinley Heights Neighborhood Association, into the record.

Ms. Bradley explained what work had been done without a permit; which portions of the work could be approved per the district standards; and which elements did not conform with the standards. Ms. Bradley recommended that the Preservation Board uphold the Director's denial of the application as the alterations to the porch wall and porch steps are not in compliance with the McKinley Heights Historic District Standards.

Michael Rasch testified on behalf of the property owner, St. Louis Reconstructing LLC. Mr. Rasch stated that he did not know he needed a permit for the steps. He also explained that he thought the alterations added to the property's "curb appeal" and were necessary for successful conversion of the four-family into two fee-simple units for sale.

Mark Reed, representing the McKinley Heights Neighborhood, noted the general neglected state of this block within the historic

district and recommended a compromise, that the brick porch wall be restored to its original height and that the porch steps be narrowed in width to the historic dimensions, but be allowed to remain brick. Jean Bradley, residing at 2128 Geyer, agreed with Mr. Reed's comments about the block and expressed support for both the brick material and the wider dimensions of the sidewalk and steps.

FINDINGS OF FACT:

The Preservation Board found that:

- 2144-46 Geyer Avenue is located in the McKinley Heights Local Historic District;
- extensive changes were made to the porch, porch steps, private sidewalk, and lower steps without a permit;
- the changes made to the width of the steps and front porch wall have significantly altered the appearance of the entrance to the residential building;
- the McKinley Heights district standards require that steps and porch elements retain their original location and configuration, which includes porch walls and the width of attached steps;
- the applicant proposes to restore the original height of the front wall of the porch and its concrete cap, but would leave a wider opening to accommodate the wider steps;
- brick is not an approved material for porch steps under the historic district standards;
- brick is an approved material for sidewalks and the section heading of the standards implies that it is also approved for on-premise or terrace steps that are not an element of a porch;
- as the standards are ambiguous about the need to retain the historic width of terrace steps and on-premise sidewalks, the wider lower steps and brick sidewalk can be approved; and
- as brick was used for the lower steps and on-premises sidewalk, in this instance, the brick on the porch steps could be acceptable.

BOARD ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to partially uphold the Director's denial of the application to retain the changes made to the porch and porch steps. The Appellant may retain the use of brick at the front steps, but the steps must be reduced to their historic width before their alteration. In conjunction with this

change, the full extent of the front porch wall must be reconstructed to its original height and have a suitable cap. The motion was made by Alderman Craig Schmid and seconded by Mr. Johnson. The motion passed with six Board Members voting for the motion.

C. 2013.1358 5033 WASHINGTON PLACE CENTRAL WEST END HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner: Terry MacHaffie

Applicant: Midwest Lifetime Roof Systems – Cary Babinec

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Appeal of Director’s Denial of a building permit application to install non-complaint roofing.

PROCEEDINGS: Board members, Richard Callow (Chairman), Alderman Craig Schmid, Melanie Fathman, David Visintainer, Anthony Robinson, Mike Killeen, Erin Wright and Nate Johnson were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Bob Bettis of the Cultural Resources Office submitted into the record Certified copies of City Ordinances #64689, as amended by Ordinance #64925, and #64832 and the Central West End Historic District Ordinance, #69423. Mr. Bettis detailed why the proposed roofing material was not in compliance with the Central West End Historic District Standards. He recommended that the Board deny the permit as proposed.

Terry MacHaffie, the owner, testified on her own behalf, asking that she be allowed to install a metal roof that resembles historic red barrel-vault tile. She argued that there is diversity in styles and roof treatments within the Central West End.

FINDINGS OF FACTS: The Preservation Board found that:

- 5033 Washington Place is located in the Central West End Local Historic District;
- the house has had its original roof replaced with asphalt shingles;
- a red tile roof would not be architecturally or historically appropriate for the Classic Revival style of the house and therefore the house originally had a slate roof;
- there is no evidence of the house originally having a clay tile roof;

- the proposed metal roof material does not comply with the historic district standards which state that the character of the roof cannot be altered with a distinctly different material; and
- that the Central West End Neighborhood Association supports upholding the Director's denial of the permit application.

BOARD ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to uphold the Director's denial of the building permit application to install the proposed metal roofing, as the material is not in compliance with the Central West End Historic District Standards. The motion was made by Board Member Erin Wright. Mr. Johnson seconded the motion. The motion passed five to one with Mr. Killeen opposing the motion.

D. 2013.1392 3301 SALENA STREET BENTON PARK HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner: Johnny Hernan Martinez

Applicant: Killeen Studio Architects

COMMERCIAL PLAN:

Appeal of Director's Denial of a building permit application for a non-compliant rear deck and garage and alterations to the storefront.

PROCEEDINGS:

Board members, Richard Callow (Chairman), Alderman Craig Schmid, Melanie Fathman, David Visintainer, Anthony Robinson, Mike Killeen, Erin Wright and Nate Johnson were present for the testimony for this agenda item. Michael Killeen recused himself from this agenda item.

Bob Bettis of the Cultural Resources Office submitted into the record Certified copies of City Ordinances #64689, as amended by Ordinance #64925, and #64832 and the Benton Park Historic District Ordinance, #69423. Mr. Bettis detailed why the three proposed items were not in compliance with the Benton Park Historic District Standards. He recommended that the Preservation Board deny the permit as proposed.

Mike Killeen, the architect for the project, testified on behalf of the owner, asking that the Director's denial be overturned for the three items as the owner feels that they are necessary for a successful project.

The three items of the appeal were discussed separately and addressed with three motions

- FINDINGS OF FACTS: The Preservation Board found that regarding the **storefront**:
- 3301 Salena is located in the Benton Park Local Historic District;
 - the original storefront had been previously altered;
 - the proposed storefront is based on a Model Example;
 - that a portion of the altered storefront will remain blocked with brick presenting a non-historic appearance;
 - the existing fire escape on the front facade will remain and be attached to the non-historic section of storefront; and
 - that there had been no communication from the Benton Park Neighborhood Association regarding the project.

BOARD ACTION: It was the decision of the Preservation Board to overturn the Director's denial of the storefront portion of the application. The motion was made by Board Member Anthony Robinson. Ms. Wright seconded the motion. The motion passed six to zero.

- FINDINGS OF FACTS: The Preservation Board found that regarding the **rear deck**:
- the proposed rear deck is not based on a Model Example and would be visually dominant when seen from Utah Street; and
 - that there had been no communication from the Benton Park Neighborhood Association regarding the project.

BOARD ACTION: It was the decision of the Preservation Board to uphold the Director's denial of the rear deck portion of the application. The motion was made by Board Member Melanie Fathman. Alderman Craig Schmid seconded the motion. The motion passed five to one with Mr. Visintainer opposing the motion.

- FINDINGS OF FACTS: The Preservation Board found that regarding the **garage**:
- the proposed garage is not based on a Model Example;
- the proposed garage is out of scale with the other building on the property and nearby ones in the Benton Park historic district and would be visually dominant when seen from Utah Street; and
 - that there had been no communication from the Benton Park Neighborhood Association regarding the project.

BOARD ACTION: It was the decision of the Preservation Board to uphold the Director's denial of the garage portion of the application. The motion was made by Board Member Melanie Fathman. Alderman

Craig Schmid seconded the motion. The motion passed six to zero.

E. 2013.0842 4970 PERSHING PLACE CENTRAL WEST END HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner/Applicant: Remigius Onwumeri

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Appeal of Director's Denial of a building permit application to retain non-complaint roofing material installed without a permit.

PROCEEDINGS: Bob Bettis of the Cultural Resources Office submitted into the record Certified copies of City Ordinances #64689, as amended by Ordinance #64925, and #64832 and the Central West End Historic District Ordinance, #69423. Mr. Bettis detailed why the installed roofing material was not in compliance with the Central West End Historic District Standards. He recommended that the Preservation Board deny the permit as proposed.

Remigius and Ngozi Onwumere, the owners, testified on their own behalf, asking that they be allowed to retain the asphalt roof as they did not know a permit was needed for roof replacement in Central West End and that their contractor was supposed to obtain all needed permits.

FINDINGS OF FACTS: The Preservation Board found that:

- 4970 Pershing Place is located in the Central West End Local Historic District;
- the roof was replaced without a permit;
- the roof had historic slate shingles for which the standards require photographic evidence be provided of the deteriorated condition of roofing materials to justify replacement;
- the installed material does not comply with the historic district standards which require that historic roofing material be replaced in kind or with a material that replicate the original may be used if the original or historic material is unavailable and the substitute material is approved by the Cultural Resources Office;
- if a permit had been applied for, the roof would likely have been a simulated slate material of a gray color;
- the roof that was installed would have complied with the Central West End standards if historic slate had not been the previous roofing material;

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

SEPTEMBER 23, 2013

Page 8 of 8

- the roof that was installed would likely have been approved before the recent revision of the Central West End Historic District standards;
- the contract for the roof project was signed only two weeks after the revised Central West End standards were enacted by ordinance and therefore the roofing company and owners could have been unaware of the revisions; and
- that the Central West End Neighborhood Association supports upholding the Director's denial of the permit application.

BOARD ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to overturn the Director's denial of the application to retain the existing roofing. The Appellant may retain the dark gray asphalt shingles installed on all sides of the building. The motion was made by Board Member Anthony Robinson. Alderman Craig Schmid seconded the motion. The motion passed with six Board Members voting for the motion.

Aldermen Craig Schmid moved to adjourn the meeting. Board member Anthony Robinson seconded the motion. The meeting was adjourned.