

**CITY OF ST. LOUIS
CULTURAL RESOURCES OFFICE
PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES
APRIL 22, 2013**

Board Members Present

Richard Callow, Chairman

Alderman Craig Schmid

Nate Johnson

Anthony Robinson

Mike Killeen

Erin Wright

Cultural Resources Office Staff Present

Betsy H. Bradley, Director

Bob Bettis, Preservation Planner

Andrea Gagen, Preservation Planner

Adona Buford, Administrative Assistant

The Chairman called the roll. The Board approved the current agenda and the minutes of the March 25, 2013 meeting.

NEW APPLICATIONS

A. 2013.0328 3966 and 3970 SHENANDOAH AVE. SHAW HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner/Applicant: Strategic Properties- Samuel Patterson

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: New application for a building permit to install a fence on adjacent properties.

PROCEEDINGS: Board members Richard Callow (Chairman), Alderman Craig Schmid, Michael Killeen, Nate Johnson, Anthony Robinson and Erin Wright were present for this agenda item.

Andrea Gagen, Preservation Planner, represented the Cultural Resources Office and presented the project in terms of the Shaw Neighborhood Historic District standards. She stated that erecting a 6 foot fence atop a 4 foot retaining wall would create a monumental barrier at the street. She recommended that the Preservation Board

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

APRIL 22, 2013

Page 2 of 6

deny the permit application as the fence did not meet the historic district standards.

Sam Patterson, one of the owners, testified on his own behalf and stated that the wall and fence were proposed to provide security, avoid creating a ledge for loitering and littering, and maximize the usable space of the fenced yard.

Alderman Steven Conway, of the 8th Ward, testified in support of the project, noting how the proposed wall and fence would be consistent with fencing that exists on the east side of Lawrence where the back yards are above grade. He stated that geography and public safety were reasons to approve the fence.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- 3966 and 3970 Shenandoah are located in the Shaw Neighborhood Certified Local Historic District;
- the proposed fence will be placed along two visible facades of the corner property and between the two houses;
- the topography of the street at that location, where rear yards are located above the grade of the sidewalk, warrants a retaining wall and fence; and
- given security concerns at the property, the front and rear fences could be 6 feet in height, and the fence could sit directly atop the retaining wall.

BOARD ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to approve the fence due to the topography and public safety concerns at this particular property. The motion was made by Alderman Schmid. Ms. Wright seconded the motion. The motion passed with five board members voting in favor.

B. 2012.1934 2746 UTAH STREET Deferred per Applicant's request

APPEALS OF DENIALS

C. 2013.0591 3324-26 MISSOURI AVE BENTON PARK HISTORIC DISTRICT

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

APRIL 22, 2013

Page 3 of 6

Owner: 3324 Missouri LLC - Will Liebermann

Applicant: Peter Hammond

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Appeal of the Director's denial of a building permit to construct two (2) two-car garages.

PROCEEDINGS: Board members Richard Callow (Chairman), Alderman Craig Schmid, Michael Killeen, Nate Johnson, Anthony Robinson and Erin Wright were present for this agenda item.

Bob Bettis, representing the Cultural Resource Office, submitted certified copies of Ordinance #64689, #64925 and #67175 into the record, the agenda, and a PowerPoint presentation illustrating the property. He made a presentation that examined the criteria for new garage construction based on a Historic Model Example, and roof top decks in City Ordinances #67175, which set forth the review standards for the proposed new garages and roof top decks in the Benton Park local historic district. He reported that there has been no aldermanic communication for the Board to consider and that the Benton Park Neighborhood Association is in support of the project as submitted

Will Lieberman, the owner, testified on his own behalf, stating the reasons for the design of the garage and suggesting that it be considered to be a raised deck, as that is what it would appear to be from the street.

Peter Hammond, the architect for the project testified on the rationale for the garage as proposed.

FINDINGS OF FACTS: The Board finds that:

- the building is located in the Benton Park Local Historic District;
- the proposed garage with rooftop deck design is not based on a Model Example;
- the upper portion of the proposed garage, approximately three feet, would be visible above the adjacent lawn and from Missouri Ave.;

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

APRIL 22, 2013

Page 4 of 6

- the proposed garage and deck could be screened with fencing and plantings; and
- the Benton Park Neighborhood Association is in support of the project.

BOARD ACTION:

The Preservation Board concluded that the proposed garage with a roof top deck is not in compliance with the Benton Park Local Historic Standards.

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to overturn the Director's Denial of the permit for the construction of the garage with a condition. The motion was made by Board Member Erin Wright to overturn the Director's denial and grant approval with the stipulation that fencing and landscaping be installed on the south side of the building to screen the view of the garage from Missouri Ave. Alderman Craig Schmid seconded the motion. The motion passed with five Board Members voting in favor.

D. 2013.0449 1728 CARROLL ST. LAFAYETTE SQUARE HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner/Applicant: John Muller

COMMERCIAL PLAN:

Appeal of the Director's denial of a building permit application to retain front steps not constructed according to plans.

PROCEEDINGS:

Board members Richard Callow (Chairman), Alderman Craig Schmid, Michael Killeen, Nate Johnson, Anthony Robinson and Erin Wright were present for this agenda item.

Bob Bettis submitted into the record certified copies of Ordinance #64689, #64925 and #69112, the agenda, and a PowerPoint presentation illustrating the property. He made a presentation that examined the criteria for new construction based on a Historic Model Example in City Ordinance #69112, which sets forth the review standards for a proposed new construction the Lafayette Square local historic district. He reported that there has been no aldermanic communication for the Board to consider and that the Lafayette Square Restoration Committee has no official opinion on the steps.

John Muller, the owner, testified on his own behalf, stating the reasons for the decision to construct the steps of

colored exposed aggregate.

Keith Houghton, Vice President of the Lafayette Square Development Committee, testified that committee has no official opinion on the steps, as there was no quorum at the meeting at which the steps were discussed.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Board found that:

- the building is located in the Lafayette Square Local Historic District;
- the steps were not built per approved plans;
- the installed steps are constructed out of colored exposed aggregate and are not based on a Historic Model Example and for these reasons do not meet the Lafayette Square District standards; and
- the owner was trying to give each new house on the block a distinctive look.

BOARD ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to uphold the Director's Denial of the permit for the exposed aggregate steps. The Preservation Board concluded that the installed steps are not in compliance with the Lafayette Square Local Historic Standards. The motion was made by Board Member Nate Johnson. Alderman Craig Schmid seconded the motion. The motion passed with five Board Members voting in favor of the motion.

E. 2013.0226 #26 KINGSBURY PLACE Deferred per Applicant's request

SPECIAL AGENDA ITEMS

Nominations to the National Register of Historic Places

National Register of Historic Places Multiple Property Documentation Form

F. Manufacturing and Goods Distribution Resources

ACTION:

The Board members agreed that the Multiple Property Documentation Form: Mid-Twentieth Century Development of Industrial and Manufactured Goods Distribution Facilities and the Central Railroad and Interstate Corridor, 1940-1970 provides contextual and property type information for industrial and goods transport properties during a 30 year period throughout the entire city. It places the industrial and commercial properties that followed the red brick mill buildings in context of the

changing nature of industry, commerce, and goods transport in St. Louis. The document meets the requirements for a document of this type. The motion was made by Board member Anthony Robinson and seconded by Ms. Wright. The motion passed.

G. American Furnace Company – 1300 Hampton Avenue

ACTION: It was the decision of the Preservation Board to direct staff to prepare a report for the Missouri State Historic Preservation Office that American Furnace Company meets the requirements of the National Register Criterion A and C. The motion was made by Board member Anthony Robinson and seconded by Ms. Wright. The motion passed.

H. Alois F. Mulach Service Station – 2232 Thurman Avenue

ACTION: It was the decision of the Preservation Board to direct staff to prepare a report for the Missouri State Historic Preservation Office that Alois F. Mulach Service Station meets the requirements of the National Register Criterion C in the area of Architecture. The motion was made by Board member Anthony Robinson and seconded by Ms. Wright. The motion passed.

I. Bevo Mill Commercial District

ACTION: It was the decision of the Preservation Board to direct staff to prepare a report for the Missouri State Historic Preservation Office that Bevo Mill Commercial Historic District meets the requirements of the National Register Criterion A and C. The motion was made by Alderman Craig Schmid and seconded by Mr. Johnson. The motion passed unanimously.

Chairman Richard Callow moved to adjourn the meeting. Hearing no objection, the meeting was adjourned.