

**CITY OF ST. LOUIS
CULTURAL RESOURCES OFFICE
PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES
December 28, 2020**

Board Members Present

David Richardson – Chairman
Melanie Fathman
Tiffany Hamilton
Mike Killeen
Anthony Robinson
Alderman Jack Coatar

Cultural Resources Office Staff Present

Daniel Krasnoff, Director
Jan Cameron, Preservation Administrator
Andrea Gagen, Preservation Planner
Bethany Moore, Preservation Planner
Deneen Funk, Secretary

Legal Counsel

Barbara Birkicht

In the absence of Chairman Richard Callow, Board Member Killeen made a motion to designate Board Member Richardson to chair the meeting. The motion was seconded by Alderman Jack Coatar. The motion passed unanimously.

Alderman Coatar made a motion to approve the Preservation Board Meeting Minutes dated November 28, 2020. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Fathman. The motion passed unanimously.

PRELIMINARY REVIEWS

A. 2020.1765 22 WESTMORELAND PLACE CENTRAL WEST END HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner: Matt Turner & Marie Behm
Applicant: Fendler & Associates, Inc.

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Construct greenhouse on side yard

PROCEEDINGS: On December 28, 2020, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider a Preliminary Review application to construct a greenhouse in the side yard at 22 Westmoreland Place, located within the boundaries of the Central West End Local Historic District. Board members David Richardson (Acting Chair), Mike Killeen, Alderman Jack Coatar, Tiffany Hamilton, Melanie Fathman, and Anthony Robinson were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Andrea Gagen of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that considered City Ordinance #69423, which sets forth the standards for the Central West End Local Historic District, and in particular the sections that pertain to location and accessory buildings. Ms. Gagen stated that the proposed greenhouse did not comply with the standards for accessory buildings in the historic district. An email from the Central West End was read stating their opposition to the location of the greenhouse.

Mat Turner and Ann Marie Behm, owners of the property, testified on their own behalf. They stated they had explored other location options for the greenhouse, but that the proposed location worked best for them.

FINDINGS OF FACT:

The Preservation Board found that:

- The proposed site for the greenhouse, 22 Westmoreland Pl., is located in the Central West End Local Historic District.
- The proposed greenhouse does not comply with the standards for location of accessory buildings, as it is not behind the back edge of the house.
- Although the material and scale of the greenhouse may meet the historic district standards, the location does not.
- The owners have limited options of where to construct the greenhouse on their property.

BOARD DECISION:

After due consideration and after weighing each piece of evidence and making a determination of the credibility of the witnesses, the Board has decided as to the substance and credibility of the evidence and exhibits.

The Preservation Board gave Preliminary Approval to the greenhouse as presented. Board Member Killeen made the motion, which was seconded by Alderman Coatar. The motion passed unanimously with Board Members Hamilton, Fathman, Richardson, Robinson, and Alderman Coatar, voting in favor.

B. 2020.0944 4220 MARYLAND AVENUE / CENTRAL WEST END HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owners: Jinzan Development LLC

Applicant/Architect: Arno Sandoval

RESIDENTIAL PLAN:

Construct a two-story single-family house.

PROCEEDINGS:

On December 28, 2020, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider a preliminary review request to construct a two-story house on a narrow, vacant site at 4220 Maryland Avenue, in the Central West End District. The application was submitted by the developer and project architect, Arno Sandoval.

Board members David Richardson (Acting Chair); Mike Killeen, Melanie Fathman, Anthony Robinson and Alderman Jack Coatar were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Jan Cameron of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #69423, Revised Rehabilitation and New Construction Standards for Ordinance #56768, the Central West End Historic District, which sets forth the standards for new construction in the Local Historic District. She testified that the project was being reviewed under the Preservation Board's Compatible New Construction Policy and procedures stipulated under that Policy had been completed. She stated that a virtual meeting had been held with the architect and developers; the Cultural Resources Office; James Dwyer of the Central West End Association; and Jeff Winslerling, representative of the block association, and that the current design incorporates a response to the concerns expressed during that meeting. Ms Cameron stated that participants agreed the revisions made the design compatible with the existing neighborhood fabric and complied with the District Standards and the Policy. She recommended that the Board grant preliminary approval to the drawings as submitted at the meeting.

Arno Sandoval, Architect of the project and developer, testified on his own behalf. He outlined the changes made to the initial submission to comply with requirements.

FINDINGS OF FACT:

The Preservation Board finds that:

- 4220 Maryland Avenue is located in the Central West End Local Historic District.
- The Central West End Standards for New Construction require that new buildings replicate the siting, massing, scale, street rhythm and exterior materials of adjacent buildings.

- The proposal conforms to the requirements for Compatible New Construction in a contemporary design.

CONCLUSIONS OF LAW:

After due consideration and after weighing each piece of evidence and making a determination of the credibility of the witnesses, the Board has decided as to the substance and credibility of the evidence and exhibits.

The Preservation Board granted Preliminary Approval to the project as presented, with the stipulation that final design and exterior materials be reviewed and approved by the Cultural Resources Office. The motion was made by Alderman Coatar and seconded by Board Member Fathman and passed unanimously.

C. 2020.1762 2438 McNAIR AVENUE / BENTON PARK HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner: Vince Valenza

Applicant/Architect: Killeen Studio Architects/Cori Hinterser

COMMERCIAL PLAN:

Construct a one-story frame addition to an existing one-story restaurant.

PROCEEDINGS:

On December 28, 2020, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider a preliminary review request to construct an addition to a one-story restaurant at 2438 McNair Avenue, in the Benton Park Historic District. The application was submitted by the project architects, Killeen Studio Architects. Mr. Killeen recused himself from discussion and consideration of this item.

Board members David Richardson (Acting Chair); Mike Killeen, Melanie Fathman, Anthony Robinson and Alderman Jack Coatar were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Jan Cameron of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #67175, the Benton Park Historic District, which sets forth the standards for new construction in the Local Historic District. She also testified that she had received a letter of support for the project from the Benton Park Neighborhood Association. Ms Cameron further testified that, although several historic pavilion structures had been submitted as Model Examples, the design of the addition did not clearly follow any of them and therefore did not comply with the Benton Park

Standards for additions. She recommended that the Board withhold preliminary approval at this time until the design could be revised to more closely reflect a Model Example.

Cori Hinterser of Killeen Studio Architects, made a presentation that explained the owner's need for an addition and his desire for its design to conform to the existing vocabulary of the existing building. She displayed a photo of the Schneider pavilion, which once existed near Lafayette Square, as a Model Example for the concept of the structure.

Mike Killeen of Killeen Studio Architects, also testified on behalf of the project. He stated that it had been a challenging design problem and that although there was no specific Model Example, the idea of open beer gardens such as this would be was common historically in St. Louis.

Alderman Dan Guenther testified in support of the project. He said the neighborhood fully supported the business owner, who was a wonderful neighbor and the restaurants were an asset to Benton Park. He said the neighborhood group had reviewed the plans and asked for a few changes that had been made.

Dan Morgan, President of the Benton Park Neighborhood Association, testified in support of the project. He said the group had asked that the owner consult surrounding neighbors and changes were made to the original design to address their concerns; now they were in full support.

FINDINGS OF FACT:

The Preservation Board finds that:

- 2438 McNair is located in the Benton Park Local Historic District.
- While no Model Example has been submitted, the necessity of the addition is clear.
- While the proposal does not comply with all requirements of the Benton Park Standards for new construction, but the design has been developed to continue the proportions and detailing of the existing storefront.
- The neighborhood and Alderman are fully in support of the project

CONCLUSIONS OF LAW:

After due consideration and after weighing each piece of evidence and making a determination of the credibility of the witnesses,

the Board has decided as to the substance and credibility of the evidence and exhibits.

The Preservation Board granted Preliminary Approval to the project, with the stipulation that final design details and exterior materials be approved by the Cultural Resources Office. The motion was made by Acting Chair Richardson and seconded by Alderman Coatar and passed unanimously.

Director Krasnoff presented a Director's Report.

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned by general consent.