

CITY OF ST. LOUIS
CULTURAL RESOURCES OFFICE
PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES
JULY 25, 2022

Board Members Present:

Richard Callow – Chairman
Michael Allen
Alderman Jack Coatar
Tiffany Hamilton
Mike Killeen
David Richardson
Anthony Robinson

Cultural Resources Office Staff present:

Meg Lousteau, Director
Jan Cameron, Preservation Administrator
Andrea Gagen, Preservation Planner
Robert Bettis, Preservation Planner
Deneen Funk, Administrative Assistant

Legal Counsel

Barbara Birkicht

Chair Callow called roll at 4:08 p.m. Present were Chair Callow, Board Members Anthony Robinson, Mike Killeen, Tiffany Hamilton, David Richardson, Michael Allen, and Alderman Jack Coatar.

After a clarification as to an applicant name in the May minutes from Director Lousteau, Board Member Killeen moved to approve the minutes as corrected for the May and June Preservation Board meetings. Board Member Allen seconded. There were no objections. The minutes were approved unanimously.

PRELIMINARY REVIEWS

A. 2351-53 Virginia Street—Tower Grove East Local Historic District

Date: July 25, 2022
Address: 2351-53 Virginia Street
Item: Preliminary Review to renovate a 1-story, 2-family building into two fee-simple townhouses
Jurisdiction: Tower Grove East Local Historic District
Neighborhood: Tower Grove East
Ward: Old Ward 6/New Ward 7
Owner: Cody Andel – Andel Property Co., LLC
Applicant: Rhonda Loggia – ReDesign Architecture Group Architect
CRO Staff: Bob Bettis

PROCEEDINGS

On July 25, 2022, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider a preliminary review to renovate a 1-story, 2-family building into two fee-simple townhouses at 2351-2353 Virginia Avenue, in the Tower Grove East Local Historic District. Board Members Richard Callow (Chair), Mike Killeen, David Richardson, Michael Allen, Tiffany Hamilton, Alderman Jack Coatar, and Anthony Robinson were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Bob Bettis of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that considered City Ordinance #70938, which sets forth the standards for the Tower Grove East Historic District, and particularly the sections that pertain to new additions to existing buildings.

Mr. Bettis explained that the item was being brought before the Preservation Board for as it is a large-scale addition to an existing building in the Tower Grove East Local Historic District. He stated that the project generally complied with the standards set forth in the Tower Grove East historic district ordinance and that the applicants have been very willing to work with the Cultural Resources Office staff to refine the design. Mr. Bettis further stated that the neighborhood group is in full support of the project. Mr. Bettis said that staff is satisfied with the design and recommended the Preservation Board grant preliminary approval.

Board Member Killeen asked if there was anyone present to speak for or against the item. Director Lousteau stated that there was not. Hearing that there was no opposition to the item, Mr. Killeen moved to approve the item as recommended by staff.

Chair Callow asked if there was a second to the motion and Board Member Richardson made the second. There was no discussion. All members voted for the motion with the Chair abstaining.

FINDINGS OF FACT

- 2351-2353 Virginia Avenue is located in the Tower Grove East Local Historic District.
- The project will take a non-contributing building and renovate it as two 2-story, fee-simple townhouses of contemporary design.
- The proposed design complies with the Tower Grove East District standards for new construction.
- The Tower Grove East Neighborhood Group has indicated its support for the project.
- No comments concerning the project have been received from the Alderman.

CONCLUSIONS OF LAW

After due consideration and after weighing each piece of evidence and making a determination of the credibility of the witnesses, the Board made a determination as to the substance and credibility of the evidence and exhibits.

The Preservation Board moved to grant Preliminary Approval for the renovation and addition to the duplex at 2351-53 Virginia with the condition that final plans and materials be reviewed and approved by the Cultural Resources Office.

The motion was made by Board Member Killeen and seconded by Board Member Richardson. The motion passed 6-0, with Alderman Coatar and Board Members Killeen, Hamilton, Allen, Richardson and Robinson in favor of the motion. Chairman Callow abstained.

By Order of the Preservation Board
Cultural Resources Office

B. 2308 Menard Street—Soulard Local & National Register Historic District

Date: July 25, 2022
Address: 2308 Menard Street
Item: Preliminary Review to construct a single-family house on a vacant lot
Jurisdiction: Soulard Local & National Register Historic District
Neighborhood: Soulard
Ward: Old Ward 7/New Ward 8
Owner: Julie Hanson
Applicant: Jason Plough – Gateway Architecture, Architect
CRO Staff: Bob Bettis

PROCEEDINGS

On July 25, 2022, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider a preliminary review to construct a single-family house at 2308 Menard Street, in the Soulard Local Historic District. Board Members Richard Callow (Chair), Mike Killeen, David Richardson, Michael Allen, Tiffany Hamilton, Alderman Jack Coatar, and Anthony Robinson were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Bob Bettis of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that considered City Ordinance #62382, which sets forth the standards for Soulard Local Historic District, and particularly the sections that pertain to new construction.

Mr. Bettis provided an overview of the context of the block and the adjacent built environment. Mr. Bettis then discussed the current proposal in detail. He stated that he had been working with the applicant to refine the design to more closely adhere to the Soulard standards. He stated that the Soulard Restoration Group (SRG) had several points they wanted the Board to consider, but overall were supportive of the project. He mentioned that the correspondence from the SRG had been sent to the Board prior to the meeting.

Board Member Allen asked staff what the material for the front foundation would be. Mr. Bettis stated that it would be poured concrete that resembles the neighboring new construction.

Mr. Killeen wanted to be sure that the front door would be appropriate. Mr. Bettis stated that the final approved plans would have the correct kind of door. Additionally, Mr. Killeen asked for clarification on the use of siding on the rear as the Soulard Restoration Group was requesting a cementitious product instead of the proposed vinyl. Mr. Bettis replied that the current standards for new construction allow for vinyl on the sides and rear of the building. However, the Soulard Restoration Group, currently in the process of revising their code, would prefer a Hardie Board-like product. Mr. Killeen also wanted assurances that the front door would be recessed; Mr. Bettis confirmed that the staff would ensure that the door details were correct. Mr. Killeen asked if arched windows would be part of the final product and Mr. Bettis confirmed that was what was shown on the current plans.

Chair Callow asked Director Lousteau if there was anyone present or signed up to speak. She stated that there was not. Chair Callow asked if the applicant was present. Mr. Bettis stated that both the owner, Julie Hanson, and the architect, Jason Plough, were in attendance. Mr. Killen asked the owner if she was willing to not use vinyl on the rear, and she replied that she would be willing to use a different material.

Chair Callow asked if anyone wished to make a motion. Alderman Coatar made a motion to approve the project subject to the condition that the rear and sides of the building not use vinyl per the request of the neighborhood and that the Cultural Resources Office review the final plans, exterior material and colors. Chair Callow asked for a second to the motion which was made by Board Member Allen. The motion passed with six in favor and the Chair abstaining.

FINDINGS OF FACT

- 2308 Menard Street is located in the Soulard Neighborhood Local Historic District.
- The architect has submitted an appropriate Model Example located at 2352 S. 12th Street and staff is generally supportive of the design as submitted.
- The Soulard Restoration Group has not formally commented on the current proposal.
- The proposed building complies with the Soulard Historic District standards.

CONCLUSIONS OF LAW

After due consideration and after weighing each piece of evidence and making a determination of the credibility of the witnesses, the Board made a determination as to the substance and credibility of the evidence and exhibits.

The motion was made by Alderman Coatar to approve the project subject to the condition that the rear and sides of the building not use vinyl per the request of the neighborhood and that Cultural Resources Office review the final plans, exterior material and colors. The motion was and seconded by Board Member Allen. The motion passed 6-0, with Alderman Coatar and Board Members Killeen, Hamilton, Allen, Richardson and Robinson in favor of the motion. Chairman Callow abstained.

By Order of the Preservation Board
Cultural Resources Office

APPEALS OF STAFF DENIALS

C. 2300 LaSalle Street—Lafayette Square Local & National Register Historic District

Date: July 25, 2022
Address: 2300 LaSalle Street
Item: Appeal of an Administrative Denial to construct a multi-family building
Jurisdiction: Lafayette Square Local & National Register Historic District
Neighborhood: Lafayette Square
Ward: Old Ward 6/New Ward 8
Owner: LIA LLC & Mike Schrand
Applicant: A. J. Adewunmi
CRO Staff: Jan Cameron & Bob Bettis

PROCEEDINGS

On July 25, 2022, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider an appeal of an Administrative Denial to construct a multi-family building at 2300 LaSalle Street, in the Lafayette Square Local Historic District. The Administrative Denial was due to time constraints. Board Members Richard Callow (Chair), Mike Killeen, David Richardson, Michael Allen, Tiffany Hamilton, Alderman Jack Coatar, and Anthony Robinson were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Bob Bettis of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that considered City Ordinance #70926, which sets forth the standards for the Lafayette Square Historic District, and particularly the sections that pertain to the new construction of residential, commercial & mixed-use buildings in portions of the Lafayette Square Local Historic District that have historic context.

Mr. Bettis testified that a project at this location was originally reviewed by the Preservation Board in April of 2019, when it received Preliminary Approval. He stated that the design at that time was based on the industrial warehouse context of the area. In May of 2022, CRO received a building permit application with a slightly different design. Given the new design and the length of time that had passed since the original proposal was approved, the Cultural Resources Office staff was bringing the project back to the Board for review.

Mr. Bettis stated that, overall, the design met the standards but deviated in two ways: inappropriate finish of the sidewalks, and lack of required parking lot landscaping. In addition to addressing these two relatively

minor issues, he said the Cultural Resources Office staff would also like assurances regarding the protection of the small German stone house on the adjacent property during construction and into the future. The proposed parking lot, he stated, would be within a few feet of the house and staff was asking for clarifications and plans to ensure its stability.

Mr. Bettis stated that the Preservation Committee of the Lafayette Square Restoration Group was in support of the project. He recommended that the Preservation Board overturn the Administrative Denial to construct a multi-family residence with the condition that final details regarding exterior materials, sidewalk finish, landscaping and the protection of the adjacent stone house be completed in coordination with Cultural Resources Office staff. Chair Callow asked for clarification if the motion was to overturn the Administrative Denial and to grant preliminary approval of the proposed design. Mr. Bettis confirmed that was the case, and asked the Board to include in any motion assurances for protection of the stone house.

Chair Callow asked if there were any questions of staff. Mr. Killeen asked what the other material besides brick would be used for the exterior. The applicant, AJ Adewunmi, came forward to state that the material would be a cement board siding and that the balconies would wood and metal. The windows would aluminum which is allowed per the Lafayette Square Standards.

Board Attorney Barbara Birkicht asked for clarification as to who was speaking on behalf of the item. AJ Adewunmi and Leonard Adewunmi stated that they were both present to provide information. Both were sworn in.

In response to a question from Mr. Allen regarding the color of the cementitious panels, the applicant said that they would match the color of the adjacent brick.

FINDINGS OF FACT

- 2300 LaSalle Street is located in the Lafayette Square Local Historic District, in the area denoted as Residential, Commercial & Mixed-Use New Construction with Historic Context.
- The project requires that an Historic Model Example be used as a basis for the design, but does not require replication of a historic building.
- The proposed design appears to comply with all relevant standards of the ordinance with the exception of sidewalk finish and parking lot landscaping.
- No material samples have been submitted for review.
- The Lafayette Square Preservation Committee is in support of the revised design.
- The project may have a significant impact upon the adjacent stone house; appropriate steps should be undertaken to protect it from the excavation and construction for the new building.

CONCLUSIONS OF LAW

After due consideration and after weighing each piece of evidence and making a determination of the credibility of the witnesses, the Board made a determination as to the substance and credibility of the evidence and exhibits.

The Preservation Board moved to overturn the director's administrative denial and to grant Preliminary approval of the new construction, with the conditions that final details regarding exterior materials, sidewalk finish, landscaping and for the protection of the adjacent stone house be completed in coordination with Cultural Resources Office staff. The motion was made by Board Member Alderman Hamilton and seconded by Board Member Richardson. The motion passed 6-0, with Board Members

Killeen, Richardson, Allen, Hamilton, Robinson and Alderman Coatar in favor of the motion. Chairman Callow abstained.

By Order of the Preservation Board
Cultural Resources Office

D. 1201 Dolman Street—Lafayette Square Local & National Register Historic District

Date: July 25, 2022
Address: 1201 Dolman Street
Item: Appeal of a Director’s Denial to construct an 8-foot tall fence in a side yard
Jurisdiction: Lafayette Square Local & National Register Historic District
Neighborhood: Lafayette Square
Ward: Old Ward 6/New Ward 8
Owner: Mark Kalk & Mark Lammert
Applicant: Mark Kalk & Mark Lammert
CRO Staff: Jan Cameron & Bob Bettis

PROCEEDINGS

On July 25, 2022, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider an appeal of a Director’s Denial to construct an 8-foot tall fence in a side yard at 1201 Dolman Street, in the Lafayette Square Local Historic District. Board Members Richard Callow (Chair), Mike Killeen, David Richardson, Michael Allen, Tiffany Hamilton, Alderman Jack Coatar, and Anthony Robinson were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Bob Bettis of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that considered City Ordinance #70926 , which sets forth the standards for the Lafayette Square Historic District, and particularly the sections that pertain to privacy fences.

Mr. Bettis stated that the applicants wanted additional privacy in their side yard as a newly constructed house to the south is slightly higher than their property. Doors and windows on the new house would look directly into their side yard so they were requesting an 8-foot tall fence. The item was being brought to the Board as an appeal because the Lafayette Square Standards do not allow any privacy fence over 6 feet in height. Mr. Bettis stated that the Preservation Committee of the Lafayette Square Restoration Group was in full support of the project. Mr. Bettis concluded by recommending that the Preservation Board uphold the Director’s Denial of the 8-foot tall fence.

Chair Callow asked if any Members of the Board had any questions. Board Member Allen asked if there was any neighborhood opposition to the proposal. Mr. Bettis stated that there was none. Chair Callow asked if there was anyone else who wished to speak. Director Lousteau stated that only the applicants were present for this agenda item.

Chair Callow then asked if the Board wanted to hear from the appellant. Mr. Killeen stated that they did not and made a motion to overturn the Director’s Denial and allow for the fence to be built as submitted. Alderman Coatar seconded the motion. Chair Callow took a rollcall vote and the item passed 6-0, with the Chair abstaining.

FINDINGS OF FACT

- The Lafayette Square Standards for privacy fences limits the height of any such fence to a maximum 72 inches (6 feet).

- The gate that would parallel Dolman Street, the most visible portion of the structure, would conform to a 6-foot height.
- The remainder of the fence would be only slightly visible.
- The Lafayette Square Restoration Committee is in support of this appeal. The Alderwoman has not commented.

CONCLUSIONS OF LAW

After due consideration and after weighing each piece of evidence and making a determination of the credibility of the witnesses, the Board made a determination as to the substance and credibility of the evidence and exhibits.

The Preservation Board moved to overturn the director’s denial of the 8-foot tall wood privacy fence. The motion was made by Board Member Alderman Killeen and seconded by Alderman Coatar. The motion passed 6-0, with Board Members Killeen, Richardson, Allen, Hamilton, Robinson and Alderman Coatar in favor of the motion. Chairman Callow abstained.

By Order of the Preservation Board
Cultural Resources Office

E. 280-286 DeBaliviere Avenue—Central West End Local & National Register Historic District

Date: July 25, 2022
Address: 280-86 DeBaliviere Avenue
Item: Appeal of the Director’s Denial to paint a mural
Jurisdiction: Central West End Local & National Register Historic District
Neighborhood: DeBaliviere Place
Ward: Old Ward 26/New Ward 10
Owner: Pershing Development Corporation
Applicant: Jonas Manrique
CRO Staff: Bob Bettis

PROCEEDINGS

On July 25, 2022, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider an appeal of the Director’s Denial to paint a mural on the south side of a brick building at 280-286 DeBaliviere Avenue, in the Central West End Local Historic District. Board Members Richard Callow (Chair), Mike Killeen, David Richardson, Michael Allen, Tiffany Hamilton, Alderman Jack Coatar, and Anthony Robinson were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Bob Bettis of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that considered City Ordinance #56768, which sets forth the standards for Central West End Historic District, and particularly the sections that pertain to the painting of masonry.

Mr. Bettis showed photos of the context surrounding 280-286 DeBaliviere Avenue as well as photos of the proposed mural. Mr. Bettis stated that the mural did not meet the strict definition of “art” in the Central West End Design Guidelines. He further stated that The Cultural Resources office staff’s primary concern was the precedent this could set throughout the historic district of painting brick a variety of colors not traditionally found in the architectural color palette of the Central West End. He emphasized that the design of the mural was not in question.

Mr. Bettis recommended that the Preservation Board uphold the Director's Denial of the permit to install a mural on the south side of the building at 280-286 DeBaliviere Avenue as it did not comply with the Central West End Local Historic District Standards. Mr. Bettis stated that no formal comment on the proposal had been received from the Central West End Association or the Alderman. Mr. Bettis also testified that he had spoken with the building owner who said he was in favor of the mural installation.

Chairman Callow asked if there were any questions from the Board. Board Member Hamilton wanted to clarify the definition of the word "art." She felt that it was a slippery slope trying to define and regulate art, and that in terms of the painting of other brick buildings in the future, this was a commercial building and she believed the mural would not have an impact on the residential environment of the Central West End.

Alderman Coatar asked for clarification on the current condition of the wall. Mr. Bettis said that it was painted white.

Board Member Richardson stated that the slippery slope aspect of the proposal simply comes from the fact that the building's brick is currently painted.

Chair Callow asked for the applicant to speak. The applicant and artist, Jonas Manrique, was sworn in. He stated that he thought there should be no concern about the mural encouraging residents painting their houses as there were not artists.

Director Lousteau stated that there were people to speak regarding the item.

Jeff Vines, citizen, was sworn in and spoke in favor of the proposal. He stated that he owns property in the Central West End and feels the mural would be an improvement and that it was attractive.

Randy Vines, citizen, was sworn in and spoke in favor of the proposal. He also stated that he owns property in the Central West End and also feels the mural is an improvement.

Chair Callow concluded the hearing after determining there no further questions or comments from the other Board Members. He requested a motion from Board Member Hamilton, who in turn made a motion to overturn the Director's Denial and allow for the mural to be painted as submitted. Board Member Allen seconded the motion.

FINDINGS OF FACT

- 280-86 DeBaliviere Avenue is located in the Central West End Local Historic District.
- The mural does not qualify as art per the definition of the Central West End Local Historic District Standards.
- The brick wall is currently painted white.
- The proposed mural is in a highly visible location.
- The proposed color palette is not appropriate for the historic architectural character of the neighborhood.
- The Cultural Resources Office has not received an official response from the neighborhood or Alderman.
- The Board interpreted the proposed mural as art, which was therefore not subject to the Central West End standards regarding the appropriateness of colors.

CONCLUSIONS OF LAW

After due consideration and after weighing each piece of evidence and making a determination of the credibility of the witnesses, the Board made a determination as to the substance and credibility of the evidence and exhibits.

The Preservation Board moved to overturn the Director’s Denial of the proposed mural. The motion passed 6-0, with Board Members Callow, Hamilton, Killeen, Allen, Robinson and Alderman Coatar in favor of the motion and Board Member in opposition.

The Preservation Board moved to overturn the Director’s Denial of the proposed mural. The motion passed 6-0, with Board Members Callow, Hamilton, Killeen, Allen, Robinson and Alderman Coatar in favor of the motion.

By Order of the Preservation Board
Cultural Resources Office

F. 6170 Delmar Boulevard Skinker-DeBaliviere Catlin Tract/Parkview Local & National Register Historic District

Date: July 25, 2022
Address: 6170 Delmar Boulevard
Item: Appeal of Director’s Denial to Install an Internally-Lit Wall Sign
Jurisdiction: Skinker DeBaliviere – Catlin Tract
Neighborhood: Skinker/DeBaliviere
Ward: Old Ward 28/New Ward 10
Owner: Aaron Teitelbaum – Kingside Diner
Applicant: Scott Schulty - Engraphix
CRO Staff: Bob Bettis

PROCEEDINGS

On July 25, 2022, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider an appeal of a Director’s Denial to install an internally-lit sign at 6170 Delmar Boulevard, in the Skinker-DeBaliviere Catlin Tract/Parkview Local Historic District. Board Members Richard Callow (Chair), Mike Killeen, Tiffany Hamilton, Alderman Jack Coatar, Michael Allen and Anthony Robinson were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Bob Bettis of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that considered City Ordinance #70281, which sets forth the standards for Skinker-DeBaliviere Catlin Tract/Parkview Historic District, and particularly the sections that pertain to signage.

Mr. Bettis explained the sign was mostly compliant with the sign code for the historic district except that the sign would be internally-lit with neon elements, and the Skinker-DeBaliviere/Catlin Tract/Parkview code only allows for signs to be externally-lit. Mr. Bettis stated that the sign was a quality design and complemented the building and streetscape, but that staff could not approve it as the standards clearly prohibited this method of lighting signs. Mr. Bettis also stated that the neighborhood was in full support of the proposal as submitted. He made a recommendation for the Board to uphold the Director’s Denial as the neighborhood standards only allow for externally-lit signage.

Chair Callow asked if there were any questions for staff. There were none, and he called for the appellant to speak. Aaron Teitelbaum was sworn in and spoke on his own behalf. He asked the Preservation Board to

overturn the staff denial and approve his proposed sign. He stated that it was being moved to the site from another location in the Central West End. The Board had no questions for the appellant.

Randy Vines spoke in favor of the sign. He was sworn in. Mr. Vines stated that he believed the proposed sign would be compatible with other signs along Delmar, and that it would bring character to the building. Chair Callow asked if Mr. Vines heard that the sign was being moved from another location. Mr. Vines agreed that it was.

Director Lousteau stated for the record that the issue in the present case was not the installation of a sign, but the method of lighting the sign.

FINDINGS OF FACT

- 6170 Delmar Boulevard is located in the Skinker-DeBaliviere Local Historic District.
- The proposed design of the sign would be generally compliant with the design guidelines with the exception of its method of illumination.
- The property is located along a stretch of Delmar that has signage utilizing various types of lighting.
- The Skinker-DeBaliviere Design Review Committee is supportive of the design as submitted.

CONCLUSIONS OF LAW

After due consideration and after weighing each piece of evidence and making a determination of the credibility of the witnesses, the Board made a determination as to the substance and credibility of the evidence and exhibits.

The Preservation Board moved to overturn the Director’s Denial of a permit to install one internally-lit wall sign per plans.

The motion was made by Board Member Hamilton and seconded by Alderman Coatar. The motion passed 5-0, with Board Members Allen, Hamilton, Killeen, and Robinson and Alderman Coatar in favor of the motion. Chairman Callow abstained.

By Order of the Preservation Board
Cultural Resources Office

At this point, Board member Robinson left the meeting.

G. 4241 Maryland Avenue Central West End Local & National Register Historic District

Date: July 25, 2022
Address: 4241 Maryland Avenue
Item: Appeal of the Director’s Denial to Construct a Street Visible Rooftop Deck
Jurisdiction: Tower Grove East Local Historic District
Neighborhood: Tower Grove East
Ward: Old Ward 6, New Ward 7
Owner: Rebecca & James Rantanen
Applicant: Tom Niemeier – Space Architects
CRO Staff: Bob Bettis

PROCEEDINGS

On July 25, 2022, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider an appeal of the Director's denial to construct a street visible rooftop deck at 4241 Maryland Avenue, in the Central West End Local Historic District. Board Members Richard Callow (Chair), Mike Killeen, Michael Allen, Tiffany Hamilton, Alderman Jack Coatar, and Anthony Robinson were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Bob Bettis of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that considered City Ordinance #56768, which sets forth the standards for Central West End Historic District, and particularly the sections that pertain to decks.

Mr. Bettis showed photos of the context surrounding 4241 Maryland Avenue as well as drawings of the proposed roof deck. Mr. Bettis stated that the roof deck would be visible year-round given its elevated location and a wide side yard to the west. He showed several photos illustrating that point. Mr. Bettis further testified that the new deck and supports would be placed on top of the parapet, altering its appearance. He also stated that the proposed handrail system is very modern and not compatible with the historic architecture of the building or the neighborhood. Mr. Bettis went on to testify that he had made suggestions for modifications, but, given site-specific issues, the owners wished to proceed with the deck design as submitted.

Chairman Callow asked if there were any questions from the Board. Alderman Coatar asked staff if a change to the handrail could allow the deck to be approved. Mr. Bettis stated that the deck's placement atop the parapet wall was also in conflict with the standards, and therefore not approvable by staff.

Board Member Killeen asked for clarification regarding placement. Board Member Allen asked if the Board or staff had reviewed a similar project elsewhere in the Central West End. Mr. Bettis said he could not think of any that would have been reviewed under the current design guidelines. Alderman Coatar asked if the Preservation Board would be reviewing the project if there were a house immediately adjacent to the subject property. Mr. Bettis stated that in such a case, the Board most likely would not have reviewed it.

Applicant and project architect Tom Niemeier was sworn in and testified on behalf of the project. He stated that the deck was to be placed on top of the parapet walls in order to avoid penetration of the flat roof, which is covered in a spray-on material. Creating intrusions into its surface could cause leaks. Placing the deck atop the parapet walls, he stated, was the most structurally sound method of construction. Regarding the handrails, the applicants preferred a modern aesthetic, as well as the increased visibility through the railing, which would offer a better view.

Chair Callow concluded the hearing after determining that there were no further questions or comments from the other Board Members. Chair Callow asked Board Member Killeen if he had a motion. Mr. Killeen made a motion to overturn the Director's Denial and to approve the deck as submitted. Board Member Hamilton seconded the motion. In discussion, Board Member Killeen stated that he made the motion due to the overwhelming support from the neighborhood.

FINDINGS OF FACT

- 4241 Maryland Avenue is located in the Central West End Local Historic District.
- The proposed deck would be constructed on top of the parapet walls, requiring the removal of the existing coping tiles. The Standards call for existing visible roof elements to be maintained.
- The proposed rooftop deck would be visible from the street.
- The proposed horizontal cable handrail system is not architecturally compatible with the historic architecture of the building.

- The Cultural Resources Office would support a deck that was set back from the west parapet and utilized a simple vertical black metal handrail.
- The neighborhood review committee was in full support of the project as submitted.

CONCLUSIONS OF LAW

After due consideration and after weighing each piece of evidence and making a determination of the credibility of the witnesses, the Board made a determination as to the substance and credibility of the evidence and exhibits.

The Preservation Board moved to overturn the Director's Denial of the proposed deck. The motion passed 4-0, with Board Members Hamilton, Killeen, Allen, and Alderman Coatar in favor of the motion and Chairman Callow abstained.

By Order of the Preservation Board
Cultural Resources Office

Board Member Killeen moved to adjourn the meeting. Alderman Coatar seconded. The meeting adjourned at 5:12 p.m.